National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services Branch

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa, Ontario
K1A 0N4

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Direction des acquisitions et
des services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa (Ontario)
K1A 0N4

Your file Votre référence

Our file Notre référence

NOTICE

The quality of this microform is heavily dependent upon the quality of the original thesis submitted for microfilming. Every effort has been made to ensure the highest quality of reproduction possible.

If pages are missing, contact the university which granted the degree.

Some pages may have indistinct print especially if the original pages were typed with a poor typewriter ribbon or if the university sent us an inferior photocopy.

Reproduction in full or in part of this microform is governed by the Canadian Copyright Act, R.S.C. 1970, c. C-30, and subsequent amendments.

AVIS

La qualité de cette microforme dépend grandement de la qualité de la thèse soumise au microfilmage. Nous avons tout fait pour assurer une qualité supérieure de reproduction.

S'il manque des pages, veuillez communiquer avec l'université qui a conféré le grade.

La qualité d'impression de certaines pages peut laisser à désirer, surtout si les pages originales ont été dactylographiées à l'aide d'un ruban usé ou si l'université nous a fait parvenir une photocopie de qualité inférieure.

La reproduction, même partielle, de cette microforme est soumise à la Loi canadienne sur le droit d'auteur, SRC 1970, c. C-30, et ses amendements subséquents.

Canada

UNIVERSITY OF ALBERTA

KNOWLEDGE TRANSFER AND RECIPROCITY:
A Canadian Theological Education Project in Kenya

BY

BRIAN F. STELCK ©

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

IN

INTERNATIONAL/INTERCULTURAL EDUCATION
DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATIONAL FOUNDATIONS

EDMONTON, ALBERTA

Spring 1994

National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services Branch

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa, Ontario
K1A 0N4

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Direction des acquisitions et
des services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa (Ontario)
K1A 0N4

Your file Votre référence

Our file Notre référence

The author has granted an irrevocable non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of his/her thesis by any means and in any form or format, making this thesis available to interested persons.

L'auteur a accordé une licence irrévocable et non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de sa thèse de quelque manière et sous quelque forme que ce soit pour mettre des exemplaires de cette thèse à la disposition des personnes intéressées.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in his/her thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without his/her permission.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège sa thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

ISBN 0-612-11380-9

Canada

UNIVERSITY OF ALBERTA

RELEASE FORM

NAME OF AUTHOR: Brian Francis Stelck

TITLE OF THESIS: Knowledge Transfer and Reciprocity: A Canadian Theological Education Project in Kenya

DEGREE: Doctor of Philosophy

YEAR THIS DEGREE GRANTED: 1994

Permission is hereby granted to the University of Alberta Library to reproduce copies of this thesis and to lend or sell such copies for private, scholarly or scientific research purposes only.

The author reserves all other publication and other rights in association with the copyright in the thesis, and except as hereinbefore provided neither the theses nor any substantial portion thereof may be printed or otherwise reproduced in any material form whatever without the author's prior written permission.

11739-91 Ave. Edmonton,
Alberta, Canada. T6G 1B1

April 22, 1994

UNIVERSITY OF ALBERTA

FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES AND RESEARCH

The undersigned certify that they have read, and recommend to the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research for acceptance, a thesis entitled **KNOWLEDGE TRANSFER AND RECIPROCITY: A CANADIAN THEOLOGICAL EDUCATION PROJECT IN KENYA** submitted by **BRIAN FRANCIS STELCK** in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of **DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY** in **INTERNATIONAL/INTERCULTURAL EDUCATION**.

Dr S.H. Toh (Supervisor)

Jean Clandinin
Dr J. Clandinin

Dr M. Assheton-Smith

Dr M. Horowitz

Dr W. Samiroden

Dr C. Torres (External Reader)

April 22, 1994

ABSTRACT

The directionality and distribution of knowledge has largely been controlled by the West. The Third World has knowledge to share and the West needs to participate in a freer exchange of knowledge. Two Kenyan denominations wanted their leadership to have a theological education in Canada. This case study analyzes a project where Canadian Theological professors went to teach Kenyan students in their own context. The Canadian credential offered to the adult learners was modified through mutual collaboration to suit the recipients. Graduates, students, professors and administrators were interviewed and their thematically coded responses and narratives form the body of the research. Professors who were concerned about their ability to contextualize returned to Canada expressing that it was a life-changing experience. Kenyan students described the experience as "liberating", "empowering" and making a "dramatic change" in their lives and their work. In development terms it was described as holistic in focus, empowering, beneficial beyond the primary recipients, and having an end goal of self sufficiency. Both Canadians and Kenyans initially thought the purpose was to alleviate some "Kenyan deficit" in knowledge. The process, which was met by some initial internal opposition, was more significant as social transformation than either party had anticipated. Both parties had entered the project with an assumed "modernization paradigm" yet learning took place in both directions, changes occurred for both groups and as the project continued, critical analysis questioned both the dependencies, the underdevelopment, the value of each cultures' knowledge, and the ways collaboration could enhance the reciprocity of knowledge transfer.

Acknowledgement

Namshukuru Mwenyezi Mungu na Bwana Yesu kwa ajili ya wokovu na uongozi wake katika maisha yangu nzima. Namshukuru Bishop Nathan K. Ngala, Askofu wa Africa Brotherhood Church, Machakos, Kenya, Rev. Titus Nzikali na wale wote wa ABC ambao ni marafiki na ndugu na dada katika imani. Pamoja na hawa, nawashukuru wale wa African Christian Church and Schools na Moderator Rev. James Ngugi Waithaka na General Secretary Rev. Julius Karanja.

Caryn (Mwende), Asante mpendwa, na Mungu akubariki. Ryan (Musembi), Scott (Mwendwa), Matthew (Kioko) and my extended family, asante.

I need to acknowledge the tremendous cooperation by all the Carey Theological College professors for their participation and their encouragement to move through this degree program. Blessings on Dr. R. Paul Stevens with whom we dreamed of this project and spent those nights in amongst the rats, cockroaches and chickens in the coop when the project began to move beyond vision to reality. Thanks to Gail, Martha and Dr. John Zimmerman who now can say, like Paul, they too have been stoned in a riot. Thanks to Dr. Phil Collins for being willing to expose his life to change.

Acknowledgement must be made to Canadian Baptist International Ministries for their support of the CMIN project and my research.

To Dr. Toh, my supervisor, "asante" for your visit with me in Kenya while the formal research was in progress, it meant a great deal to me. To Dr. M. Assheton-Smith and Dr. C.R. Stelck, you encouraged me to move through the doctoral program at "record" speed, thanks.

I also thank those committee members who not only read the thesis but expeditiously returned the copies to me with compliments amongst the editing. Thank you Dr. Jean Clandinin, Dr. Myer Horowitz, Dr. Wallie Samiroden, for the phone calls and the openness to allow me to see where my graduate experience differed from what academia should be. You helped me laugh at the situation and encouraged me to remain composed until I got my "union card stamped". Your models are stories which I will emulate with my own graduate students. You shared your lives, your work and your care without hypocrisy.

I have a special word of appreciation for all the people around the "kitchen table" in the Centre for Research for Teacher Education and Development, without the weekly caring community I would have walked away from my degree. Teacher-learner research never occurs in isolation. It is only in community. May my experience encourage you to bring change where you are able. Celebrate with your students, maintain your vision and pity the bitterness of those who will not share with joy in your accomplishments.

The graduate experience and in particular the thesis process should be a festival of learning and teaching surrounded by the joy of discovery. I leave the University of Alberta with a view of what I must do with my graduate students. I gained this view because I learned through example, not only some positive ones but also through some extremely negative examples. This acknowledgement is the articulation of what I have learned.

The supervisor and committee should know the student well enough to see where compliments, encouragement or, if necessary, controlled direction would be beneficial. Graduate studies should not appear to be only this horrendous gate-keeping function played out by the university. Those in power positions should not play out their own "academic game" with the student's life. A supervisor should never be so busy that the student's progress is an interference. Academic and personal integrity must be maintained throughout the graduate experience.

I believe a student should have the courtesy extended to her/him, if not the right, of being informed about their own status at any time in the program. The student's department should stand behind the student in challenging out-dated policy. The practice of using an external examiner has left a legacy of unchecked power in the external reader process. When an external examiner had personal issues, out-dated practices or narrow world-views they were still required to sit in the same room with the candidate and other academics during the oral examination. The current external reader system allows the "arm's length" reader to snipe, with impunity, at the student, or at the thesis. The student needs the benefit of the external comments, however, without the opportunity to "face one's accuser" the review and examination process becomes unbalanced and wrought with injustice.

Support staff should never be placed in the awkward position of determining the fate of a student or an oral examination when academic issues are involved. The student must have the right to be informed about academic issues surrounding their work. Where written processes are required for activities, such as an orals, then written notice should also be required to modify those activities. The student should have the right to be informed of both the issues and the redress.

Collegiality should mean that other faculty members in the department share in the success (or failure) of the students. Students should not need a process to protect them from the academic jealousies and "turf" wars of their own university. The student, however, does need the protection of the "home" department from external attack.

To move to a kinder and more gentle world we need to begin with a scholastic model that allows a caring community to exist within academia. These models do exist and they can be found in isolated reaches on the campus of the University of Alberta. Faculty, graduate student or support staff, seek them out and by learning to care maybe you can change one small corner of your lived-world.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1

HUMAN INTER-RELATIONSHIPS 1
Preamble 1
One Voice 3
Theological Placement 6
Knowledge and Canonicity 13
Canon and Praxis 16
Knowledge Transfer 20
Participants' Voices 24
A New Name 29

CHAPTER 2

A RESEARCH STORY 34
The Case 35
    Background 35
    Situation 38
Selected Solution 41
Issues Unaddressed 43
Second Application 49
The Research Problem 50
    Research Questions 52
Research Methodology 55

CHAPTER 3

KNOWLEDGE FOR WHAT 64
Modernization 64
Development 73
CMIN as Development 94
Why Participate? 100
What about Change? 109

CHAPTER 4

PEOPLE PARTICIPATE 129
Whose Plan? 132
The Target Goals 144
Teaching In Context 151
Whose Knowledge? 159
The Problems 164
    Finance 165
    What Language? 167
    Who Participates? 170
    Practicum Problems 175
    Schedules and Courses 179

CHAPTER 5

HANDLE WITH CARE 184
Education In Kenya 184
Educational Significance 188
Transformation In Class 195
The Project Criticisms 206
Who Learned What? 210

CHAPTER 6

RECIPROCITY OF VOICES 229
Process in Reflection 234
Outcomes 236
Researcher's Reflections 239
Grad's Voice 244
Student's Voice 245
Teacher's Voice 247
My Voice 248
The Last Word 250

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Bibliography 253

APPENDICES

A. Questions For Interviews 268
B. CMIN Project Goals 271
C. CMIN Courses 272

CHAPTER 1

HUMAN INTER-RELATIONSHIPS

Nyimbo ya kufunzwa haikeshi ngoma.
(Songs learned from afar are not danced long.)

PREAMBLE

Assistance for two indigenous Kenyan church bodies in leadership development was the request. Canadian Baptists, with funding and logistics support, responded to that request through a unique link with Carey Theological College to provide professors and credentials. The African bodies selected the students and provided the classroom facilities. Together, through collaboration, the program was designed, modified and implemented. The Africa Brotherhood Church (ABC) and the African Christian Church and Schools (ACC & S) were in partnership with Canadian Baptist International Ministries (CBIM) and Carey Theological College (Carey). It was more than a partnership, it was a collaborative project where learning took place in several directions.

Canadian professors went to Kenya to teach a classroom of Kenyans in the Kenyan context rather than uprooting two or three Kenyan students and sending them to Canada for the same credential. Carey offered a Certificate in Ministry (CMIN) to the Kenyans, just as it does to Canadians. Two classes, one of 18 (which has graduated), and a second of 24 (which is in progress), participated and shared in the CMIN project. It was with the graduates, the current students, the faculty and the administration of both Kenyan and Canadian partners that interviews were conducted.

The relationship is of such a nature that the voices of the Kenyan and Canadian participants stand side by side in the writing of this text. Their voices also stand alongside those who have written about modernization, development, change, methodology and theology. The reader will find the text attempts to blend the narratives of them all into one story.

There are depths of meanings attached to analysis which are acceptable for a study in which human subjects open themselves to examination. The analysis raises certain ethical questions for the researcher who is also a confidant to the participants. The analysis cannot go beyond the researcher's role which is dialogical and must not be arbitrary in the depiction of each participant's message. The integrity of the respondent's statements and the personal relationship of the researcher with each one is of great importance. The imposition of my analytical agenda onto their voices would be equally undesirable yet a critical, dialogical approach to the narratives can not avoid the empirical realities in which the respondents' lives are grounded. The very use of the words participant or respondent detracts somewhat from individuals and their voices. All are people with names yet in research some of their uniqueness disappears.

If this research has allowed some of the participants an opportunity to be heard and if it can facilitate further dialogue and collaboration between two different worlds, then it has achieved far more than could have been anticipated. The human relationships described in this research are integral to the critical study of knowledge transfer between North and South. The words on these pages will hopefully allow space for the reader to make connections through images, themes and constructs other than those described from this particular set of research records.

The reader may need some assistance in attaching transcript segments to participants. The transcript excerpts from the interviews are identified throughout this text by coded symbols (CP3 1-5 or KG1 3-1 etc) where (CP#) is a Canadian professor, (KG#) is a Kenyan graduate of the ABC CMIN, (KS#) is a Kenyan student in the current ACC & S CMIN, (KA#) is a Kenyan administrator, (CA#) is a Canadian administrator (KD) is a Kenyan whose identity is disguised, (CD) is likewise a Canadian whose identity is disguised and (Name) is a reference found in the Bibliography. The number (3-1) with a hyphen is a referent to a specific point in a transcript of a corresponding interview.

ONE VOICE

She had fallen asleep in class those first few days of the course. Others told her she was too old. Why should she, an elderly mother, waste the classroom space which a younger person could take? She no longer belonged in the classroom, after all, she was over 50 years of age. When home, she had to study by kerosene lantern after the children had finished their studies and gone to bed. That would be at the close of a day when not only had she done all the domestic household tasks expected of her but she had also provided all the farm labour requirements on their small piece of land; her shamba as the Kenyans refer to it. She said to me, "When you get back, thank your people of Canada for giving me an opportunity to study". Her eyes began to glisten as she put personal voice to the story she wanted me to hear. The passion in her voice made me blink and swallow the lump forming in my throat, but this is also her story and so let her voice be heard. Listen to her story, if you will.

> My friends they ask me, "Why? You are old, why are you reading at that age? What do you want? What is the future after leaving that?" So I might tell them the most important thing is to accept the gift that has come to me and I get the

knowledge and this knowledge I'll share whatever I can with others. We Africans share with others. I may get a certificate I may get whatever. That is not the most important thing I'm going to get. The most important thing I'm going to get I bringing, I will bring to you what I can bring to you. I want all of us to get time to share with others. So they say OK go and come and tell us. It is not always easy to tell them everything.

I heard from KA2, he is the one who told me. He asked me, We have the Canadians right here. They are ready, they want to help us. They want to train you here in Kenya in our place so you can learn theology while you are still here. You can probably then take it to other people.

I asked him, "What, do you think I am eligible to try?"

He asked me, "Why?"

"Because of my age! Do you think anybody over 50 is eligible to take it? Because I would be very much interested".

He told me, "Yes, fill the forms." He gave me the forms. I filled the forms and I waited. I really didn't know what was (going to happen). So when at last I found I was accepted to bring my certificates and all that. I was told I can start with the others.

So I am happy because I thought it was something to be taken on merit or like other educational qualities. So when I started I wasn't sure if I was going to make it because I, although I had gone for six months on leadership and it contained some theology I didn't really know if I could make this one. But I started reading with the others. I discovered whatever I wanted to read was there. I had confidence then that I can make it and it is useful for whatever I do. There is prayer, there is Bible study which I needed very much and all the other development projects and how I can help our ladies.

I should say it was KA2 who told me about it and when we came together as a class and he told us, "Now these people have come from Canada and whatever you miss don't you worry that what you are going to get. They are giving professors to teach, they have given even food, transport, books." So I felt wonderful.

My worry was, am I going to make it? As a wife, with children, with my work, with the shamba, but God has helped me so far I have confidence I will make it.

> With the CMIN what I do myself I have to sacrifice a lot of time to be able to write something. To read, there is a lot of reading so with all I told you I have my program for my work during the day, I have some days with the shamba. I have children who are doing the examinations I have to sacrifice time after ten o'clock at night. When the children study I have to stay with them at table and help them with their studies. When they go to sleep that is when I stay longer, about three hours and study. But I don't have other problems because I do it bit by bit, bit by bit then I compile the whole thing later. (KS2 2-3)

Without the opportunity provided for her through the Canadian-Kenyan partnership this marginalized individual would never have been given the opportunity for a formal educational experience. Her age, her status, or lack thereof, her position in society all would mitigate against her, yet she struggles through her personal hardship to learn and take her learning to others even more marginalized.

Who, in this age, is willing to do more than just look at the poor? Who has the eyes and heart of justice? There is something far more noble than bringing the best to the elite and, that is, the collaboration and dialogue that shares the best you can offer with the poor. That, perhaps, sounds foolish or, it sounds old fashioned, moral and somewhat Judeo-Christian in its lived form.

This thesis attempts to look at a Canadian theological education project and, through the specific case study in Kenya, to critique the transfer of knowledge. This project is an exemplar of the process involved in the teaching and learning of theological content cross-culturally. The focus on the transfer and dissemination of knowledge between Canadian theologians and Kenyan students is situated within the background context of cultural imperialism and North-South relationships. (North is used to refer to the "developed" or Western world, while South refers to the "developing" or Third World.) The study interacts with the nature of knowledge in development work as it flows through a theological filter. In the context of the theological education dialogue there are conflicts, contradictions and tensions in the appropriation of knowledge. The study speaks about tensions in the teaching-learning process and the tensions in the process of contextualization. The study talks about change that was confronted at various levels and the tensions that those changes accentuated.

Two independent indigenous African church bodies wanted help. How could a group of Canadians help meet the request for educational upgrading within the churches. In doing so, what was the development process and intent? The question raised in the study is not only whose knowledge is involved in the process, but what is the knowledge and where is it situated in the process? While these questions are addressed by the study, no attempt has been made to study the underlying premises of the theological faith. The request for assistance was premised on the assumption that the Canadian Baptists had a similar theological faith and would, through their teaching, augment the theological education within these two Kenyan churches.

THEOLOGICAL PLACEMENT

Canadian Baptists, the Africa Brotherhood Church and the African Christian Church and Schools have some commonality within the theological belief and practice. However, there are also some differences. Within Canadian Baptist circles some of these same differences surface and these, in turn, affect theological education within the various seminaries and colleges. However, the three church groups are similar in that they share much of their faith in common. As is implied by the ACC & S name, the three church bodies have placed their theistic faith in a Christian understanding of God. The faith we hold states that, Jesus Christ, the only begotten Son of God, is truly and eternally God. For the purpose of the redemption of humanity, God became incarnate and dwelt upon the earth fully divine and fully human. Jesus was crucified under Pontius Pilate bearing the sin of the world, was buried and the third day rose bodily from the tomb. After a further period of forty days of manifestation Jesus ascended into heaven and there sits with God as Saviour and judge of all humanity. Salvation, and restitution to a right relationship with God is a gift of grace provided to all who hear the message (gospel) and respond, asking Jesus through faith, to remove their sin and proclaiming Jesus as Lord and Saviour. The Spirit of God is then provided as the guarantee of a right, or restored relationship with God. All three churches hold this basic belief as common to their Christianity.

The churches would also hold in common the centrality of the Scriptures. The Bible with the 39 books of the Old Testament, corresponding to the books recognized in Judaism, as well as the 27 New Testament books is placed as the authoritative, all-sufficient rule of faith and practice. The Carey Faculty Handbook states that the College asserts in the doctrine, "The divine inspiration of Holy Scripture and its consequent entire trustworthiness and supreme authority in all matters of faith and conduct" (p. 22). The Africa Brotherhood Church states in its constitution "(i) *A.B.C. itakaa katika kuiamini Biblia, chuo cha Mungu ya kwamba ndicho chuo cha kweli, na ndicho kilichoandikwa mapenzi yote ya Mungu, kikiongozwa na Roho Mtakatifu*" (ABC 1984,p.2), that is, "The ABC remains in (vests its) faith in the Bible, the true authority of God, it contains the written will of God as led by the Holy Spirit."

The Canadian Baptist theological schools went through a debate on the interpretation of scripture in the late 1920's (Zeman, 1980). Carey, in presenting CMIN courses, focuses on the literary genre which finds it place in the scriptures. These include but are not limited to songs, poetry, drama, wisdom literature, historical narratives, law, sermons, personal and corporate letters and apocalyptic writing. Each genre blends it uniqueness to the overall Biblical interpretation. Because of the difficulty with language translation, exegetical reference is made to the meaning in the original languages. It would be inaccurate, however, to suggest there would be any universal or standard position for all of the professors at Carey. The Canadian Baptist churches are also diverse with a range of positions from literalistic interpretations through to very liberal interpretations of the Bible. If this spectrum was applied to the Kenyan churches, they would both fall on the more conservative, literal portion of the continuum. For example, they would assume women should wear a "head covering" when praying while Canadian Baptists would interpret the Bible passage as culturally specific to the time of writing.

The nature of the church and the outward manifestations of the church polities that are subsumed under the definitions do reveal some differences. The following are examples of some of the differences.The three denominations hold a belief that the church is made up of those people who have been "regenerated through the Holy Spirit after repentance and the conscious acceptance by faith of Jesus Christ as Saviour and Lord" (BUWC 1980, p.2). Membership is usually through a one-time only baptism by immersion. Some Canadian churches have no age restriction nor a common practice for baptismal/membership instruction but the African churches do expect the candidates for baptism to have completed pre-baptismal classes and to have reached 14 years of age. The members of all three churches also participate in a second ordinance but unlike baptism it is celebrated on a regular (monthly) basis. The Lord's Supper is the celebration through the eating of bread and the drinking of a cup of remembrance. The memorial is to remind the church of the sacrificial work Jesus performed by the death on the cross for sin. Although most Canadian churches would allow any Christian believer to participate in the Lord's Supper, the African churches have far stricter control over those who may or may not participate.

The nature of the church is deemed to be made up of a "priesthood of all believers". This means for the three denominations that the individual who through conscious repentance accepts the Lordship of Jesus is regenerated by the Spirit of God into the church of Christ. Each individual then is entirely competent to approach God through Jesus without any need for an earthly priestly intermediary. Anyone can have direct and clear access to God. The doctrine for all three denominations is clearly the same on this issue. However, all three also have to grapple with the socio-historical issue which is constantly confronting the church. There are clergy who are acting in various capacities in the church structures and there are, at times, perception problems with the roles the clergy are to play. For example, the clergy in Kenya are placed in the role of community advisor. The local community will consult the clergy regarding education, property, and tradition.

Canadian Baptist church polity is manifest by the democratic power based in the individual congregations. Churches select their own leadership, boards and trustees and may hold property titles or send the title to the denominational office. Each church may select and remove their own clergy usually called Pastors. The denomination recognizes, endorses and actively examines Pastors both male and female for church leadership. In the 1993 Standing Report of the Credentials Committee of the Baptists Union of Western Canada the number of Ministerial Students was 15, 14 male and 1 female. In the same report of 22 Licensed Pastors added to the roles 3 were women and 19 were men. The minimum standard for ordination is a Certificate in Ministry or a Master of Divinity. The individual churches however, have a democratic choice for pastoral selection and as yet not all churches are open to women serving as the pastor. The denomination gathers together the individual churches to do collectively those tasks which individual churches would not be capable of doing alone. These include the operation of the mission board, CBIM and the theological schools of which Carey is the denomination's theological college in Western Canada. The denominational business and policy making, including the selection of officers and executive staff, is the responsibility of the full assembly which is a gathering of the individual churches each with a number of votes determined by the size of their membership. (Jones, 1980; Zeman, 1980)

The Africa Brotherhood Church allows local congregations to select their own local church council, however, the clergy are always appointed by the planning committee of the ABC on the recommendation of the Bishop or designate. The church command or hierarchy is from the ABC supreme council to the planning committee then to Sub-headquarters and local churches. The clergy are arranged in two separate hierarchies, for males; ArchBishop, Bishop, ArchDeacon, Canon, Pastor, Deacon, Evangelist, LayLeader and for females; Deaconess, Trusted Sister, Sister, Preacher. Anyone in any rank may marry. There is a gender differentiation in the permitted roles of the clergy and there is a role differentiation by rank.

The African Christian Church and Schools fits somewhere between the Canadian Baptist and Africa Brotherhood Church structure. The local congregations select their own boards and supply representatives to the general council. The congregations each have an opportunity through representation to select (elect) the Moderator of the entire denomination along with the other officers who will serve the church until the next election. The executive thus elected have the authority to place the clergy, both male and female, into local parish situations. The ACC & S clergy has the ranks of Evangelist and Pastor. There is a differentiation in role based on gender.

Each of the three denominations, Canadian Baptists, ABC and ACC & S, places theological education in the hands of their theological schools. The ACC & S runs a Bible School at Gituru for the express purpose of the preparation of their clergy and, upon completion, students are placed in the local churches. At the time of the CMIN the ABC Divinity School at Mitaboni did the pastoral preparation for two streams, a three year course of studies and an eighteen month course for those who could not complete the academic work. Both programs lead to the same pastoral responsibility after completion. Entrance was based only on an individual being "called by God" for service. Carey Theological College in Vancouver accepts students for two streams, those entering with a degree may complete a three year Master of Divinity and those without a degree but over 35 years of age may enroll in a Certificate in Ministry (CMIN). All graduates have the same potential for placement.

Theological education in Canada and the United States is currently proceeding through a debate regarding the relevance of the college based academic model which has been the dominant model for the bulk of this century. This model is being called into question in North America (Anderson, 1993) just as in Africa (Turaki, 1991). The questions being addressed in theological education are similar to those of teacher educators. How do you balance the proportion of theory with the practice necessary for ministry (classroom teaching)? How much content is required before the student is ready to go into the field? Where can the preparation for ministry (teaching) best take place, in the church (school) or in the college? What would be the shape of a church based model of pastoral preparation?

The discussion surrounding theological education also touches on those elements which would or should make up the content of that education. For many years theological education was focused around the European process of systematic theology. The university model of dividing content into subject areas has separated study, skills and techniques from the more holistic integration of ministry. Once a core of subject content has been learned then the student can begin doing the mission of the church. The current separation of biblical studies, systematic theology, history, homiletics,and pastoral skills encourages the academic exercise of learning and doing abstract reflection about the nature of God, the church,and creation. Faculty is caught in the "publish or perish" academic treadmill of the universities (Anderson, 1993). This press to publish is set against the pressing need to provide the church with leaders who know God and can equip others for the ministry within a priesthood of all believers. The traditional theological education produces academics for the institution called the church. But in my view, what is needed for the church, which should be the gathered people of God, is practitioners who will embody the incarnational paradigm which Jesus emulated. There is a tension between knowing about a subject, in this instance theology, and the application, or lived experience of knowing God. This has been one of the ongoing theological debates with which the church has wrestled and avoided. The church historically has also struggled with the balance between the need for proclamation (evangelism) and the social justice issues which call to be addressed. Social issues needing to be addressed would include poverty and its root couses, oppression of women, unjust access to health care and education, absence of basic human rights and exploitation through political and economic inequity. It might be charged that the debate at times became more important than the actual doing of either the evangelism or the social action.

The CMIN project in Kenya placed Canadian professors and Kenyan students in a position where some of the issues of social justice took on experiencial meaning. The individual participants were faced with this theological debate through the daily activity involved in the CMIN project.

KNOWLEDGE AND CANONICITY

The juxtaposition of the terms knowledge and theology poses a dichotomous dialogue for not only individuals but also between various world-views. In theology it is necessary to deal with the issue of belief systems or knowledge-claims which are based on the access to knowledge originating not only from revealed texts but also from experience. The knowledge which is held to be right and true guides and directs life actions and is made accessible to others by scientists or theologians (Bilton et al., 1987).

The post-enlightenment movement to scientific knowledge challenged the traditional theological knowledge base which had claimed the dominant legitimate right to truth. The scientific knowledge became recognized as "western knowledge" and as it was generated by researchers and academics soon surpassed other forms of knowledge as the "sacred knowledge" (Masemann, 1990; Welch, 1991; Arnove, Altbach & Kelly, 1992). The scientific knowledge became the accepted educational knowledge, that is the knowledge which was valued and sustained and therefore institutionalized.

> With the rise of scientific, positivist approaches to gathering information, knowledge forms changed from holistic, integrated forms of culture into fragmented pieces...the challenge, then, for

> science is to gather information about the knowable world and to state conclusions about the relationships between and among objects. (Masemann, 1990, p.469)

Masemann (1990) suggests that with the rise of the modern scientific approach, knowledge changed from being holistic cultural patterns, into segmented pieces of data. This data could be subjected to verification, shown to be true or false. Data as knowledge then became separated into facts which were observable and empirically testable.

From the time when Europe woke in the "Enlightenment", there has been a Eurocentric definition of what constitutes knowledge and the power that such knowledge controls. Knowledge became "rational" and associated with the observation of bits of nature by the senses. What was classed as knowledge had to fit the new positivist form of science, observable, measurable, and able to be replicated. "To those educated in Western or Western-derived educational systems, such a mode of thinking is simply the best or most highly evolved or even the truest way of knowing the world and the relationship of things within it" (Masemann, 1990, p.469). The authority of other forms of knowledge like the revealed knowledge of religion, the experiential, procedural or constructed knowledge of women, as well as silence, (Belenky et al., 1986), the private or the practical cultural knowledge of people was all called into question and rejected. The knowledge of "others" is silenced as the recognized knowledge is legitimated. Teacher knowledge, including the embodied knowledge, which is the praxis knowledge found by asking how it is used not by asking what it means, (Clandinin & Connelly, 1985) struggles for legitimacy. The Western religious "knowledge" of the colonial era was seen as imposed (Rodney, 1972; Sandbrook, 1985), and so religious teaching has also been treated as suspect knowledge (Collins and Makowsky, 1989; Ritzer, 1992).

As knowledge became alienated from the broader or more holistic world-views, facts were set apart from values which were seen as private personal choice issues in the West. Roxburgh (1993) suggests that "implicit in this viewpoint is the conviction that truth and fact are the function of scientific methodology, while values and preferences are the function of religion" (p. 37). This statement suggests the Western frame of reference for knowledge is the provable public realm. The world-view of the West is not the only proposition available for this discussion. In cultures where the spiritual world is considered an integral part of the known world, scholars indeed challenge this Western knowledge base (Mbiti, 1975; Moreau,1990). Theological knowledge is forced to address the holistic issues of a cultural world-view that seeks answers which have values and life applications. There is a parallel call by Belenky, Clinchy, Goldberger and Tarule (1986) when they state that there is a need to knit knowledge and society together to be holistic, context dependent and integrative. Roxburgh (1993) states,

> People are less and less convinced that the world that has been bequeathed to them by empiricism and technique is a satisfying explanation for their experience. Rather than a world composed of mechanisms and disparate parts, they crave holism. (p. 43)

Theological education in the West has not been holistic in its systematization and attempts to transmit its knowledge to student populations. It has attempted to follow the scientific approach to knowledge and divide theology into segments for study. The experiential, the mystical, the existential have for a while been conveniently overlooked in the attempts to study the observable and measurable. The element of conflict for theologians is that the theology of Christianity, with its Judaic base, is the experience of a living God who actively interacts with humans in time and space.

This Canadian theological education project in Kenya perhaps was no exception, at the initial points of contact, courses, designed and presented to cover the parts of the greater body of theological knowledge brought this segmented Western knowledge about ministry, about leadership, Bible content, preaching, and cultural issues into interaction with another worldview, a view which would require a more holistic response.

> I think we learned the Western boundedness of most of our disciplines and while we didn't come back totally changed, in that we didn't teach every thing differently when we got back, there were some significant, though others may say minor, changes because we realized that systematic theology is not the only way to teach theology. That Western logical methods of analysis are not the only way of appropriating truth. I think there is a more holistic approach to truth, at least within the rural culture in Kenyan, than we have in the Western enlightened academic institutions which are unfortunately so cognitively based in learning. They (Kenyans) sing their theology, and they sing their real theology and we probably, if we thought more about it, we could make a lot more use of aesthetics in both understanding them and communicating with them in the classroom. We didn't do too much different from what we would do here. (CP6 6-4)

CANON AND PRAXIS

Theological education when perpetuated through the scholastic, seminary approach has the potential of separating the content knowledge from the purposes, ends and values in which the life-world operates. There is a problematic for the teaching of content removed from the context in which it is applied. I follow the view that theology must be reinstated in the lived world and in the involvement with the lives of the oppressed. There are two directions of thought which appear to complement each other. The first direction of thought derives from critical theory and the three basic types of knowledge which Habermas (1971, 1987) articulated through his work on the "cognitive-constitutive interests". The second thought suggests that the praxis of liberation theology has attempted to blend the reflection and action of theology into concrete and specific emancipatory activity for the participant learner (Gutierrez, 1983; Stackhouse, 1988).

Habermas (1987, p.204) states that the life world is a "context-forming background of process of reaching understanding" in the action of communication. He suggests that through the integration of culture, society and personality, rational methods of understanding can be achieved. For Habermas there are three basic knowledge constitutive interests, technical, practical and emancipatory. Technical knowledge is concerned with power, control and physical survival. It is articulated through the empirical, analytical sciences and exhibits its form of social action through labour. Practical knowledge seeks to come to mutual understanding within common tradition. It is articulated in the historical hermeneutical sciences and exhibits itself in social interaction. The third component is emancipatory knowledge which is concerned with freedom stemming from self-reflection leading to self-reliance and responsibility. It is articulated through clarified communication.

In that the knowledge necessary to develop an interest in emancipation is derived from the technical and practical modes of knowledge (Lane, 1983) its articulation, in turn, gives rise to ideological critique. Self-reflection is likened by Habermas to psychoanalysis (Ritzer, 1992) in that the distorted communication, repression, and social barriers are enunciated and clarified so the individual (or societal group) can be liberated. Theory for Habermas is not technical knowledge waiting for application but suggests that "scientism in theory is authoritarianism in practice" (Lane, 1983, p. 54). Emancipatory praxis attempts to place technical and practical knowledge into the lived-world and through that liberatory action produce expanding theory which further informs the emancipatory praxis.

> Habermas's theory of the link between knowledge and interest is the key to appreciating present-day concern with emancipation not only in theology but among all human beings of good will. Liberation movements cannot be dismissed simply as passing fads or momentary trends. These movements, of course have been heightened by the promise and potential of modern science and technology. (Lane, 1983, p. 62)

This study of the CMIN process opens a practical discussion of the application of technical and practical knowledge as it interfaces with the lived world to provide windows of emancipatory potential for the participants.

Gutierrez (1983) would suggest that praxis lies at the very heart of liberation theology. That is, the emancipatory involvement with individuals and social groups takes as its focal point a wider and deeper understanding of the gift of liberation which Christ gave to humanity. This gift of liberation was to be more than an existential spiritual manifestation but a commitment to changing the social order of power and domination. Social reformism and almsgiving are to Gutierrez only the "front porch" expression of conscience appeasement rather than the incarnational life-world emancipatory praxis drawn from theology. Once liberation is experienced then theory can be articulated for the lived-theology. Like Gutierrez, Haight (1985) suggests "that theology in the developed nations is fundamentally different from liberation theology" (p.31). The problem in the "developed" world is a problem of God or faith in God, but in the developing world (specifically Latin America) the problem is the oppressed, the disenfranchised and the theological response to these "non-persons".

> Theology has to include the contemporary phenomena of massive human suffering and oppression into its reflection on the causes of scepticism and unfaith. In short, the problem of human suffering is also the problem of God for theology. In other words, the theological issues of our time come to a focus in the problem of history as a history of suffering, oppression and liberation. (p. 32)

Ferm (1986) says that theology begins with the historical reality of disenfranchisement and moves to a critical reflection and action, "Their response to their own oppressive situation, in short, their praxis- that produces theology" (p. 18). Liberation does not originate with the oppressor but begins as part of the struggle of the oppressed.

One of the severest critiques levelled towards the liberation theologians has been the conspicuous absence in the writing of any inclusion of sexism as a form of oppression. Ferm (1986) in a survey of liberation theologians says there is a lack of sensitivity by the "Third World male liberation theologians to sexist oppression. Clearly these theologians need considerable conscientization in this area of liberation" (p.105).

Theological education in the West has focused on the eternal immutable truths where theory and praxis stand apart. The West has also developed models of theological education which attempt to correlate or mediate the relationship between Christian faith and life, praxis determined by theory. Theological education which is based on critical praxis which grounds theory is not within the mainstream seminary system in the West. The praxis of social transformation which generates theological theory is in need of exemplars for study. The intent of theological education is to produce individuals who are capable of constructing knowledge which will in context be the professional knowledge of life-world theology. This study looks at the theological education process through which knowledge was transfered and constructed.

KNOWLEDGE TRANSFER

The transfer of knowledge between North and South societies has historically been determined by the economic and socio-political interrelationships of the North (sometimes called the West) and South. These "transfer" relationships were based on assumptions, motivations, processes, and structures which still impact the nature of North-South knowledge transfers. The formal process of knowledge transfer is to some extent based on the modernization concept and dualism of "human capital" theory and on capitalism as a purely economic determinant of the control of knowledge. Knowledge and its transfer have been dominated by the "enlightened North" while the South and in particular the "Dark continent" suffer in a neo-colonial dependency.

> Knowledge has become the principal force of production over the last few decades; this has already had a noticeable effect on the composition of the workforce of the most highly developed countries and constitutes the major bottleneck for the developing countries. In the postindustrial and postmodern age, science will maintain and no doubt strengthen its preeminence in the arsenal of productive capacities of the nation-states. Indeed, this situation is one of the reasons leading to the conclusion that the gap between developed and developing countries will grow even wider in the future. (Lyotard, 1984, p.5)

The use of the term "developed" implies "the North" in placing itself in some comparative basis with the South. There are global inequities which differentiate the North and South. These imbalances include factors which must be explored on a social-historical basis. Problems in the West, such as inflation, unemployment and post Cold War realignment also impinge upon the ability of the Two-Third's World to integrate itself into the changes in the global situation. (The Third World actually represents two-thirds of the world's population.) The situational differences or problems of the Third World must be expressed, interpreted and explained along with problems inherent and inherited in order to see both the internal and external factors affecting development and education.

The transfer of knowledge is still seen as being tightly controlled. Some would say knowledge is only released for the purpose of helping to modernize those left behind in the modernization process. Again the implication is that the process through which the North has passed is somehow preferable. There are others (Carnoy, 1974; Sklair, 1991) who postulate that the control is predominantly on economic (i.e., capitalist) grounds. Educational aid is distributed, usually as a continuation from historical tradition or as part of the international market economy. The West established colonial relationships with countries like Kenya and have maintained the control of education and development through economic dependencies. These linkages often had the exploitation of the primary resources and people of the South tied to the manufactured goods and services of the North.

The transfer of knowledge should be reciprocal and yet historically, knowledge has been controlled as not only economic but also social, political and cultural power. It is used for domination and for legitimation (Carnoy, 1974; Hoogvelt, 1982). Knowledge is transferred through formal channels such as education, publications, government or state apparatuses, and through international agencies like UNESCO, WHO and the World Bank (Berman, 1979; Arnove, 1982). There are also numerous non-formal channels such as the media, trans-national corporations (TNCs), aid agencies and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) as well as by the contact and interaction of individuals whether missionary or other expatriate residents (Verhelst, 1990; Sandbrook, 1985). Along with the collaboration of the local elites (Sklair, 1991) these all interact to transfer or restrict knowledge, predominately on a North to the South basis.

Knowledge and its control and dissemination is also seen as power. The power/knowledge equation for Foucault (1983) is a micro-level relationship where professionals, like teachers or professors, may be unaware of their power actions and objectify the people with whom they deal, the students. Power is not owned or controlled by the professors or the state but it is activated when relationships are developed. These relationships become ones of power when the actions of one party plays upon another's actions "it acts upon their actions...on existing actions and on those which may arise in the present or in the future" (p. 220). The person who is being acted upon is always free to respond with a reaction or response which may include the resistance to the exercise of power. Power, for Foucault is relational and does not have to be repressive nor does it have to be from top down. Power is exercised through the mechanism or system of social control which is subsumed with any knowledge discipline. Foucault suggests that "a body of knowledge is a system of social control to the extent that discipline (knowledge) makes discipline (control) possible and vice versa...Knowledge acquired through the exercise of power, because it is seen as knowledge, acquires legitimation status" (Marshall, 1989, p.107). The power knowledge equation becomes a much more subtle social mechanism than the direct power of colonialism or overt domination. The process of emancipation can be controlled and the oppressed are encouraged to believe they are being emancipated when they are only moving through a false liberation. As Foucault suggests, to only talk about one's dreams, goals and personal aspirations is not liberation. This process can instead be a shaping of intent through the knowledge controlled in the classroom.

Theological knowledge has been transferred to the south through the mechanisms of mission organizations who have developed their own institutions in the Third World to produce theologians "like those in the North". The Christian missions produced a need for theological education as the churches influence spread. The enormous problem in Africa is that the education of theologians and clergy has been dramatically outstripped by the growth of the churches. "Bible schools and theological colleges have had an indispensable place in the life of the church but they are unable to cope with training the numbers of leaders needed by the church today" (Hogarth, Gatimu & Barrett, 1983). The seminaries and theological institutions were generally built either by the missions or modelled on mission experiences. Some of these institutions have created dependencies on the North for their continuation. Faculty, capital costs and maintenance were borne by the missions and created a critical dependence on the West. The faculty from the West also produced power relationships which have hindered the process of indigenization in many cases. In other instances the theological content has remained unchanged and "foreign" without the contextualization for the African church. At times students from Africa were sent overseas in order to obtain academic credentials. The elitism and status which these degrees represent have not been without a toll.

The public educational system in Kenya is founded on the British pattern and curriculum, with some recent U.S.

influenced modifications. As discussed later, the system grew from the colonial days when the foreign missions controlled the education of Africans. Their paternalistic trusteeship gave them control over the modernization and development of the African. This included not only religious and moral education but also the development of skills for the labour market. Education, from this background, was intended as training for capitalism and the modern world, as interpreted and viewed from a European knowledge base. The European schooling system, however, was not the only education which the Kenyan people were to receive. The culture, though altered, was not eradicated and the transfer of much of the cultural heritage remains intact in rural Kenya. Traditional knowledge for housing, agriculture and some health care is still used in the rural areas. The view of time as cyclical and event specific still dominates the rural culture. Traditional knowledge at times intersects scientific knowledge and personal knowledge intersects corporate knowledge and all of it comes into relationship with theological knowledge through this study.

PARTICIPANT VOICES

This is the story of the intersection of people's lives, people with different cultures who have been placed in proximity in an educational process. The Kenyans who spoke about their learning opportunities in this project, spoke with a passion for education. They had a desire to learn, and viewed their participation in the CMIN as a potential to share what they had learned with others.

> When you are celebrating something it is very difficult to say anything negative. Let me say if I can ask you at the end of this exercise, in as much as we want to support you in your studies, we feel that you are doing it on our own behalf and

> we appreciate the work you are doing and would request that your dissertation would be made available to us so that we could have something for reference. If there are any resources you are able to bring us from your University we would very much appreciate that. I think that is all I would like to say. (KA2 6-3)

During the process of the project, Canadian professors went as teachers and found they also were faced with cultural differences with which they needed to cope. This Kenyan student expressed it as follows.

> I think Canadians are learning more of us from us. I think they are learning from us because when we go out from lessons we Africans we like to sit in groups and that is our joy when we are together, greeting one another, and we don't feel tired greeting, laughing, discussing issues. We don't feel tired, that is our joy and I think Canadians are learning a lot from us because, when we form those groups, they also enjoy coming to us and they ask us many questions. They ask us where we live, they ask us what we are doing when we are back in our respective places. We feel nice when we are speaking and sharing with people. We are just open and we tell them everything. So I think they are learning more about us and our country. (KS4 2-5)

Listen also to the story of one of the Canadian professors who narrates something of the experience; but in listening, hear that there has been a confrontation of world-views with which the participant grapples. A Western academic has done more than transfer knowledge to the South, there is something in the process which brings reflection.

> Well for myself, I learned something very deep from the Christian world view of the Kenyans, namely that God and the devil are as real as the material world and the social order. They have a comprehensive world view in which their first instinct when they get sick is to pray and their

> second is to go to the Doctor. Where as in Canada the first we do is go to the Doctor and if he can't do anything then we start to pray. That is something very deep. That leads to a view and spontaneity in evangelism, in sharing the gospel and a fervour in ministry that is entirely infectious and I think we learned something very deep and it is very profound learning for those of us visiting.
>
> I think we learned a different view of time, that the Western view of time is as a resource to be managed and therefore we manage it piece-meal to accomplish everything we possibly can. We hate to waste time. Not to ordain and bless and honour every aspect of their view of time, because there are some things they have to learn too. We learned something about time as a gift. And the willingness to set down a task to listen to a person, I think, is something really to be commended in that culture. It is something for us to learn. (CP6 6-1)

One of the Kenyan students in the current CMIN course of studies observed a disorientation within the Canadian participants. The entire class had gone through Kibera, one of the huge slum areas of Nairobi. Something appeared to have occurred in the lives of the Canadians. It would be impossible to determine if it was a reciprocity of learning on the part of the Canadian, or if it was an acknowledgement of the directionality or domination of knowledge, power and economics. The following Kenyan student's response was made to the question, "What are the Canadians learning?"

> I really don't know, because I don't know the experience they have, but probably they might have something they are learning. In Kibera I saw them looking at the way some people live there. They are somehow frightened or they are worried of the way people live there because of poverty and the unhealthy way they live. (KS1 1-8)

The Canadians were confronted with a life situation which had to be processed into their knowledge base. The knowledge that appeared to cause a reaction was experiential and could only be learned from the time listening and observing in the South.

> I think we would have been pretty confronted with the life-style questions of our own lives here and the simplicity of their lives, the struggle, the desire to be like us to have our possessions. Perhaps they have a more fervent faith and we would have to ask the question because of it, have we lost something because of our lifestyle. These are profound existential questions that we are immersed into for a couple of weeks and can't really fathom. How come they have such a strong faith and have such a little of this world's goods? We have so much of this world's goods yet so quietly weak in faith? (CP6 6-6)

The CMIN was, however, lived by individuals who may be identified by name, that is these are real people both Kenyans and Canadians. It was a project which may have been initiated with some sense of a need to "help" the Kenyans along some teleological path. The hardened stance of going to help suggests that the North knows and will help the South by sharing with it. The voices of two of the Canadian professors in the project hint at the possibility of a need to rethink paternalism.

> I'm learning a little bit of anthropology, a little bit of sociology, a little bit of theology a lot of psychology, I'm learning about African situations, African concepts of marriage, the Kenyan concepts of pre-marriage, of dating, inter-generational relationships within the class. The Canadians, on the whole, I hope we are learning how to do cross cultural education better in the long run. I think you are part of that, at least gathering all this stuff and trying to put it through the sieve and find out what we are doing wrong and right. For me personally, shoot it's a gold mine for me to have this opportunity to get into people's lives. I think you must have done the same thing. It just came at the right time, it gave me an in into their families, I know so many grandfathers and grandmothers and children and but also the way we are doing it with a

> partnership of one on one I'm allowed into their homes. It has given me a relationship with them that is more than just a teaching relationship. (CP8 2-3)
>
> The first thing I want to say is I am really excited about the project. It has flaws but it has blessings and it looks very viable, it looks valuable. I think it is approximating or approaching its purpose. It is changing lives, I would not want to see it stopped. I hope it could be carried on , if not in this form , then in some form. I think it is essential to the African and I think it is essential to the Canadian from the point of view of getting us all to become better Christians as a result. There is nothing like giving away a part of your life to enrich your life. (CP3 10-3)

This project allowed some meeting of people. The sharing of lives and the bonding in fellowship of people from diverse cultures, both learning, both teaching and all laughing, crying and struggling to understand the universe together. In a project like the CMIN there is the potential for more learning than is part of the designed course content. There are also the struggles with cross-cultural communication, problems with contextualization, interaction with various world-views and the realities of daily life of another people group whose values, habits, culture and life-style differs from your own. The Canadian professor, who speaks here, had the opportunity to work with both the Africa Brotherhood Church (ABC) and the African Christian Church and Schools (ACC & S).

> The absolute highlight was the goat feast we had with ACC & S last year and that was, there were a lot of reasons I felt like the course worked last year. I felt like it worked the first time. We were doing it under some severe hardships. I had a lot of learning to do about the situation which you gave me after I finished the course.
>
> The second time I felt like I could plan it properly. I planned it in partnership with (KA2). We networked the city for days going around

> picking up all his old urban contacts. So we had a good series of sight visits planned. I had this vision of bringing in Canadians and putting them in every one of the small groups that I called age groups or "rikas" one Canadian in each of those groups. My reason for bringing Canadians in is I want to give (baby) boomers an opportunity to experience mission. I didn't want to treat them special, I want to make them participants, every one on the same level.
>
> The second (highlight) would be taking the ACC & S CMIN students to (KG5) at Makadara and hearing him actually articulate how he had implemented the basic understanding of urban mission that I had tried to introduce two years before. I knew one student had heard. For me that was another really significant experience.
>
> I guess the third one was the night after the riot experience in Nairobi and we got back to Mitaboni and one by one those ABC people, Sisters and others who had heard what had happened to us, came by and I sensed an authentic love and compassion and support. I think I would name that as the third. Now that doesn't have anything to do with the CMIN but it was a consequence of our trying to do the CMIN and I would not exchange any of those experiences in life for..., It's made the whole of it worthwhile. (CP1 9-2)

A NEW NAME

Because the benefit of this written text is not for me personally, but to be shared with other people in the CMIN, their stories intersect my story as we walk the same path. Who am I in this story? Let me introduce myself. I am one who hears the cry for help not as from a far off place, but I hear the sounds of the familiar, the near. The plea I hear is as the concern from home in need of response. I am one who has had the opportunity and privilege to cross from North to South. I have been granted access to one small place in the South and welcomed with a new name. A name that has grown in meaning through this story, we call, the research study.

A name is important. A name is more than identity, it is more than a handle of recognition. In amongst the Kamba people a name cannot be taken it can only be given. It is given with thought, with much laughter and with love.

The Kamba people, who first tasted this experiment in knowledge transfer and reciprocity, call me Nzyoka. It means, "the one who replaces them", or "the one who stands in the place of one who is gone". The name carries a reincarnational sub-text. It is a name given when a family member dies or leaves. It is given to the next male child born in the family. Other Canadians had begun the link with the ABC but had all returned to Canada by the time I arrived. I had replaced the Canadians who had vacated the teaching position thus perhaps the name Nzyoka.

This study also speaks of Nzyoka who became identified with both of the primary cultures and taught a share (4) of the courses in the CMIN. It speaks of the researcher who has multiple roles to play as participant, researcher and to a degree one of those subject to critique by the research.

> I think people like you, Brian, are critical to the program too. You are on board, and I loved having you in classroom with me. I felt more secure when you were there because if I used a big word you were able to leap in there and explain the concept that word was supposed to convey. I felt that they were getting more out of if when we did that as a team. I came with the basic content. You were able to get it across in their own language from time to time. I think they wanted to struggle in English as much as possible, I think that was important to them. I think that it was also important to them that certain concepts had to go through the grid before we could do it in English again. People like you are critical to the program. Someone like you, like (CD) if you do not have an anchor out there it is going to fall apart up here. (CA2 10-4)

My role and involvement with the ABC began with the teaching task force in 1985 at which time I began to teach at the ABC Divinity School in Mitaboni. I was present at all consultations between the ABC and CBIM and had been teaching and team-teaching with Kenyan colleagues in Kiswahili for a number of years. During the ABC project life I taught one third of all the credit hours as adjunct professor to Carey. I assisted the Canadian professors with orientation, and, when necessary, provided language translation both in class and for major consultation meetings. I was, by default, acting administrator of the theological school and, therefore, actively involved in the attempt to replace ALL Canadian task force members with Kenyan staff. One of the teachers with whom I team-taught stated it this way.

> The main goal of the CMIN was to upgrade the leadership of the ABC. Really if we look for the source we would say that there was a teacher here, who was given the Kikamba name Nzyoka, he saw the problems we were having and he brought some other teachers who were very suitable to plan, Paul Stevens, Dr. Collins but really it was his plan. (KG1 2-4)

In a study of this type there is the potential danger of the researcher's loss of critical distance or of external neutrality in the process. I played the role of teacher to students for sufficient time to become language competent in Kiswahili. During that time I developed personal rapport with a number of African colleagues. These colleagues became students within the CMIN project. I then assumed a dual role, I was one of the professors in the project and remained as a colleague during the time when other professors were in the classroom.

This duality of role was evident during the research process as well. One of the questions asked of the participants focused on the reason(s) or motivating factor for involvement in the CMIN. This Kenyan graduate expressed the duality of role in answering my research question by saying that I was instrumental. My Kamba name, Nzyoka, was used in the answer as if I were a third party.

> I entered the CMIN, because I taught here in the Divinity School and I was encouraged by Nzyoka to enter the CMIN program and I was pleased to do so even now I praise God for having done the program. (KG1 2-8)

However, Nzyoka knows full well the discussion which took place in order to persuade this participant to enter the program. I remember when we first discussed the possibility of the CMIN, (KG1) and I were team teaching a course in Evangelism and Ministry. We had been through a number of somewhat tense situations together, both physical and emotional, and had become quite good friends. We had moved beyond being only colleagues. (KG1) was a senior, respected individual in the church hierarchy and was very concerned with the younger people catching up and perhaps passing him in their education and therefore advancing their potential for higher office. His oral and written English were not that fluent and some of the potential students were very fluent. "What if I failed?" "What if I can't do the work?" I knew that he could do the work but it would also mean a commitment from me to assist with translation, perhaps sit in on the classes and help, even spend time explaining the English text material. There were excuses given so as not to lose face, and culturally I understood the risk his loss of face would mean if he failed. He nearly quit when one of the very first courses was very difficult but we negotiated an agreement to move forward with my help with the course work. He remained in the CMIN project and is a graduate.

The relationship of being a Canadian, an expatriate in Kenya meant that my work permit was granted on the basis of a request by the Africa Brotherhood Church and so could also be revoked by the Kenyan government if the ABC wished and requested that I leave. Going to Kenya with CBIM meant being willing to make a commitment to stay in Kenya for a full term (usually three or four years) before returning to Canada. It is more than a tourist trip and you are always aware of being a guest in another culture no matter how well you know the language(s) and the cultural traditions.

Being a participant-researcher again is a dualistic role. As I entered into the life-world of the participants, yet allowed for "distance and objectivity" I held these roles in creative tension.. Perhaps because of the situated perspective or multiplicity of roles that I was privileged to encounter, there is a possibility that my eyes can catch a vision which would move beyond one situated neutrality. From the communities in which I lived, worked and researched comes the situated knowledge that these split roles or "selves" allowed me to vision. I see what Donna Haraway suggests.

> The split and contradictory self is the one who can interrogate positionings and be accountable, the one who can construct and join rational conversations and fantastic imaginings that change history. (Haraway, 1989, p. 586)

The research is a lived experience within the context of friends, colleagues and family. It is to that extent a personal incursion into the lives of the participants and it is written and restoried by me as a participant-researcher knowing that I will continue to have a personal relationship with most of these people. Clandinin (1993) states that the researcher-participant is not only writing his or her own experience but must remain in the life-world of that experience and "live out the experience". This is my experience as the theology of Kenyans and Canadians find shared ground through the intersection of our lives.

CHAPTER 2

A RESEARCH STORY

Mshale kwenda msituni haukupotea.

(If an arrow goes into a forest it does not mean it is lost.)

> I had a farm in Africa, at the foot of the Ngong Hills. The Equator runs across these highlands, a hundred miles to the north, and the farm lay at an altitude of over six thousand feet. In the daytime you felt that you had got high up, near the sun, but the early mornings and evenings were limpid and restful, and the nights were cold.... Ah, but I am getting ahead of myself in the story. (Dinesen, 1937, p.15)

That was how Karen Blixen, through the movie version, adapted from the book Out Of Africa expressed it so cogently.

Before this research story gets too far along, let me return and lay out the setting and background to this study and the project which it examined along with the methodology and design of the process.

One of the methods of study of education in the Third World is through the use of case studies. The instances are numerous of international projects being designed and implemented because of associations and links based on collegial relationships. There is a need to look more closely at both the successes and the failures of these case studies. Huberman and Miles (1984) say that case studies "are rich and provocative, but they are subject to all the limitations of looking at only one star in a cosmos of galaxies" (p.v). If the case happens to be the closest, brightest or most accessible there is much which can be learned and if it reveals new information it serves as part of the cross section of possibilities by which assessment can be made.

> First of all, there is a need for new and far more ambitious efforts than we have had to date to generate case studies of innovation which are useful both for the researcher and the practitioner...In addition to case studies, there is probably also a need for a few experimental projects. (Havelock & Huberman, 1977, p.20)

In the sphere of aid project education and case reports often only the positive gets reported. As is stated above by Havelock and Huberman there is a need for more case studies to be presented. A case study which is based on an experimental project avails itself of the opportunity to look at innovative possibilities in the hands of practitioners. The researcher using case studies has the opportunity of drawing out both the potential value and the detractions from the case. More concretely, methodological insights can be drawn from studies on North-South educational aid and exchange programs. This study, it is hoped, is such a case.

The Case

Background

Both the Africa Brotherhood Church (ABC) and the African Christian Church and Schools (ACC & S) are independent, indigenous East African church bodies. Each of these Kenyan church bodies separately approached Canadian Baptist International Ministries (CBIM) for assistance in leadership development. CBIM has treated these two churches independently and autonomously over the years of association. Both the ACC & S and the ABC are members of the National Council of Churches of Kenya (NCCK) and are familiar with the other's work. The only common area in Kenya where the two churches have active work is in the city of Nairobi where both denominations have churches.

The ABC constitution lists its two major concerns as "1. Evangelism and 2. Social Services; a) education, b) health services, c) rural development" (ABC, 1984, p.2). The ABC has 417 churches representing a Baptized (adult) membership of 143,313 and an attendance membership of 575,000 people. The churches of the ABC jointly sponsor several health clinics, 300 pre-primary schools, 157 primary schools, 27 secondary schools, 19 polytechnical schools, three women's multipurpose training facilities, three Bible schools and one theological school (ABC Report April,8, 1993). The organization is largely controlled by a male dominated Kamba hierarchy (Penwill, 1951) with similar leadership since its inception in 1945. This sectarian body appealed to Canadian Baptists for assistance in leadership development because the ABC was growing so dramatically in numbers that they were experiencing difficulty preparing the numbers of personnel capable of assuming leadership roles.

The ACC & S is a slightly smaller denomination, with 80 churches predominantly among the Kikuyu. The membership and adherents are estimated by the leadership (1993) at approximately 20-25 thousand. The ACC & S sponsor 22 pre-primary schools, 19 primary schools and 12 secondary schools as well they operate one theological school. These are all located within the areas where the Kikuyu are most highly concentrated.

Canadian Baptist International Ministries is the denominational mission arm of the Canadian Baptist Unions and Conventions. Canadian Baptists have 1,100 churches in Canada with a membership and adherents numbering approximately 150,000. The policy of the CBIM is to assist national churches to fulfil their own mandate. Nowhere, outside of Canada, does CBIM plant or develop churches of its own. The role of CBIM in Kenya has been to attempt to fulfil a specific task identified by the host national churches. These tasks are then mutually defined with regard to the numbers of personnel, time frame, expected duties and lines of accountability to the Kenyan church.

In 1976 the ABC asked Canadian Baptist International Ministries (CBIM) to provide leadership upgrading and preparation of teachers and leaders for their system. Canadians were to work under the direction of the Kenyan organization. To facilitate this arrangement a task force agreement was designed with Canadians providing assistance in the form of teaching personnel for a 10 year time period. In 1987 the number of people who had been taught was approximating 200 and the ABC was advocating the selection of two or three men to be sent to Canada for post graduate level education.

At the same time Canadians were beginning to question an increasing (perceived) dependency on the Canadians. Canadian staff was responsible for the major portion of the in-class teaching time as well as the day to day administrative duties at the Divinity School where once Kenyans had done all the work.

> When the Canadians left I felt like someone who had a good friend and the friend leaves. I knew there were rules and laws in our country about people working here for certain number of years. We really think that if they could return to continue the help it would be better. I did not feel they wronged anyone only that they had fulfilled their time commitment. So now we are asking that they consider returning and adding to the teaching, adding another CMIN class and even to add some new studies for those of us who completed the first courses. (KG1 4-7)

The major questions facing both parties were: how do we educate theological teachers and have them legitimated; how do we replace Canadians with Kenyan teachers; how do we ensure that women will also be part of the process; and finally can we afford to do what needs to be done?

> I remember when we were first talking with the ABC leadership about upgrading, the discussion was that there was a need to send a couple of men to Canada for upgrading. There was an expectation that these men would be taught in Canada then return to teach in Kenya. Our experience with bringing students to Canada was that it always men who got to go, and then it takes longer and more money than anticipated. (CP9 10-12)

These questions together with other long term issues such as, cost factors and overall goals of the ABC, were addressed over several months. The dialogue took place between representatives of the ABC and CBIM in an attempt to determine how best to provide upgrading and how to select potential leadership candidates.

Situation

The logistics of preparing people to fill the anticipated vacancies in the leadership and to replace Canadians when they returned to Canada were paramount to both Canadians and Kenyans. It was an ongoing focus of discussion for the ABC and CBIM.

In sending a few select Kenyans to Canada for upgrading there were major issues to be addressed. How would screening be carried out? Who should select the Kenyans? Who would have the opportunity to be included? CBIM did not want to be responsible for the selection because of the danger of appearing to interfere in the autonomy of the ABC, yet guidelines for acceptance into Canadian institutions would be provided as part of any selection process.

Language of instruction was perceived as a further complicating factor as a few of the more senior people would be totally excluded because the instruction was to be English. Mutua (1975) suggests that the policy of English being ever increasingly the language of instruction in Kenya will never be reversed. The elite have been educated in Commonwealth countries in English but the general population is caught between Kiswahili and English (the two national languages) and the mother tongue (D'Souza, 1987). How would the Kenyans function academically in our Canadian institution? Would life in Vancouver, the location of the college to which they would go, interfere with the designed program? None of the potential candidates had even been out of Kenya.

Once these few selected candidates had completed their studies would they return to Kenya and if they returned would they remain with the ABC or would their credential be a step in upward mobility away from the ABC? Again our experience in bringing students to Canada and having them return to their homelands had questionable benefit. We wondered if we were actually facilitating an unintended immigration to Canada. Our experience also had indicated that several people who had returned from Canadian institutions had, after their return, in effect been rejected as outsiders by their own people. They were treated with suspicion for approximately three years before being reincorporated into their former positions. As Canadians were to pay for the process what would be the cost to bring these few individuals (with family) to Canada? Our estimate, at the time (1987), was set at about $25,000.00 for a single person and $49,000.00 for a family for the duration of the study including airfares, housing, tuition, clothing, food supplements and a living stipend.

If the potential candidates to go to Canada were all men, how could women possibly benefit from the process? This created a dilemma. The CBIM Board has supported gender equity policies. Yet working in Kenya we were perhaps imposing a Canadian cultural expectation of gender equity on the ABC, although in recent years, Kenyan women have, like other women in the South regions, been active in promoting gender equity and empowerment. The ABC does ordain women to office in the church and women represented half the African teaching staff at the Divinity School. Would that be the case if only men were upgraded in theological education? How could Canadians finish the task they were invited to undertake and at the same time return all control as well as the continuation of the process of teaching to the ABC?

The ABC was suffering from the effects of dramatic growth which far outstretched the ability to provide leaders. How would it be possible to remove the most capable leaders and send them overseas for several years of study when the leadership was in crisis shortage? Some of the more senior people expressed the caution that leaving Kenya with an aging leadership might disqualify them from consideration if they were out of the country when a transition took place.

> The Bishop was about 70 years old and KD1 and KD2 talked about the probability of either retirement or the unspoken, "death", and what might happen to their chances of being raised to office if they were away when it transpired. That was some five or six years ago and the Bishop is still running the show, so much for that concern. (CP9 10-8)

The younger leaders were all eager to go overseas expressing the belief that the Western certification would prove they were capable of leadership because they had succeeded in Canada. Having been involved with the early stages I recall that Dr. R. Paul Stevens from Carey, the ABC education administrator Rev. Canon S.M. Mangaya and I met to develop some alternate possibilities. One of the graduates of the CMIN explained how they understood this process.

> In accordance with what I understand, there was a teacher we call Nzyoka and another called Paul Stevens during the time with Canon Mangaya. They worked to put it together just as we have it now. At least that is how I understand the history of

> how they built this. I understand they put this all together on a long journey to Kisumu and the return. Out of that came the program we received called the Certificate in Ministry in the ABC. (KG2 2-9)

SELECTED SOLUTION

The project design was an experiment attempting to meet the needs and agendas of several parties. The proposal, presented to both the ABC in Kenya and to CBIM in Canada, was to approach Carey Theological College (Carey), a post graduate degree granting college located on the campus of the University of British Columbia, to offer a post graduate certificate. The courses would be taught over four years by bringing a variety of professors to Kenya for short yet intensive teaching sessions. The ABC would select a full class of candidates, both male and female, who could potentially cope with English instruction. The ABC would provide the classroom space, accommodation and logistics of their own people's attendance. The ABC Divinity School facilities (a rural location) were to be utilized during the normal breaks in the school year for the teaching centre. CBIM would provide the costs of all texts and materials for the students and housing and return transport of the professors, while Carey would provide the continuation of salaries as well as release time for their professors. Because of the difference in school years between Kenya and Canada all the Kenyan classes could be held during Canadian off term sessions. The ABC leadership held discussions with Canadians regarding the types of courses which would be useful. A proposed program was agreed to by the ABC before the proposal was sent to Carey. No change was made to the courses of study from the original proposal. The Senate of Carey retained ultimate control of the program, the course content and the academic standards. CBIM was responsible for all the costs and the ABC retained control of its participants through their established hierarchy.

The program of studies with the ABC involved the completion of nine courses plus an ongoing three year field experience project which was designed to demonstrate the student's application of the course work. Of the nine courses three were taught predominantly in Kiswahili, the remaining six were in English with Kiswahili assistance when necessary. The courses included Pastoral Psychology, Leadership Development and Conflict Management, History of Missions, Equipping the Laity, Personal Spiritual Development, Urban Ministry Development, Preaching and Exegesis and several courses in Christian theology. (See Appendix C, CMIN COURSES) All of these courses were modifications of similar courses within the regular program of studies at Carey. There was also a composite course which dealt with the mechanics of classroom teaching and administrative logistics which was taught external to Carey's credit requirements but required by the ABC administration.

The budget for the entire project was approved by CBIM. It included transportation for all professors, in-Kenya room and board and transportation, materials for students including texts and duplicated material, postage costs, permits, and an allocation of cash to the ABC to assist with student transportation and food. There was also a budget allocation for housing in Nairobi for all the students for the urban development course. An overall project budget for the three years 1988-1991 was approved at $33,400.00. Finances is always an issue for Non Governmental Organizations (NGO) and the value of this program, from a monetary perspective, did not go un-noticed by either Canadian or Kenyan participants.

> I've read most of the stuff that was written and the perception of what we are trying to do, the way I explained it to some people in our church, is that rather than bring third world people over, out of context and educate theologically et cetera. what we are trying to do is, at least contextually, at least work out of the context in which they are going, to be going, to be doing ministry in the long run and therefore rather than bringing people over actually educating them in the place where they will ultimately be ministering. The flip side of doing it this way, I guess, it could be said that it is more cost efficient in that ultimately you get a bigger bang for your buck. It impacts more people for the money. Now that's my understanding. (CP4 1-2)

> One of the things that I think was brought about was the idea that we can not be able to train so many Pastors overseas. We can't take so many to Canada and probably the money that could cost one Pastor (to train) in Canada would train ten here locally. (KA2 3-2)

ISSUES UNADDRESSED

At the time of the CMIN project there were a number of important issues which were not included in the project discussion and yet would become issues for the project.

Kenya, although still largely rural, was exhibiting tremendous urban growth. The city of Nairobi has 2.7 million people and is growing at the rate of 500 plus people per day. Mombasa, the major port in Kenya, is almost 1 million and is growing at about 250-300 people per day. Yet the ABC leadership was almost entirely made up of rural members. Their roots are rural and the church had been attempting to replicate the successful rural model in the city. There were Kenyan members of the project class who had never been to the city prior to the one week class experience built into the course on Urban Mission. All class members went to Nairobi, were housed in a mid-range hotel and each day ventured with group supervisors to see and, to a degree, experience, the extremes of the city. The experience was more than a meeting with the poor, it was rather a transformative encounter (Evans, 1990, p.275). The class went into the worst of the Nairobi slums accompanied by residents of those areas, residents who were members of the two church bodies. These facilitators, with the instructor's assistance, gave a pre-briefing, guided the experience and did an evening follow-up discussion with the entire class. The whole class was also guided into a few settings of the very wealthy. Many more questions were generated than answers provided but potential leaders had the opportunity to see and discuss the great disparity between rich and poor, and rural and urban. The CMIN graduates, as expressed in the following example, recognized the need for a push to work in these growing cities and acknowledged that the task was just beginning.

> The other thing that I do not want to forget is, if it were possible for the next CMIN there is a place in Nairobi which is excellent for teaching and even to sleep, and also in Mombasa we have similar facilities. Next time we should also include a week in Mombasa as well as time in Nairobi and Mitaboni or Machakos. To see the Urban needs in Mombasa, Nairobi, Machakos would help us greatly. We want you Canadians to continue with bringing teaching to us even if we share it with other churches that is OK. (KG1 6-9)

Although the ABC constitution states that there is to be gender equality, the practice is distinctly patterned on old tribal custom and social norms which mitigate against women assuming overt leadership roles. Even among the younger males there is a prevalent domination and control of access to office by potentially capable females. The inclusion of women in the selection process did create a tension which resulted in the refusal of one male to participate. This individual male created further disharmony by stating that the inclusion of women in the upgrading program was a "white man's attempt to take over". This individual was publicly challenged by the Planning Council of the ABC and subjected to social sanction within the denomination and later apologized to the church for his remarks against the Canadians and his female colleagues. The ABC has allowed women to preach, teach and pray in the church since the time it was founded. This aspect of their polity has placed the ABC ahead of a number of the conservative denominations both in Kenya and in Canada. This is not to suggest that there is not a dramatic need for gender equity in the performance of other roles of the clergy such as the leading in worship of the ordinances of Baptism and the Lord's Supper. The actual enrolment in the first CMIN upgrading program was 16 men and 3 women. The Divinity School class representation was for my experience generally three women for each man enrolled for preparation for ministry.

Another issue which was not addressed during the project revolved around the issuance of Western credentials. The graduates of the project would receive a Carey certificate and those who might not succeed at a "Canadian standard" would be issued an ABC certificate. All of the students who completed the CMIN graduated with the Carey certificate. Many of the Kenyans involved expressed a concern over the legitimacy of the Canadian credential offered in Kenya. Was it really recognized? No one addressed the issue of the credential, its source, and its representative elitism. Nor did anyone address the continuation of the presumed domination of the West within a credential market (Dore, 1976; Toh & Farrelly, 1991). The ABC wanted a Western credential for some of its people and Carey was willing to offer its credential with CBIM as funding agency and facilitator. The personal agendas of all three parties (and with the ACC & S, four parties) appeared to find a common solution without addressing the longer term credential dependency problem.

> The one thing I should not forget to mention here is that education is something that is cherished almost everywhere in the world and here in Kenya many people do not terminate their learning by way of choice. Actually they are forced to abandon studies by other dictates or circumstances and so when people come back to study, like these folks have come back to study, the Certificate of Ministry program, the notion that this will also develop their status is also very strong. Even as they grow as servants of the Lord they have another expectation that the church will recognize that they have also grown in education, in understanding that they will grow in performance. So they will want the church to have these considerations for them. Others may be aspiring perhaps to either take higher studies and, its not unlikely, that in a whole group of thirty there might be some who are not very much doing it for the sake of ministry but more so for the sake of their own aspirations. I am not saying this to discourage you. I'm only saying this because it is a reality. People have used situations like this as stepping stones to something else they want to do. We know that ourselves and we care that Carey Hall also knows that this could be the case. (KA3 4-11)

This Kenyan administrator expressed the tension of the students. Those who could not complete their formal education wanted the opportunity to get a credential yet at the same time they wanted the knowledge so they could better serve in the church. It is too early in the process to see how many of the students will only use the opportunity as a a method of gaining access to further "higher" education.

Although there was initial consultation between the ABC and CBIM regarding the course components in the program the reality was that the Senate of Carey in Vancouver had the control and power which it exercised to determine the formal curriculum. The Senate determined the course load, determined the weight of each course, set deadlines and set the standard or quality of work expected. They argued that their accreditation review might be jeopardized if the strictest standards were not maintained. Ajeyalemi (1990) claimed that often the Third World adopts Western curriculum without any modification or contextualization. The CMIN program content perhaps tended to be Canadian in basic orientation. This assumption caused a great deal of stress for the professors involved and on occasion extreme embarrassment from the use of culturally inappropriate material.

> I think all of the faculty and one of them of course more than the others but all of the faculty made enormous goofs culturally. Some they knew about and some they didn't. I see that as a problem in the program, it was partly ameliorated by your presence in three of the four years, it was partly ameliorated by the maturity of the class. A young class would not have told us what was going on. The age group we had by and large told us when they were upset about something, when they didn't understand something or if they were offended by something they often told us. We had a fair bit of that and still do with the ACC & S class but with a young class I don't think we would have got that because they would have had too high a level of respect for their teacher. We did make some cultural goofs. If they were forgiven and were not mortal wounds I would attribute it to first of all to the superb good will and love of the students who were very good hearted towards the professors and the basic good will and good hearted nature of the faculty which was pretty transparent to the students. (CP6 9-1)

A secondary power struggle emerged among the students in the program over the control of the agenda implied by the courses. There were a number of students in the class who wanted instant change. The courses in which content challenged students' accepted view of theology or church polity presented a dilemma for the class. If the intent of the course was an empowerment process then these students wanted to exercise their knowledge for immediate results.

Other students suggested that the theological knowledge needed the test of time before changes could be brought to the way the church operated. This placed the Canadian staff in an awkward position because some of the students wanted to use the Canadians as "foils" to promote immediate changes in their leadership hierarchy. The Canadians saw their task as "working themselves out of a job", leaving Kenyan men and women prepared, upgraded and with a Western credential. They did not feel comfortable, as expatriates, in leading change which might be interpreted as interference or which might be viewed as a recolonization attempt. Canadians believed they were, as Sleeter (1991) would say, assisting "victims of societal problems... but potentially active solvers of their own problems" (p.3) to be empowered to bring about change. All student members of the program of studies had been permitted and encouraged by the administration of the ABC to attend and the students were encouraged by the ABC to attempt to make applications of their course work in their work situations. Several of the class participants felt that the process of change within the ABC would be too slow and tried to push for a more revolutionary approach.

There is a delicate balance between initiating empowerment that allows indigenous peoples to make change for themselves and interfering in the culture and socio-political structures of a people. To be culturally and contextually sensitive implies that the host people's value system and cultural expectations are given a place. Yet at times teaching will clash with these norms and the desire for cultural change becomes paramount. It may be difficult for the "outsider" to evaluate which issues will bring pressure for change.

> A classic example which you may not know about, yes it happened when you were there. When CD held the leadership course with the ABC several people came out of the seminar and said "This pours salt

> in our wounds!" I said "What do you mean?" They said "Now we know how badly we have been treated by all our superiors." We had to immediately shift gears and had to sit down, if you remember, to figure out how this could help them relate better to their superiors and being a lot better to the people under them. That is symbolic, even though we caught that one in the bud. The general impact of what this program does is that they could become dissatisfied with the senior leadership of their denomination. Not necessarily the Bishop in particular but the leadership in general as being superficial, not very competent, not very knowledgable. They will want more themselves which they can't get within their own context. So there was these dangers of these counter processes as we went along. Some of these people would want to go to their denominational head. (CP6 5-2)

This Canadian gives the message that the introduction of the course material promoted the self-generated idea that the Kenyans had been ill-treated by their denominational hierarchy. It was not an imposed concept. The question which does not appear to be addressed sufficiently is, "Does slowing down or *catching in the bud* also constitute a form of interference in the change process?" The Canadians came to the project with the dichotomous tension, wanting to allow the indigenous church the autonomy to continue with its own leadership, focus and style but introducing course content which would cause a rethinking of attitudes and values when applied. At the same time, intercultural sensitivity needs to avoid a monolithic reading of any culture and recognize the diversity of voices and positions within the culture, including structures and relationships of conflict.

SECOND APPLICATION

This project is now approximately half way through its second application, again in Kenya, but with a different tribal grouping. The African Christian Church and Schools (ACC & S) spent time reviewing the project with the ABC and asked if they could have a similar project with some adjustments for their situation. The major changes applied to the ACC & S project version were suggested because of the experiences during the first project and they centre around the core curriculum. The ACC & S asked for a change in some of the courses and were successful in negotiating with the Carey Senate for these changes. The ACC & S felt their church was in need of more understanding of their urban situation and it had less need of cross-cultural ability than had the ABC. The changes to the CMIN program included a second component in Urban Ministry and a Systematic Theology course. The ACC & S also began utilizing, in teaching roles, two of their own Kenyan people who had received Master's degrees (with the help of CBIM) from Canadian Universities. This second project also includes these two Kenyans as additions within the field supervision role. I was present for consultations in the redesign of the project. These consultations included the ACC & S denominational leaders along with the Carey Theological College Principal and Director of the Kenyan CMIN project as well as one on site CBIM missionary.

The Research Problem

This case study analyzes a three-party innovative educational project which is currently being replicated in Kenya. No written analysis was carried out of this sectarian post-secondary relationship prior to this study. There had always been discussions and some personal opinions expressed by a few individuals but nothing was elaborated upon. Only a few questions were being asked as the second application began.

> I've got all sorts of questions; Why would we do this when there are already places over there, African, the Pentecostal seminary, Daystar University? Like do the ACC & S not fit into those places, are we dealing with a pre-rural group of people that are even more un-modern and so, you know what I mean? and therefore, Why wouldn't they have developed a program around or through Daystar or something like that? My, this is supposition on my part, but I'm guessing that we are, we're willing to come to their door and give them free of charge what they want, a North American credential. (CP4 5-3)

There are Kenyan private universities like Daystar, which was established by Messiah College and Wheaton College in the U.S.A., which are in the process of getting Kenyan degree granting status and will as yet not make any exceptions to their entrance requirements. The CMIN participants would not have been granted access to Daystar or similar private universities in Kenya. Canadian credentials were made available to Kenyan students through the CMIN project which brought Canadian professors to the classroom in Kenya.

This research was intended to provide an evaluative and interpretive analysis of the CMIN project. The study attempts to critique the transfer of knowledge using this project as an exemplar. Case study was selected as a methodology for presentation of various aspects of transfer and exchange of theological knowledge, focusing in particular on participant perceptions of project history, project goals, as well as personal and institutional relationships in the project. The research is also an attempt to reflect on the way we do theological education and presents a Kenyan-Canadian project to help us rethink what it means to question the professional knowledge in the theological education context. The stories and responses of all the research participants form part of that rethinking as filtered through the researcher's interaction in the overall project. An attempt has been made to distinguish between the participants operationally in terms of themes generated through the research process. Both common perceptions and complementary perceptions have been codified (Bogden & Biklen, 1992, p.166). Images and metaphors generated by the participants in the interviews as well as descriptive explanations received attention (Lakoff & Johnson, 1980; Chatman, 1990). The quotes from the transcripts of the interviews are included in the research most often because they represent some common theme expressed by a number of participants. This may mean when both Canadian and Kenya participants discussed an issue with several themes not all of the quotes from the common theme were repeated in the text but only a sample. When minority or individual differences surfaced these quotes have been included in the text. The researcher has chosen to "err" in favour of longer inclusive passages rather than a single phrase or sentence of "proof text" extracted from the transcripts. This is an attempt also to acknowledge the researchers personal responsibility to the participants in light of the relationships out of which responses were generated.

Research Questions

The research questions, which are set out below, were used as a guide for interviews.

A. Questions centring around development and education were set to elicit the paradigm(s) under which the participants function regarding development and knowledge transfer. What implications do these answers have for the quality of knowledge transfer through the project?

A1 How do participants of the project understand development,in general terms as well as in the specific Kenyan context and in the context of their professional work?

A2 What paradigm(s) of development and knowledge transfer do the Canadians/Kenyans believe is being utilized in the process?

A3 What knowledge is being transferred and in what directions is the transfer occurring?

B. In order to establish what occurred and what each of the participants contributed to the process and implementation some general questions were addressed. These questions assisted in determining if the project was theory driven, practice driven or driven by some other design process.

B1 How do participants of the Kenyan-Canadian project describe experiences associated with this continuing education, teacher education process, such as orientation, contextualization, implementation and re-entry?

B2 What did the teachers, administrators, and students think they were doing in the project?

Operationally these questions were needed in order to establish not only historic roles and goals of the project but also to establish relationships and the perceived base of knowledge in the transfer process.

C. To what extent did the three-party C.Min. project attain the designed and determined outcomes?

C1 How was the project designed?

C2 With reflection back to any original goals, aims and desired changes, were these goals realized?

C3 To what extent were they met and if not what were the reasons or contributing factors to failure?

D. To what extent were there obstacles and barriers to the initiation and implementation of the project?

- D1 In analyzing the outcomes, were the policies flawed, ill-conceived?
- D2 Were these interfered with by other loosely defined non-linear causal factors such as: language of instruction, finances, false expectations, faulty theory, lack of theory, institutional dynamics, paradigm of development...?

These questions assist in the identification of the institutional relationships both at the personal and the structural level.

E. How do we think more carefully about knowledge transfer, education and development?

- E1 How do we think about professional education?
- E2 How do we think about change, and about change designed for others?
- E3 Who controls the knowledge and education process?
- E4 To what extent do structures and macro level forces impact on processes of knowledge transfer and development?

The interview and probe questions appear in appendix A and were intended as discussion initiators for the interview process. The professors, students, graduates and administrators were asked the same questions. A number of the participants played multiple roles and so the determination of whether the Kenyan graduate would be answering as administrator, graduate or former student became a difficult judgement. It was perhaps better to err on the side of common questions for all than predetermining a role or status to participants. The common questions also allowed for coded themes to surface within the responses.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

> No research paradigm has a monopoly on quality. None can deliver promising outcomes with certainty. None have the grounds for saying "this is it" about their designs, procedures, and anticipated outcomes. (Peshkin, 1993, p.28)

This research was intended to gather both the explicit and the tacit knowledge surrounding knowledge transfer by collecting conversations and personal documents (Spradley, 1979). Operationally all of the interview questions attempted to dig beneath the surface to elicit the embodied knowledge (Clandinin & Connelly, 1985) of the participants. Although the immediate research would appear on first glance to be a snapshot in time, the continuity with the initial project and its second application allowed for a somewhat broader view. There was continuity in administration, professors and agencies which enabled discussion to be reflective. Changes occurring in the project, such as the exchange of courses and inclusion of Kenyans as practicum supervisors, were subject to inquiry. Reflection by the professors and discussion following classroom observation revealed some of the stated, hidden and null curriculum in the knowledge transfer process. For example, the stated curriculum emphasized the leaders preparation by pushing each student to actually read the entire Bible. The hidden curriculum in this area encouraged a plan of action for the personal devotions so the reading could be accomplished. Out of this came a more planned work-day for the Kenyans. The null curriculum, or those areas avoided were numerous, but to cite one example Canadians avoided discussion about multi-party democracy until the Kenyan government began to allow such discussion.

The research involved some document collection, artifact collection of the teaching activities, written reports, interviews, and participant observations of students and teachers. The individual participants who were interviewed were identified by name but are referred to in this study by office, position or role as participant. The transcript excerpts from the interviews are identified throughout this text by coded symbols (CP1 1-5 or KG2 3-1 etc). As was stated in the Preamble (CP#) is a Canadian professor, (KG#) is a graduate of the ABC CMIN, (KS#) is a student in the current ACC & S CMIN, (KA#) is a Kenyan administrator, (CA#) is a Canadian administrator (KD) is a Kenyan disguised identity and (CD) is a Canadian with a disguised identity.

Interview conversations were held, as anticipated, in the classroom in Kenya amongst the current students. The students were all interviewed in an ante-room during non-class time in order to keep disruptions to a minimum. The sample was five students and shorter conversations with five additional students. Their selection was based on availability before classes began. Individual interview discussions were also held with five available graduates of the first phase and shorter conversations were held with five other graduates, which because of their availability included both male and female participants. Selection of the Kenyan graduates who were interviewed was made on the criterion of availability. The availability was partially dependent on proximity of the participants to the ABC Divinity School while excluding those CMIN graduates who were no longer in the field.

One of the graduates who had been anticipated as a participant was contacted by letter, by messenger and through a mutual acquaintance. However, he did not make himself available for interview. The message which was returned, through a third party, was that there appeared to be an embarrassment which had surfaced. The former student, who had refused written advice about a career path choice some nine months earlier, could not face the researcher because of the personal loss of face incurred by refusing the advice.

Professors and administrators were interviewed both in their offices in Canada and, when available, also at the school site in Kenya. The Kenyan administrators and professors were interviewed in their offices in Kenya and in the ante-room connected to the classroom.

Recorded interviews were conducted with eight of the nine Canadian participants. Recorded interviews were held with thirteen of the Kenyan participants and shorter conversations were held with an additional ten Kenyan participants. The researcher spoke with 23 of the 42 Kenyans involved in the two CMIN projects. The individual interviews were between 40 minutes and 90 minutes in duration. The participants interviewed included the Project Director, principals of all institutions involved, professors, and executive staff.

Participant observation of one of the professors who was teaching for the first time in Kenya was conducted in the classroom setting in Kenya. This was a professor who had not taught in the project before and could be interviewed before going to teach. The intent was to observe the professor's attempts to adapt course material to fit the Kenyan setting and to observe the process. Notes were taken on site while mechanical recordings were also made.

The ABC participants were all graduates of the CMIN some two years earlier. The graduates who were interviewed were approximately 40 years of age and are all currently clergy within the ABC. The administrators were over 60 years of age. The ACC & S students who were interviewed were at the mid-point in their CMIN courses and program when they participated in the research. The age range was slightly greater for the students with a range from mid 30's to mid 50's. The students are all active within the ACC & S. However, one of the student participants is a lay person not active in the clergy. The administrators were mid 40's and mid 50's. The researcher was able to interview or have a shorter conversation with all the women who were participants in the CMIN.

Interviews, with all professors and administrators, attempted to elicit the tacit knowledge, policies, and suppositions which were held by the participants regarding paradigms of development, processes of knowledge transfer and their articulation in the Kenyan context.

The subjects who were interviewed for this study were all major actors in this project, and expressed their willingness to give their cooperation in the research by signing a release form regarding the interviews. Their interviews were mechanically recorded and transcriptions of these interviews were made. No recording failures were encountered and transcriptions were begun within a couple of days of each interview. As anticipated, nine of the thirteen Kenyan interviews were conducted in Kiswahili and therefore had to be translated into English. Where these translations into English were necessary, they were done on the basis of "dynamic equivalence" as described by Nida and Reyburn (1981) and Hiebert (1983). That is, the translations were given the speaker's or writer's expressed meaning where the word for word literalistic translation did not do justice to the meaning intended by the speaker. That is, because of a difference in verb construction, article placement, and the placement of relatives and objects the translation is given intended meaning. This applies for example where in Kiswahili the third-person singular pronoun is gender neutral, the "he or she or it" are only present in the translation for English understanding. The translation and transcription was spot checked by two English-Swahili bilingual colleagues.

The transcripts for the interviews reveal three significant issues. The participants who used English for the interview have their conversational language presented in a representative fashion. Conversational language does not appear in the same style that formal written language is placed into text. The transcripts have more closely followed verbal conversation rather than being "fictionalized" for the written text. The difficulty with this chosen procedure is that false starts and grammatical errors are more frequent even for speakers whose first language is English. There were several Kenyans who chose to respond through the interview in English. The transcripts have attempted to reflect the tone and pace of the interview. The Kenyans who chose to have the interview conducted in Kiswahili presented the transcription with a secondary issue. There were occasions when phrases and portions of the participant's sentence was in English, embedded in the Kiswahili. These have been retained in the transcript exactly as they were spoken. English was transcribed as it was spoken, Kiswahili was translated and therefore its grammar appears somewhat "sanitized" when set beside the English spoken word. When words were added for the sake of meaning to the transcripts in either language they appear in parenthesis (meaning added).

The interviews were "flexibly structured" (Whyte, 1979) with open ended questions used to elicit a conversational response. At times the participants talked about their experiences in the CMIN with a great deal of gesturing and animation expressing the emotional aspects which words alone would not convey. In a couple of instances the mechanical recording device records table slapping as punctuation. The expression of emotion was evident for both Canadian and Kenyan participants.

As it had been anticipated there was an extent to which insight and intuition helped to facilitate the establishing of "recurring patterns and themes which pull together a lot of separate pieces of data" (Miles & Huberman, 1984, p.216).

This was found to be the case. The themes exhibited themselves as mutually corroborative enabling patterns to be drawn from the responses. As Miles and Huberman state, people are meaning finders and plausibility and intuition are pointers used to initiate preliminary themes and patterns. The use of clustering is appropriate in drawing together organizing processes, individual actors and events. "Clustering is a general name given to the process of using and/or forming categories...sorting of things- events, actors, processes, settings, sites into categories and can also be seen as a process of moving to higher levels of abstraction" (p. 218). The themes and recurring patterns were identified and written into a tabulation file which allowed for the visual identification of the codes used to identify Canadian and Kenyan participants who had used these similar themes.

All participants, Canadian and Kenyan, were very cooperative in their time and willingness to participate in the interview process. None of the interviews seemed to be rushed and with perhaps only three or four minor exceptions, such as a knock at the door or phone call, all interviews were conducted without interruption. Canadians treated the interview very much as a cooperative task, which in all cases followed an appointment schedule.

It should be noted that the Kenyan elders who were participants treated the interview experience as more than a task. It was an event, like other important social situations, which permitted an airing of a personal story. The Kenyan participants did not take the interview experience lightly, it was an important part of the CMIN process.

> Thank you, I am happy that you interviewed me and to know what we are doing here because if you

> don't interview me or there is nobody who has concern about what we are doing sometimes we can feel as though we are doing a bad job. But now that you have interviewed me I feel alright. Now I would like to tell you to have that courage to interview as many people as possible and if not, to question them another time. (KS4 5-5)

The concept of elder in Kenyan culture carries a significance which is not part of the general Canadian experience. The "mzee" or plural "wazee" refers to more than age in the term elder, it carries a respect which is associated with cultural knowledge or wisdom (Kayongo-male & Onyango, 1984). The elder is someone who has earned the respect, perhaps through the years but always through experience. This parallels the work on narrative enquiry of Connelly and Clandinin (1990) "Deliberately storying and restorying one's life or a group cultural story is, therefore, a fundamental method of personal and social growth: it is a fundamental quality of education" (p. 24). My experience has been that today's formal education does not correlate with the Kenyan "status" of elder, experience and its expression determines the inclusion of the individual around the Kamba "thome" (the seat around the fire of the elders). An interview with a Kenyan elder itself comes as a challenge in cultural understanding, and not necessarily because of the language difference. The simple question, "Why did you enter the Certificate in Ministry (CMIN) project?" would, to a Western mind-set, bring a response of a sentence or two. Why then for a project in the 1990's does the Kenyan's answer begin in grade school, in 1972? The story-telling of the elder interweaves the present with the reality of the past. We could not be today either, who we are, nor where we are, were it not for those unique inter-lacings that draw through our strands of life.

> For me I will tell you without a doubt since a long time ago it has been my desire for education. Since the time God called me to the ministry '72 I was still in grade school but I knew I wanted to study more. First I learned to read in other languages and when I was in secondary school I succeeded well enough to receive an invitation to go to Bible school. So when I began my Bible schools studies in 1975 I also got an opportunity to go to the University but I could not afford it.
>
> The call to serve God allowed me to continue some studies which I have used in the ministry. As I continued in the work I realized that I really needed some further upgrading in order to be more effective. So I knew that if I could get some more knowledge it would be important. So to enter into the courses has given me the opportunity to improve my personal knowledge so I could help others. But the studies I have done are not over, it is not yet enough.
>
> When I had been younger I was given the opportunity to enter the college but because of our poverty I failed to get enough money to go on for those studies and so I prayed for a chance to get more education. When I worked I continued to pray for more opportunities to learn.
>
> When those first (Canadian) missionaries came to work with us, Van Nie, Legassie, Bannister they came with a goal to help up-grade us. So the Bishop allowed a group of us to go into a special upgrading course. That course helped me a lot and it certainly was an answer to my prayers. But because we studied under a great deal of hardship, I still wanted more because that original desire to study was not removed. So when the other missionaries came with the CMIN I knew that God had answered my prayers. I told my wife that God had answered my prayer specifically because I was selected to go into the CMIN.
>
> The door we entered to learning in the CMIN was wide. We learned to understand the Bible so much better. I understood that God had called me to help my people so much more than I had been doing. Even though some of the studies were difficult I realized the benefit of the courses was not for me personally but to be shared with other people. (KG3 2-5)

There are instances in the interviews where the personal narratives of the Kenyan participants formed the basis for their answers. This occurred in instances where the present (in a Western sense) was so linked with the past experience of the participant that past and present had to be linked into a narrative. This was particularly the case with elders whose life story "is who they are", that is, the life experience is the very essence of the speaker's daily reality (Kieti & Coughlin, 1990). Therefore the responses to some of the questions take on a life of their own in the conversation which they generate and are included in their more complete form (seemingly at length to Western readers) to preserve the speaker's integrity of meaning. Because of the nature of oral tradition some of the responses to questions do contain secondary support for other questions in the interview process. In an effort not to discredit any voice these responses were allowed to act in corroboration with the primary answers given during the interviews.

In keeping with the nature of oral tradition the stories and narratives of the participants have been respected and the integrity of the telling has been maintained. This study allows the responses to stand and yet they are subject to critical reflection and analysis.

CHAPTER 3

KNOWLEDGE FOR WHAT?

Kila mwamba ngoma, ngozi huivutia kwake.
(Every drum-maker stretches the skin towards himself.)

> Now these are questions I wonder about like, I wouldn't ask those questions if I hadn't been there twice before, and I saw those places. And if they are there, why are we copying things again, like is it just another, I wonder sometimes if we are just feeding some egos, even some (CD) egos, like I don't mean like individual people as much as I mean we have, we are so unique we have this to offer you etc, etc, etc... Was Fuller's model better, like the Mission school where they would bring people over they'd train them and then they'd go and set their own schools up in the counties they came from, I don't know. Those are questions that run through my mind, tap into that. (CP4 5-5)

Like the response by this Canadian professor, both Canadian and Kenyan participants responded to various questions surrounding the CMIN project and its relationship to development. The only painful factor involved in this interpretation is the limited ability of printed pages to reflect the passion in a voice, a gesture of subtlety, a facial expression or gesticulation. If there were some means by which these could be related they would be included as they would impact a credence far beyond words.

MODERNIZATION

This Canadian's statement, made before participation in the CMIN, perhaps confirms the perceptions held by many of the writers who speak about the domination by the North of knowledge.(This respondent expressed a slightly altered opinion on the direction of the flow of knowledge after they had participated in the CMIN project.)

> We come in with a modernization model, trying to bring the Africans up to running speed with us, but in doing so we create, we aren't empowering, we're, by giving the credential from Canada, we are making them dependent on us, at least for the interim, for the three or four years it takes to get through. Which says that what we do and give is better than what they could do. And it reinforces as fact that we have something to give which they don't have for themselves. (CP9 5-2)

Modernization theories are descriptive, focus on the differences between two polarities and are primarily Western based paradigms. These dualistic theories do not necessarily identify the means or methods by which movement along the process of modernization can be facilitated and are critiqued (Mazrui, 1968; Amin,1974) as Eurocentric, somewhat linear and teleological. The stages through which a society must pass are identifiable with some end goal which is possible to attain. Often the end or goal is some ideal type, to which all societies will inevitably stumble, defined in European/Western terms.

Toh (1980) suggests that the modernization paradigm presents three major thematic directions. The first is that the Under-Developed Countries (UDC) can and should be able to follow the same path that the Developed countries followed. This development path can move the UDC from its original/natural state along the path to advanced capitalism. The second theme suggests that the lack of development, or under-development is because of some gap or shortfall in specific characteristics of the UDC. The third theme discusses the role that the advanced,industrialized countries play in actively promoting, fostering, delaying or retarding the development of the UDC.

Leys (1980) would suggest that modernization theory was really the elaboration, by Talcott Parsons, of Max Weber's thesis of change from "traditional to modern society". "Modernization then referred to the process of transition from traditional to modern principles of social organization" (Leys,1980, p.333). Larrain (1989) says the modernization theories "seek to explain the process of development as a transition between two models or ideal types, the traditional society and the modern industrial society " (p.11). If modernization refers to a process then it could be tested empirically by manipulating input into the variables to determine if development then occurs. "Some researchers concentrated on a search for the 'solvent' or pushing force which could propel the 'takeoff' into modernity" (Eisenstadt, 1974, p.234). Rostow (1960) would hypothesize about the economic development stages which would stimulate movement up the evolutionary development path.

> In order to participate in world economic relations, either as efficient producers and exporters of crops and materials, or as consumers of Western industrial products and technology, or both, the underdeveloped countries now needed to travel speedily from the Stone Age to the twentieth century; they needed to modernize. Economic development theorists were the first to put the finger on the intricate interaction between economic and socio-cultural factors in economic development, and soon sociologists jumped on this profitable intellectual bandwagon, ready with prescriptions to fill in the 'missing links' of development. (Hoogvelt, 1982, p.116)

Modernization theories are criticized for their failure to give empirical evidence to reveal the differences between "modernizing" and "traditional" nations (Baran,1957; Frank,1967; Wallerstein, 1974; Hoogvelt,1982). "Some critics challenged the basic validity of the tradition-modernity dichotomy, and the supposed ahistoricity and Eurocentricity of the initial model" (Eisenstadt, 1974, p.238). These writers established what is referred to as the Critical paradigms in order to view under-development from a Southern perspective.

Critical theory suggests that under-development is part of the economic chain reaction in the global economy. The economies of the periphery (South),though interacting with both local and global forces are dependent on the economic structures of the North (Centre) and can not on their own break the dependency relationship.

Amin (1974) developed the theory of "unequal development" in order to explain how dependency theory could be extended to account for what he saw as unexplained realities in the third world. In his critique of the theory of underdevelopment, Amin says there is a vicious cycle trapping the third world nation in peripheral capitalism. There is unequal development which by its direction from the centre produces an unequal specialization in the world economy. The unequal specialization in turn leads to an unequal development and the African society is trapped in a pattern of diminishing return relative to the dominant capitalist economies.

Gutierrez (1983) has been critical of theorists who suggest that modernization or development models will serve the needs of the Third World. He would suggest that only liberation from the economic oppression and dependency of the current world order will change the possibility for the poor.

One of the Canadian professors who was preparing to go to teach in Kenya was very concerned with the possibility that the CMIN project only perpetuated the old forms of knowledge control which were derived from modernization theory.

> Now in terms of what we are educating them about, that's where I have a question, because I have a great fear when I look at some of the curriculum, that basically we, we are using a curriculum kind

> of model that fits North America, but doesn't necessarily work in training, in making more effective ministers. That we're basically using curriculum and a content level that I'm not so sure is needed in that place. I'm not, and this isn't because I'm teaching this one, but it would make more sense for them to do stuff on contextual issues - it would, like - urban issues (be)cause that's one of their (problems) -, but when they are doing the history of missions, and things like that, as one of their core courses, I don't even understand that. You know, in terms of a core curriculum that they needed to (do it) - and, How would they teach it is one of the questions I had too, from what perspective as a good or a bad thing, in terms of no -.
>
> At one level it makes sense for me and at another level, I'm not so sure there's been as much critical thinking about the content of what needs to be taught. And it's my understanding, and you know better than I do, its pretty typical of us to kind of just take over what we are doing here, whether we're doing it well or not and just kind of reproduce it there. I'm not so sure that the theological method , theological training method in North America is , is one to transfer, but that's - that's, I don't know. (CP4 2-1)

This professor was concerned that we could further burden the Kenyans with models and knowledge which were not appropriate to the situation. Was the CMIN project really based on an antiquated theory of modernization?

Modernization theories appear to fail in their task because they give the impression that all societies should Westernize and take on the conservatism of Western social science and at the same time overlook any culpability of the West for the current problems in the Third World. This failure to acknowledge the West's actions were addressed by the critical paradigms. Perhaps imperialism and colonialism were based on evolutionary theory, perhaps racism, or paternalism but the result was the same. "All the models, whether left-wing or right-wing, have been based on Western preconceptions. The indigenous cultures of the people of the Southern World have been largely neglected" (Verhelst,1990, p.22). Perhaps the neglect of the indigenous cultures does not have to be the nature of the process of modernization.

The Eurocentric world view espoused that the West had developed and advanced because of its knowledge. Europe was able to colonize and control the South. The Northern view was that the modern, developed nations had something which was superior and provided the justification for direct colonial exploitation of labour in Africa. Initially, the only knowledge which needed to be transferred was that which assisted the metropol, or colonial powers in resource exploitation. It was a "human capital" process in its most elemental form. "The education provided for the colonized was geared towards meeting the economic need for suitable manpower in the colonies" (Bacchus, 1991,p.92). Later, in colonial history, there would be a need to produce managerial and bureaucrat cadres and to modernize the economies. This required a more academic process yet it was still all geared towards a human capital theory and there was a transfer of somewhat expanded technical knowledge. Rodney (1972), in How Europe Underdeveloped Africa, says that the main purpose of the colonial school system was to train Africans to help staff the local administration at the lowest ranks and to staff the European owned capitalist firms with labourers.

The newly independent nations believed their need for enhanced human capital and so "they continued using the metropolitan models of education as the basis for expanding their own services...the whole purpose of the education provided, tended to remain essentially unchanged" (Bacchus, 1991, p.103). Human capital theory, legitimized by western economists (Harbison and Myers, 1964) who pushed for the rapid expansion of education, was believed by the South to be the answer to development needs. The human capital theory being a Western economic model of modernization takes little account of the cultural and ideological foundations of traditional African society. It permeates through economics to impact most educational structures and systems. "It is with the realization of the power of knowledge that many developing nations have invested heavily in education" (Mbiti, 1981,p.65). The new nations had acquired the internal independence to determine what knowledge was to be legitimated in their school systems, but the North had succeeded in giving the message that knowledge transfer needed extensive human resources. There needed to be educators with a high quality and efficient product for the country to modernize rapidly. Most south countries saw human capital as essential for development and education was the path promoted, by the capitalists, for the south's progress. "Education is seen in such societies (south) as a route to all things"(Carnoy & Samoff, 1990, p.7).

Education is a labour intensive sector of the economy and needs extensive human resources in the form of staff for classrooms, administration, teacher education and support staff. These resources are required to raise the quality and efficiency of the educational product and, secondly, there is constant pressure for education to be relevant to the society. In order for the work of education to continue there is a requirement for skilled, trained and educated resources. In the case of much of Africa there is a perceived need to enhance the skill and education level of educators in order for the human capital supply to serve the needs of education.

Jones (1984) suggests that knowledge is both an historical and a social process,

> because knowledge is socially distributed it necessarily follows that *access* to knowledge is also socially distributed. As a result of this social distribution, certain forms of knowledge, either accidentally or with deliberation, *accrue* to certain areas, strata, groups or individuals within the social system. (p.91)

Unfortunately many African nations attempt to have their educational shortfalls enhanced (or curtailed) by the importation of foreign, usually Western, technical aid packages. Susan George states that this is usually disastrous, "the worst course a UDC (Underdeveloped country) could follow was to purchase technical packages leaving no freedom of choice in combining modern foreign-supplied inputs with traditional, indigenous elements" (George, 1976, p.111). Verhelst (1990) supports this view.

> Development projects in Black Africa often fail because they set up exogenous structures and try to introduce goals which are alien to tradition and to the local perception of needs. (p. 27)

Arnove (1980,1982) is extremely critical of international advisors or consultants. He suggests they represent a form of neocolonialism by continuing the foreign domination of peripheral nations. Berman (1979) and, Fry and Thurber (1990) write that most international advisors hold to a dependency theory of development. The result is that the aid and development packages are designed with the centre interests placed above the periphery. Does this need to be the practice for all aid?

Perhaps this case study and the model which it represents can ask some questions and the answers might begin to provide the discourse necessary to suggest the change that is needed and wanted by some in the south. The suggestion in the quotation that follows is that a start has been made by at least one Canadian CMIN administrator to think about the periphery,in this case Kenya, above the interests of the West.

> In terms of a certification program, hopefully what you are doing, and Kenya is our most immediate one, going there, from my point of view, hopefully this certification program is going to produce or develop, if you like, people who are going to become the leaders of, in this case the

> ACC & S primarily with Kikuyu, so that they on their own can redevelop this for themselves. They get ideas about what leadership development is all about, how you can go about it. If you do not do that, if you do not leave them with the tools to contextualize for themselves, even though it is within their own culture, then you are not going to help them. I do not know the culture well enough. I blow in there for a week or ten days and there is no way that I know it. I do not even know where I am. I can only hope that the principles of the development process, of the certification program, helps them to redevelop. Then, in terms of their own culture, that they learn to contextualize and then develop their own leadership then at some point. That is what I hope for, that we are doing something along those lines. I guess it fits the principle, the ideas I had for development as such, which are developing in the certification program, is hopefully, developing leaders who will stay there and will enhance the church in some way through that project. (CA2 1-4)

The project is ongoing and feedback has been received. If we listen to the dialogue between a Kenyan student and the researcher perhaps there is a bit of hope that there was an attempt made to bring knowledge for change which could be ongoing for the Kenyans with whom the Canadians had contact.

KS3: What I want to say is " this class we have, when it ends we don't want it to stop there" we want it to help others. If we include others in this course work we will be able to assist our country as a whole. If we stop only with this class then people, when they retire, will reduce our strength to work and won't continue with strength.
Now I want to ask you a question. You began with the ABC what language did you use?

Nzyoka: English, but because I was in the class I could translate whenever there was a problem to understand.

KS3: English is not a problem, but I have talked with you in Kiswahili because it is easier for me to communicate in Kiswahili. The other thing I want to know is if the ABC has finished the CMIN ?

Nzyoka: Yes, they completed their certificates and then the ACC & S wanted a program. But we said we would have to wait a couple of years before proceeding again.

KS3: Is it because of the students or because of the tutors?

Nzyoka: Because of the availability of tutors.

KS3: I want to know when our class finishes will it mean you will leave us in the ACC & S and return to the ABC or will you go to another church, AIC or someone.

Nzyoka: At this point I don't have an answer to that question.

KS3: Why don't you select 20 students from the ACC & S and 20 students from the ABC and then find a place where you can bring them together and teach them together. Then you could really begin to see the fruit. That fruit has to grow and it must be fruit which continues to flourish and not to end.

The suggestion is that development and change will come about but the tiny core of people prepared for the work are insignificant given the task at hand. While the periphery, Kenya, receives the perceived benefit and this Kenyan suggests further efforts should be added to the development of human capital. If sufficient people are educated then the tasks needed to be accomplished could potentially be undertaken and the development of greater numbers of people would be ensured.

DEVELOPMENT

The definition of the term development and the meaning of the concept are as varied as those who have vested interests in the process. In an attempt to come to an initial understanding of the meaning of development there are some key concepts to be discussed. It is important to understand that the need for development implies some concept of underdevelopment. There are definitions of development provided by economists, colonial and paternal benefactors, sociologists and political scientists and there are definitions provided by those who do not know liberation and empowerment. These definitions which come from armchair academic activity only feed the authors and without sustainable development there is no real change in the lives of those who are hungry, thirsty, ill, illiterate, or living in abject poverty, injustice and oppression.

The CMIN program was intended to be an educational project which would impact the clergy and lay-people of a small denomination who would in turn be able to impact the communities from which the leadership was drawn. The participants in the CMIN, though in positions of leadership in their churches, would not be considered members of Kenyan elite groups. They are marginalized because they are indigenous church bodies not within the traditionally recognized denominations such as the Roman Catholics, Church of Province of Kenya (Church of England) or the African Inland Church. The career choice, or call to ministry among the poor is not financially rewarding nor seen as a position with prestige. Development and education can be linked when the goal of the education is to transform the environment, the perspective or the knowledge of an individual so the individual is empowered to integrate change into their own life and then into their community.

The definition of development in totally economic terms still exists in some quarters; however, a more encompassing view has begun to emerge. On their own, the influx of capital or the education of a population did not seem to bring about the development desired or planned by those determining the progress to modernization. It became apparent to many that more was involved in development than economic issues, there were cultural and societal issues as well. One of the initial viewpoints of development as more than purely economic was enunciated by U. Thant at the start of the United Nations first decade of development. "Development equals the sum of economic growth plus social changes" (Goulet, 1971, p.xiii). There was more to development than Gross National Products and values of exports. "development is an achievement that represents not only material but also a cultural and psychological uplift of man" (Ishumi, 1976, p.5). If all that changes is the economy, humans are omitted from the formula for development and as Ndegwa (1985) states, "the main agent of development is also its only beneficiary that is, man" (p.i). Conyers and Hills (1984) wrote "Development is conceived as a state of human well-being rather than as the state of the national economy" (p.27). It is only with a more holistic view of development that underlying issues begin to be addressed. Rodney (1972) said that any definition of development also had to account for "concepts of class, imperialism, role of workers, oppressed peoples" (p.20). President Nyerere of Tanzania stated: "there are more things in life than the amassing of riches, and...if the pursuit of wealth clashes with things like human dignity and social inequality, then the latter will be given priority" (1968, p.316).

The Africa Brotherhood Church had placed into its constitution in 1945 the need for development in which social services were to be a particular focus of its "mission". The ABC defined its social service in terms of "a) education, b) health services, 3) rural development" (ABC, 1984, p.2). Theologically this ties in with the church's belief that the message in the Christian church is beyond only the spiritual and must also concern itself with the physical conditions of the people. The church employed a full time Development Officer who had completed a certificate in development studies in the Philippines. His development principles do not appear to be Western but take on much more of the emancipatory feel arising from locally based needs. Mukwilu (1988) states that he follows five key steps in development which initiates self-supporting activities. These steps are 1) Gaining acceptance and confidence of the community, 2) The Community identifies and prioritizes their own needs, 3) The community sets its own realistic goals, 4) The community decides on how the goal is to be accomplished and 5) The community plans the project together. (p.6) The Divinity School had as one of its course requirements a course in "Maendeleo" (development education) which included components of; reforestation, agriculture, primary health care, communication for community development, building construction, accounting, community needs assessment skills, water and soil conservation and cooperative development. In a team teaching situation with Kenyan counterparts I actively taught some of the "Maendeleo" components. The students and I were engaged in some practicum experiences which included the design, costing, ordering and physical construction of several buildings including a food storage unit, classrooms, bridge, water cisterns, irrigation system, toilet facilities, tree and vegetable nurseries as well as experimenting with "new" crops.

> The ABC vision, Mukwilu explains, is the Christian vision of human development which has at its heart the goal of enabling the poor to take charge of their own destinies so that they might achieve the fullness of life intended by their creator. (Stelck, 1988,p. 5)

The ABC actively involved itself in promoting women's cooperatives centred in most of their rural churches but open to all women in the community. The ABC invited CBIM to provide assistance with nutrition and home science education, reforestation and primary health care teaching. Each of these components was focused on preparing ABC leaders to carry this work without the on-going presence of Canadians.

The ACC & S along with CBIM was actively involved in the resettlement of Somalia peoples in North East Kenya. This included the development of housing, communal farms with irrigation, water resource development and the construction of community schools and clinics. The operation of schools, clinics and technical training institutions is part of the regular activity of the ACC & S.

Both the ABC and ACC & S have been slow to make any transfer of "rural development" into the urban setting. As will be discussed later these two churches were initially rural churches and have only recently been pressured to evaluate their roles in the city.

The CMIN respondents defined development in a variety of ways. Common amongst almost all of the responses was the basic theme of improvement or uplifting. The terminology utilized was somewhat varied yet was consistent in its intent, development only exists for the benefit of those who are in need. The theme of improvement was articulated by terms such as "to help people", "to lift them up", "to benefit", "to uplift", "to improve the conditions of", "to better their life", "to proceed", "towards a meaningful life" and "to improve".

> then by doing that they receive a benefit themselves which lifts them up a little more. (KG3 1-2)

> Development in other ways would be how we could be able to bring a better life to the people. (KA2 1-2)

These terms were used by 20 of the respondents. The remaining individual did not contradict the theme of improvement but rather couched the definition in other terms. This respondent defined development as "teaching that emphasizes the importance of self-support." In that self-support was viewed as positive, then it could be assumed that development was defined by all participants as having a concept of positive improvement as part of its essence. This improvement was seen both in concrete physical terms such as food for the family, freedom from cold and the deprivation of material goods such as clothes and housing, and also as an expressed view that improvement in education was a major component of development. Development education must be utilized both as the process to development and as the product which development would assist in empowering, and uplifting. When education is used in the process of development then the potential for self-support is enhanced because the individual, through the empowering education process, gains in both the awareness and potential for self-sufficiency. Attitudes and skills are seen as being obtained through the education process and can be empowering for the individual and through them to the larger community.

The term sustainable development implies that development is to be seen as a process and not just an end. Goulet (1971) says "development designates simultaneously two realities: a terminal condition and a process" (p.333). Sustainable development must begin with the people who wish a change in their environment, whether economic, social, or political. The ownership of the change must belong to those who will carry the burden of responsibility for the change. There must be participation by both those who bring change and those who must live with the results. Sustainable development includes issues of social justice, including equity of resource distribution, human rights, political democratization, and environmental care. It must be participatory and reflective of the local cultures of the people involved. Technology, institutions, values and behaviours introduced must be in harmony with both the ecological and social realities of the people and the environment.

Sandbrook (1985), talking about sustainable development suggested donors avoid development assistance to governments and go directly to the people who should receive the benefit of the assistance. Webster (1984) suggests that self-reliance is imperative "so that rural and urban workers can regain control over their livelihoods" (p.167). It must also be linked with intermediate and appropriate technology and not a massive industrialization program which only increases the indebtedness of the nation. George (1988) echoes Goulet's earlier suggestion that there can not be true sustainable development until there is a "voluntary austerity in developed countries...which involves some privation in order to overcome the crisis" (1971, p.256).

The Africa Brotherhood Church differentiates between two major types of development work: non-self-supporting and self-supporting.

> Non-self-supporting projects, involving direct aid, are usually set up for a short time in response to a crisis-famine or flood, for instance -to meet basic life needs. Self supporting projects, on the other hand, are based on the need for long-term development and are intended to result in permanent change that does not require outside effort to maintain. (Stelck, 1989, p.6)

The ABC has a clear policy about accepting outside project design and funding in development. There must be an ability to sustain the project after the donor has departed.

> Bishop Nathan Ngala, the head of the Africa Brotherhood Church has stated it this way. "The temptation is there to grab the work, the project, the cash that comes with it, without regard to its continuation. But what is the use if you say to me,'Here is a big gift,' and then, after we carry it together for a short way, you let go and I am unable to carry it myself? It falls by the wayside and remains as I have not developed the ability to carry it myself. (Stelck, 1989, p.6)

The second improvement theme in the CMIN was stated as that of self-support or self-sufficiency. It was cited by 12 of the respondents as part of development. The passion and emotion with which this concept was expressed by five of the Kenyan respondents indicated that self-sufficiency rather than dependency was preferential and indeed an end in itself.

> To teach them to live within their means and by so doing to become ever more self- supporting ... anything which a person might be able to do to be more self sufficient rather than being dependent on others.(KG6 1-8)

> A life that they would be able to view that they are self-satisfying. They are self-reliant, they have got their basic needs. At least, they should have their basic needs. (KA2 1-2)

Eleven of the participants came up with definitions of development which were specific in their discussion of teaching and knowledge and ranged from a focus on the lack of education through teaching people to enhance their trade skills, literacy or life skills and finally to the empowering of people to take charge of their lives. The 11 all stated that knowledge and education were necessary for the uplifting of the people. It would be safe to state that despite the necessity of a critical awareness so that grassroots development could be optimized, no expression of actual or potential dangers of modernization knowledge was given by the participants. The participants seemed to look around and see people in urban slum dwellings, hungry and without jobs or rural people who are in similar conditions yet not utilizing the cultivation potential of the farm they occupy. The responses then expressed the desire and hope that development was meant to glean the positive from education and knowledge for development rather than any negative aspects which could be associated with development.

> The normal citizens of the country of Kenya I see that they are not developing because they have no knowledge about how to develop. The have no knowledge. Many people in our country have so very little education and because they lack sufficient education they do not even produce sufficient crops to feed themselves. The have not enough knowledge even to develop good schools. We have not developed. (KG6 1-6)

> To increase the knowledge of someone about something they could do. (KG4 1-4)

> To bring or rather to teach the people, new things which help them. Things which they did not know before. (KG3 1-2)

> I would see development in terms of training... (KA2 1-2)

> the focus is on transferring the skills that are necessary specifically to organize a community to teach literacy, to bring skills such as trade skills to the people. (CP1 1-3)

Empowering development education moves the individual beyond the limits of technical skills. Skills become tools which may augment personal transformation but in themselves "trade skills" and "training" may only increase productivity and not be liberating. To further emphasize the need for education for development the ABC has implemented a course in their Divinity School for all potential clergy (male and female) which focuses on development. The Development Officer of the denomination teaches three hours each week at the school.

> During the course, the students are encouraged to discover the needs that exist in their own communities, and are taught how to approach them. The emphasis is on enabling communities to solve their own problems. As a first step, the students help the local people identify and list in order

> of priority the needs they feel. Then they act as facilitators to help the community begin to analyze possible solutions for their problems. (Stelck, 1989, p.5)

Out of the courses the students have begun very practical development projects in their own areas. These have included bee keeping, tree nurseries, tie and die groups, basket making, pottery production, craft guilds, water storage facilities, marketing cooperatives and nursery school cooperatives. The denomination operates a teaching farm where students from their institutions, the Women's Desk officers (local coordinators for women's groups) and church members can go for agricultural experiences. The church also operates several tree nurseries and gives teaching sessions in re-forestation. They provide primary health care instruction, nutrition education and water resource assistance. All of this work is under the direction of the church.

Although not as common a theme within the definitions of development, a third theme of development having to deal with the whole individual was raised specifically in the definitions of five respondents. This does not imply that other definitions are focused only on the material. There was, however, a sense in which the responses could be interpreted as saying the body needs to be fed in order for the mind and soul to be responsive. The human condition is affected by the inter-relationship of mind, body and soul. The theological understanding of these students is holistic, therefore development must be holistic as well. This holistic expression of development was enunciated by both male and female participants.

> I think any development that is not involving the whole person, mind, soul and body is not a development... Development, to me, looks at the whole person... (KS5 1-4)

> If we can change the life of the women and make them whole, because they are not complete when they are hungry when they are oppressed when they are not happy. (KS2 1-9)

The second student, following the theme of the need for the holistic approach to development, placed in the definition a passionate cry for development to focus on women. Despite the fact that at no point in the study or the interviews was there any attempt to explore gender differences in their vision or perception of development issues, contemporary analysis of development can not avoid including the issues of women and development. The response from these students certainly parallels the overt theological perspective enunciated by emancipatory theology. This female student has a response which was expressed with passion and is entitled to a full hearing.

> I may be wrong but I may be right. But what I define it is to make the people improve their conditions from their homes for example. We think because our women are very poor and the children also are poor and also our people, if we could make these people able to support themselves a bit I count that as a sort of development. Sometimes we help them how they can grow crops in their homesteads to sustain the family. I think when they don't go to buy food from the market and they have food there it is a sort of development. If we can change the life of the women and probably make them whole, because they are not complete when they are hungry when they are oppressed. When they are not happy then I think we can't develop people who are hungry, and who are oppressed, they can't have anything. I don't know if I am correct about development but we try to make these people to grow from their homes and outwards. (KS2 1-9)

In Kenya, where the United Nations' Decade for Women Conference was held in July 1985, women still struggle with questions about "tradition" and gender roles. Harden (1990) criticized Kenya for refusing gender equity changes in its laws. Parliament rejected a bill which would have allowed women the right to object to a second wife in the marriage.

> The bill also said: "No spouse shall have any right to inflict corporal punishment on the other." Parliament shelved the bill after declaring it "un-African". (Harden, 1990, p. 107)

The 1985 Conference estimated that in Africa the farm labour contribution by women was between 60 and 80 percent of the total agriculture production. The modernization of Kenya has encouraged men to migrate to the cities leaving more of the rural un-mechanized labour to the women. Men move rapidly into the technological labour market and prevent women from acquiring these skills (Harden, 1990).

At the ABC Divinity School in Mitaboni, there was a two to one ratio of women to men in the preparatory course for the clergy. At the school all students shared equally in all work, food preparation, cleaning, field work, construction, courses and clerical jobs. However, when ordination day arrived for the class the student interns were ranked for placement in the procession. This ranking regarded the traditional hierarchy as appropriate for entry into the church sanctuary. The order was Pastor, Evangelist, (both men's ranks) then Deaconess, Sister and Miss (the women's ranks).

> My observation was that the women in the church did 90 percent of the work. The Sisters and Deaconesses were absolutely indispensable to the continuity and continuation of the denomination. I remember being at a men's meeting where the discussion surfaced about what the women had done in the church. The leader said the women had built the two story women's multi-purpose buildings in both Machakos, and Mombasa, they had bought a bus, their women's meetings drew a total of 60,000 women on that weekend. What the men had to show for all the years in the church was nothing! Men had big talk but they could not produce results. (CP9 12-9)

The women in both the ABC and the ACC & S were active in development. They were attempting to create cooperatives and self-help groups in the rural areas. The women held seminars on a regular basis to help in nutrition education, primary health care, agriculture techniques, and water and food storage methods. Perhaps these Kenyan women had realized they would have to organize their own efforts if they were to experience any possibility for development.

Within the definitions of development there were also some unique expressions of the complexity of the concept of development. The definition given by one of the students expresses the concern for the necessity of adaptations that must be made in a changing and non-static world, yet at the same time development must be directed towards individuals and be person oriented. The society changes around the individual, there are pressures of urbanization, of unemployment, land shortages, and cultural change pressures but it is the individual and the family grouping that have to react and adapt to these pressures.

> Development starts with a person him or herself, I think development starts at home. How one self tries to adjust him or herself to the situation. How he or she can undo problems and how he can have a change in accord with how the world is changing. I think that is a kind of development, trying to find a way to change as the world is changing. That is a way of a meaningful thing to take what is meaningful to uplift the standard of the people, that life of people and also the standard of that person himself who is teaching the development. (KS4 1-6)

This student, while recognizing the potential for being trapped into some functional acceptance of the surrounding pressures of conflict and continued dependency, saw development as a way to empower people to overcome these negative forces.

Two of the Canadian professors described development in terms of goals. These two definitions do suggest a somewhat teleological perspective for development. One of these definitions also included the fourth theme of mutual assistance which meant that two of the Canadian professors placed mutuality as a priority in their definition of development. The goals needed to be mutually determined and the definitions allowed for these goals to include the physical, spiritual and cognitive. The reason why the focus on mutual agreement did not occur in each professor's definition of development was not probed.

> I suppose development refers to the process whereby an entity grows toward some desirable goal, some desirable end. (CP5 1-2)

> I think mutual assistance towards an agreed upon goal. (CP8 1-2)

Mutual decision making was also important for planning and negotiating change in the program and this was stated by six of the professors.

The uniqueness of the fifth theme; empowerment, needs to be specifically highlighted in that it is a theme which recurs in the expressed answers to several later interview questions.

In many other third world contexts, there has been a growth of grassroots development projects and activities which empower the poor and the marginalized to be more self-reliant within just societies. Liberation theology has been a significant force for empowerment.

Liberation theology, which found its origins in Latin America, is claimed by both theologians and critical theorists. Theologians suggest that liberation theology was the response to a push by Pope Pius XI in 1937 to "re-evangelize" Latin America (Maduro, 1987). Other Catholic theologians (Abbott, 1966; Padilla, 1987) are emphatic that following Vatican II, 1963-1965, theologians re-evaluated the gospel in terms of the practical life-world experience of the poor, oppressed and disenfranchised. Some of the Roman Catholic missionaries realized that there was more needed than liturgy. The Church had historically been identified with the rich and powerful and to fulfil the task there was a need to reach the poor, the oppressed and the disenfranchised. Social activism touched on the issues of justice, peace and a rediscovery of the power of change through solidarity, mutual help, local initiatives and common struggles. As Padilla (1987) states,

> The church is of the poor and from the poor, and if all its members have been given gifts for a variety of ministries, then it is only natural to expect that in its mission the church will seek to relate faith to such problems as injustice and poverty, oppression and marginalization. (p.161)

This is not to deny the part played in the modernist project which challenged the perceptions of the enlightenment, nor the part played by political revolutionaries in their critique of the socio-historical meta-narrative. Opoku (1988), an African Theologian, said that the liberation from oppression whether in the form of poverty, injustice, apartheid or other forms of racism, must originate from those people actually involved in the struggle.

> Those outside must not indulge in the luxury of passing judgment from a safe distance. For in the end it is not the method chosen which will decide what happens... it is what its victims do to rid themselves of it. (p.217)

Liberation theology has been much slower to find a place in East Africa, yet it is well suited to the task of people's development or to a basic human-needs approach to development. East African Christianity has largely been Protestant in doctrine and therefore somewhat slower to incorporate liberation theology which appeared to have a Roman Catholic foundation (Mbiti, 1975; Kato, 1985). "Yet on the level of grassroots Christian communities, the breath of fresh air that wafted from Vatican II is stimulating sincere commitment and a genuine spiritual and cultural renewal" (Fabella & Torres, 1983, p.59). The principles of liberation, however, have not gone un-noticed. Bishop Kalilombe (1985) suggested that the theology could have a grassroots support base which could liberate the communities where they grew. He did warn his African colleagues that the liberation of an oppressed people was historically never self-motivated, rather there was almost always a catalyst, a charismatic leader, an educator, or a member of the elite who "becomes an ally of the masses, gets them organized, and leads them into successful projects of transformation" (p.230). He says the African churches of today have the potential for being the change agent.

Parallel to this view of liberation theology, the Africa Brotherhood Church has approached development with very similar attitudes to its mission.

> The ABC's integrated approach to its mission is in part a reflection of the fact that in Africa spiritual and physical needs are often intertwined. In an area where women spend an average of three or four hours each day in search of water, another three or four hours looking for firewood, and the remaining four or five hours of daylight in agriculture and child care, there is no time to spend in the pursuit of a "deeper life... they (ABC) have adopted the statement of the National Council of Churches of Kenya (NCCK) as the basis for much of their own approach: "Development must be people-oriented. Any kind of successful development can never be *for*, but rather must be *with*, people; and all development agencies must seek to listen and understand needs as perceived locally". The ABC vision, "is the Christian vision of human development which has at its heart the goal of enabling the poor to take charge of their own destinies so that they might achieve the fullness of life intended by their creator". (Stelck, 1989, p.4)

Liberation theology is intended as empowering and liberating for the church and thereby also for the individual. There must be a focus on justice, on liberation from exploitation, oppression and suffering. Education which is liberating is pro-active. Although the following definition of development by one of the Canadian professors does not mention the term liberation theology it speaks of empowerment, of liberation and the spread to others of the potential liberation.

> In international work we use the word development to express the empowering of people to take charge of their lives in the total sense of being self sufficient in providing for themselves, in gaining skills and world views and personal confidence to be able to manage their own lives. To take appropriate entrepreneurial initiatives to make something of their environment, their situation with the idea that they ultimately will be able to help other people do the same thing in a people group or country a nation or a church or tribe. Or become stronger, more mature and more self-sufficient. That is how I understand development. (CP6 1-2)

Although the Kenyan participants did not explicitly express the fifth theme using the term empowerment in their definitions, an analysis of the responses indicates that the theme of liberation and empowerment was seen as one of the goals of the project.

> Nzyoka; What do you think were the goals of the CMIN program?
>
> KS4; I think the most important goal is to have a change. They want to liberate us. You know a little knowledge can kill a man. We had that knowledge that we were Christians. We've been working before they came. We've been sharing what we had before they came but they have done a lot to try and liberate our spiritual, no, what can I say, No they try to liberate what we have to empower us to try to utilize what we already have. They are not bringing us anything they are not

> equipping us with something new but they are training us to help us to use the power that we have. (KS4 3-2)

It was interesting to notice that the definitions for development did not include any suggestion of large or small scale state managed projects.

Much of the Third World's equipment acquisitions come through loans or aid. The aid donors and bankers often exercise strong influence in the choice of technology which will be imported. The aid for projects is often coupled to "tied procurement", that is, where the recipient is required to purchase the equipment in the donor's nation. "Aid is given in direct proportion to the need for maintaining a system acceptable to the donor; it is not given to help the recipient achieve economic independence" (Arnold, 1979, p.15). Stewart (1987) suggests that the influence of the aid agencies is often so strong that the project invariably gets saddled with inappropriate technology. This guarantees failure but the debt incurred by the aid remains to be paid and either further costs have to be added in order to correct the previous error or the project is discontinued.

> When a project tries to introduce preconceptions and behaviours that are not consistent with the indigenous culture, it risks not only failure and hence a waste of the time and money invested, but, more serious still, the demoralization of the target population. (Verhelst, 1990, p.112)

The classic Kenyan example of this was the cooperation by the Norwegian government to assist the Turkana people of North West Kenya to settle by Lake Turkana after a devastating drought in the early 1970's. With the encouragement of the various Kenyan ministries a fish plant was constructed for $US 2 Million and a road system to take the fish to Nairobi for an additional $US 20 Million. What no one checked was that the Turkana considered fishing as work fit only for the non-Turkana. The heat of the desert rendered the fish freezing plant inoperative after a few days because there was not enough fresh water to clean the fish and because the diesel fuel requirement for the coolers exceeded the total sale price of the fish. "In the process the fishing project ravaged lake-shore grasslands, split families, forced women into prostitution, and made most *beneficiaries* poorer" (Harden, 1990, p.184).

Many of the nations of the South face severe problems which have over time been exacerbated by the paternalism of the aid industry. In the aid business, misery and hardship have been commodified to the advantage of the West. Where there is need the West can send advisors and costly relief packages and it can appear to be helping the poor. Much of what is given as aid for development and modernization actually goes to ensure that governments in the South survive. In many nations the transfer of military technology and its related knowledge greatly surpasses any development assistance given. The desire is to have a nation stable in its poverty. This is particularly the case when the West has financial investments which it wishes to continue to exploit.

> The theory and practice of development as modernization and catching up have mainly failed in their bid to help the masses of the Third World. On the contrary, they have helped to maintain and even aggravate the often appalling social conditions in which they find themselves. (Verhelst, 1990,p.22)

The accusation has been levelled that much of the Third World Aid really ends up in the pockets of the elite and never reaches the poor. This is more typical of bilateral aid but also is expressed about NGO's as well. Two of the Kenyan respondents spoke in terms of the abuse of development assistance by leaders who see a personal enhancement potential from development.

> Problems enter development when an individual wants to satisfy himself or get personal things. (KG2 1-3)
>
> Some developments that are initiated by the government people look as if it is their (personal) rights and whatever. (KS5 1-4)

The participants spoke specifically about their own personal knowledge of projects which had not been completed and about projects in Kenya which appeared to have only been used to enhance a state official's personal fortune. These responses reinforced the suspicion that there is a basic mistrust by the citizens regarding state controlled development projects.

> Your church gave us money to develop a teaching farm along the river. The money was to be used for clearing the land, building terraces, installing irrigation, fencing and building classrooms, office and a grain storage building. Now, the land was cleared by the students, many got malaria when they were there, the nice water tank was built but no roof was put on it so grass grows in the tank. The office was finished and so were the classrooms but when (person x) was building the store (storage building) then those funny things happened. There was a teacher at the DS (Divinity School) who knew how much buildings cost. He asked why? Why can a mzungu (white-man) buy sand cheaper than down there. The sand, at the river where they dig it was 3000 Kenya Shillings but at Mitaboni he could buy the same sand for 700 shillings. The one building now has a big house, a matatu (bus) and a duka (shop). (KD 5-2)
>
> You know that water line they were putting to Machakos? When the people who were paying for it finished the first part, the big ones (elite) came and said if they wanted to continue the next part the wazungu (Europeans) would have to pay some magendo (bribes) to get the permits. The wazungu refused so the permits never came. Those wazungu took their things and went home and we still have no water. (KD 4-4)

Although these responses gave exemplars of abuse it was felt that they were slightly out of the study referent so the participants disguised as (KD) were not pursued for examples beyond the ones given. However, the experience discussed in (KD 5-2) asks about true partnership where there is mutual accountability in a development project, were all the expectations of both parties articulated as part of the project?

The Kenyan government and many NGO's do however encourage community and people centred development. The "Maendeleo Ya Wanawake" which is Kenya's nation-wide women's development organization is diligent at assisting women's groups to organize in both rural and urban settings specifically for development at the local "grassroots" level. Most of the work that is undertaken in the slums of Nairobi is the product of local people-centred movements which are assisted by NGO finances from other countries. Organizations such as World Vision, Care Canada, Oxfam, Mennonite Central Committee, Lutheran Relief Organization, United Church of Canada, and The Sharing Way, (to name a few Canadian examples) consult with local organizations, churches and communities and provide aid to Kenya.

NGO's like other institutions are not however the sole answer to the problems of the Third World (Korten, 1990; Clark, 1991). These organizations have the potential to reach the poorest of the poor, to be flexible in their approaches and to constantly reflect on the emancipatory process to which they may subscribe. The NGO has the opportunity to empower a cadre of the poor to assume leadership roles. The small project approach of the NGOs is more conducive to community participation than large scale interventions. Clark (1991) explains a number of areas of weakness within the NGO activity. He suggests that the NGO suffers from the same "rhetoric and practice" gap which discusses issues like women and development but fails to address the solutions which these same women suggest (p.63). NGOs are further critiqued for their failure to maintain momentum with the replication of successful models but rather want to be in the forefront of the current development. Issues of accountability, control of resources and willingness to confront world structural issues are difficulties NGOs face. People centred development does not necessarily mean mass people movements but for Clark it does mean that the NGO has to ask if the involvement with the Third World meets the "DEPEND formula, Development, Economic growth, Poverty alleviation, Equity, Natural resource base preservation, Democracy and Social justice" (1991, p. 245). The empowerment and emancipation of the oppressed must be a primary concern of development even for an NGO.

CMIN AS DEVELOPMENT

When the respondents were asked to reflect, by way of comparison and contrast, on the CMIN project and development projects the results were overwhelmingly consistent. Every response indicated either the CMIN and development were "the same", "not different", "not a great deal different", or "only slightly different". All suggested that the CMIN project was indeed a development project. The respondents readily indicated those areas of difference when the CMIN and development diverged.

> As I see it there is not a great deal of difference except when we talk about development we are speaking of those people who are a long ways behind or a long ways below. When we talk about the CMIN it is really aimed at those who are a bit higher up in their ability. So that might be a difference. (KG1 1-8)

> It is not different because it has been taking us to where people are, to feel their pain to see

> their struggles, some things which myself I have never ever experienced. Most of the time I have been working here, waiting for the people to come to the church. The church has not been a going church to where the people are but this program is making us to see. To see the cities or anywhere or the markets in the rural areas. The CMIN is challenging me to see my people where they are, to go where they are, to see their struggles. That is something I have not been thinking of. (KS5 1-6)
>
> CMIN is right in the development as I take it because as I see it we try to Liberate our women to make them free...It is right to let them to sustain their family and so forth. To have everything that is right there in the simplest way possible. (KS2 2-1)
>
> So I don't know if there is a difference between the CMIN and development because the CMIN is designed to uplift, to liberate the laity, and to lift up the youth, the women, the sunday school and the elders of the church. (KS3 2-1)

The above noted responses very clearly emphasize the concept or theme of empowerment, that is they speak to the uplifting of those who are down-trodden, oppressed or, for whatever reason, are in need of liberation. It warrants repetition, that no gender differentiation was designed into the case study. Because of the small number of participants no attempt was made to design questions which would differentiate or compare the answers of male and female participants. That enunciated, all female participants included empowerment or liberation in their themes. The above quoted statements are from both male and female participants. These examples of the perspective of the participants regarding empowerment was characteristic of both Kenyans and Canadians. Ten of the thirteen Kenyans and 6 of the 8 Canadians recognized empowerment and/or liberation as a development theme in the CMIN.

The differences between the CMIN and other development projects, which were noted by the respondents, are grouped around the focus on theological education and the motivation from Christian teaching. All participants spoke about the work of the church, the work of the clergy and the teaching in the CMIN which is specifically Christian in orientation. These statements ranged from the first one below, which indicates that the CMIN differed from ordinary development because the CMIN had "revealed knowledge", the Bible, from which the participants were able to draw; the second one which suggests there is no difference between the CMIN and development work because the CMIN deals in a holistic sense with all aspects of development.

> Without doubt the CMIN has not got a lot of difference with development because the CMIN comes out of the knowledge which is vested first in the Bible. (KG3 1-4)

> I see it as a development work, equipping our lay people and also our pastors, developing their working capacities and their working skills. I would see it not only in terms of the ones we are training right now but we are training them to go and train others so in terms of our work in evangelism and teaching and equipping I see that as a strong point of our development. But on the other hand when we speak about the urban ministry, you cannot be able to separate improving people's lives and the spiritual, both have to go together. That is how we can be able to see development in terms of a full gospel. A ministry that covers all aspects of a human life that is physical, spiritual, and the mind itself. So the CMIN program I am very much excited that it's almost covering the whole area that is physical and spiritual and even the mind. In fact what we are discussing now from what the participants have already seen is seeing the church at work and seeing the church in terms of development. Both are going together and the CMIN program I see that they are kind of addressing itself to the same issues. (KA2 1-8)

The planning and goals of the program was a focus on theological education, but the CMIN was holistic and that was significant.

> I think the only dissimilarity would be the fact that a major portion of the teaching is theological in its basis but still we are trying to teach the students and the goal is the development of their communities, family life, (and their) own personal development. But in many ways it seems like if development is; working together for their common for their own upbuilding, encouragement and gaining skills then, it (CMIN) is pretty well development. (CP8 1-8)

One of the initial courses which was part of the CMIN was "Equipping the Laity". The principal message of this course was that all members of a church have ministry responsibilities and not just the clergy. The task of the clergy is to assist the laity to develop and exercise those ministries.

> On the side of the church, development would be to assist the church people to grow in their faith and in their knowledge of the Word of God. There are many Christians who need to understand more about the faith even why they come to the church, why they have to serve God and why they themselves need to be enabled to do things on their own. The individual needs to be given the opportunity to gain the knowledge necessary to continue their increase in faith.
>
> CMIN assisted with the increase on the side of the church because as we studied I personally grew in spiritual understanding. And with the knowledge I gained from the CMIN I was able to teach other Christians so that they could grow in an understanding of faith. Now many of them understand that they have the ability to teach others as well. (KG4 1-4)

The Kenyans, by their responses, have taken the message of this course and extrapolated it to the greater community. They heard the key principle of the course aimed at the church, and yet saw an application of its meaning for the larger community even though its expression and out-working would still be through the church. The expression of the theology was to be liberatory and its outworking was to be practiced in a holistic non-fragmented way.

> I have worked extensively in the urban areas but there were so many things which I did not know. I did not know how to help my people who had various problems. Now when because when they came and we have toured to the various places like yesterday and today I get an idea how I can assist those who are way down like the boys and girls who have left school and others who can not help themselves. We have seen how to plan so that people can begin to help themselves not from yourself doing it all. You cannot help with the little that is in your own pocket. But by uplifting people little by little they are buoyed up spiritually too . (KS3 3-6)

From the perspective of both Kenyan and Canadian participants the cooperation and mutual respect was important in the development of the overall CMIN. Achebe, Hyden, Magadza and Okeyo (1990) suggested that external agencies, governments and NGOs tend first to blame Africa for all its problems then determine from afar what is the best remedy for the ailments of any particular nation. The foreign institutions prescribe aid solutions and the recipient is forced to accept the aid even though it may miss the area of need.

> I think that one of the things that would be different about the CMIN is that there is probably a higher level of mutuality between the givers and so called receivers than is usually the case in a material linked project or a work skill aid project or a life skill aid. (CP6 1-6)

The focus of the CMIN on the theological teaching, one of the stated goals of the project, was recognized by all participants. The first focus of the project was definitely the growth of the church. However, in light of the former responses there is a clear indication that a "hidden curriculum" also entered the process. It would be accurate to state that the expanded view of CMIN as empowerment, liberation theology or as a more general development project, was perhaps part of a curriculum hidden even to the initiators of the project. I do not want to be unfair to participants who may have critically understood the ideological foundations of their own practice but did not include that critique in their interview responses. This project was designed to meet the needs which these Kenyan churches wished to have addressed. The application was somewhat experimental in the first phase and assisted in developing a critical theory for the participants as it progressed.

> What we are learning here is a kind of exercise theology to show us that we are all God's people and we should care for other peoples welfare and not of thinking of ones own-self. It is a way of living together , togetherness in community, how we can live together, share together, enjoy together and share problems together so that we can speak in one voice in unity. (KS4 2-3)

The course content which had never mobilized anyone in Canada was picked up by the Kenyans and applied to a degree never anticipated by the Canadians. The empowerment of the participants came through the CMIN in theology that also relates to the peoples' daily struggles for survival, survival that has dignity, self-reliance and justice for a community broader than the participants alone.

> Nzyoka; What has been the most significant aspect of the CMIN so far?
>
> KA3; The first remarkable thing is the consciousness, the consciousness that has been created by the awareness that the program has provided so far. The affirmation it has already given to the people who have been involved in

> ministry, especially the laity and the evangelists who have had no training at all. To affirm them in certain things and hear them talk about that kind of affirmation. To have them talk about the challenges they have met. How some concepts they have always held have been corrected by what we have learned has been really exciting. (KA3 3-5)

WHY PARTICIPATE?

There is a differentiation between the Kenyan participants in the CMIN program and the Canadians with regards to their reasons for participation in the project. The three Kenyan administrators expressed their participation in terms of their roles as fulfilling the desire to assist their own people in being more effective in their work. The administrators of both Kenyan denominations stated that they approached CBIM for assistance in leadership development because their own resources were limited and Canadian Baptists had proven themselves.

> Canadian Baptists are people whom we have known for a long time, people whose faith we have tested even in many ministries in Kenya. (KA3 4-9)

The Canadian Baptist mandate for development reads:

> Canadian Baptist International Ministries will seek in all its programs to:
> * assist the needy people of the world, with special attention to the poorest of the poor, seeking to meet their physical, social and spiritual needs;
> *effect a Christ-like witness;
> *strengthen the witness and ministry of the church;
> *empower its constituency and partners to be involved in the alleviation of poverty and injustice;
> *encourage the participation of women at all levels
> *encourage collaboration and cooperation with other churches and agencies;
> *encourage a participatory approach to program development, implementation and evaluation;

> *invest in people in preference to material and physical resources;
> *ensure good stewardship of the human, financial and natural resources provided by God and his people;
> *ensure that there will be no restriction of race, colour, creed, nationality or political choice to prevent consideration of response. (Sharing Way, 1992)

The Canadian administrators did not use their role or office as a reason for participation. However, one Canadian professor stated his reason for participation as "part of the portfolio...one of the dimensions of the position" (CP5 1-8). The Canadians, with the one stated exception, all talked in terms of a desire, or wanting to participate, of going as learners as much as teachers. Three of the professors (two quoted here) made very pointed statements about going to Kenya because they were invited as well as going for other secondary reasons. Of the following the first had consulting experience in Africa prior to teaching and the second had no previous third world experience.

> Well see my thing is mixed, I go because, obviously I was asked and, two I do think there are urban issues that people are facing in third world countries that - and I do think that community empowerment, community development all those kinds of things that are urban issues now in terms of the poor and things like that are transferable concepts. - Now - I also go because I want our people to have a third world experience. And I admit that. I think our people need to be broadened. Its, this is costing our people money to sit in the class and to learn with, and I'm hoping that this model with them coming with us will help in the translation. (CP4 1-8)
>
> At the same time I am not motivated to go there if I get the idea I am imposing myself that I am not being invited, that I am just going because I have some grandiose idea about my importance as a Canadian Christian, I won't be there. I go on the

> understanding that I am invited and upon invitation I go there and at that point I make the assumption that they must feel I have something to offer. If they invite me to come then I will offer that and I'll try to do that as a Christian, humbly, recognizing there is a lot of expertise they have. (CP3 2-3)

The other responses from Canadians were divided between an academic opportunity in theological education and a call or motivation recognized as part of the Christian vocation. The academic opportunity included the desire to attempt a more contextualized process with a philosophy of education which was acceptable. The issue of relevance of the Western Theological experience being duplicated in Kenya was one that was discussed at length by the Canadian professors and the Carey Senate. The resolve was that the CMIN version offered in Kenya was sufficiently different from the Canadian version to warrant the experimental application. The ABC CMIN had a cross-cultural communication course which would focus on the African experience in the spread of Christianity. Several introductory courses would supplement the teaching to give the ABC students an opportunity to have the background to do the program. There would be one third of the course taught in Kiswahili and, where possible, a missionary who could help with translation should be present during the classroom teaching. The students who had completed the ABC Divinity School program prior to entering the CMIN were to be given nine credit hours for their work. The Canadians were asked, as were Kenyans, why they had participated in the CMIN.

> I agree with it philosophically on the basis that it is good education. I agree with it economically because it is economical education. I agree with it in that the basis behind it is giving good training to good people, rather than poor training sending over a second best or trying to give some

> type of haphazard TEE program. So that's the reason I agree to be involved is I agree with the basis of it. (CP8 1-10)

> There are several answers to that question. One is that we fell in love with the people and the country and looked for an excuse to stay. I don't think that is a particularly bad motivation because without love this kind of thing can never really survive because people sense it is simply a program and there is no heart to it. But the more technical reason why I became involved was that I am dedicated to experimentation in theological education. I am convinced that the Western model of education generally and specifically theological education is not Hebraic and Biblical, is partially and sometimes largely counterproductive. And we have something to learn from the patterns of simpler and older societies or societies that have a more communal learning context or have an oral tradition of learning and have a different world view. I am always intrigued by what we can learn about learning in a context like that. So I have to say I have a selfish reason for wanting to be involved. That relates to wanting to be improved and learn myself from a cross cultural situation and to experiment. (CP6 2-3)

The Kenyan administrators who were familiar with Western Theological education asked for the modifications in the project which were included in the ACC & S CMIN.

As part of the academic elitism which surrounds international adventure one of the Canadian respondents expressed "elitism" as the last motivating factor after 1) the Christian vocational call, 2) the opportunity to teach about the changing world which effects us all, and 3) the opportunity to learn from the Kenyan ministry project.

> The fourth one is more selfish than personal. I am part of a Faculty that has a bragging time at the end of every summer where every Faculty member talks about where all the places they have gone in the world to be involved in ministry, teaching and those kind of things. I have to say that one of the motivating factors for me is that I have

> something to say when we come to that session and I have to say, it was devastating when I stayed in Canada or did ministry in the United States and everyone else went off to China or South Africa or wherever else. For me the personal thing is that I am able to make a personal contribution on the international scene and it becomes part of a pride-shame thing when I get back home and there's no putting aside that. (CD 10-2)

One response from a Canadian professor discussed the national and global importance of links from Canada to countries of the third world such as Kenya. This was only part of the motivation for participation and augments the overarching reason for being involved in the project.

> First I will answer as a Canadian then as a Christian. As a Canadian for the self preservation of this country I would go. This country depends on exports, it depends on other countries to exist. If other countries close us off for some embargo this country will go down faster than most other countries. Because we are by and large a primary producer, we have very little secondary industry we cannot. We have just been very good at exporting our stuff going elsewhere. I think that during this recession the people who got the money are the people who are in the export business and the money is coming in that way. They are not creating new jobs creating new money not new jobs. As a Canadian I would go over there to establish relationships, to be a peaceful person to model that and to demonstrate that we can all get along without having to resort to other methods or other political methodologies especially violence. As a Canadian Christian that is what motivates me. As a person I might not bother going over there if it wasn't for my Christian motivation. I believe as a Christian that there is only one mission and that is the world and this happens to be one place in the world I have an opportunity to go to meet that. (CP3 2-3)

This response is unique in its expression. The participant talks bluntly about the capitalist need for expanded markets and the need for consumers to purchase those commodities. The realization that Canada must be a part of a global system reinforces a North role in the Global Systems theory which Sklair (1991) critiques as sustaining economic domination. The anomaly of the Canadian professor's statement is pointed. We live in a global economy, our world is shrinking and our lives intersect far more than we might wish to acknowledge. The world being closer also means that the conflict and wars of others are closer to us. Canadians have a need, whether they realize or not, to spread a message of peace beyond themselves. The need to meet other peoples on a level of human understanding is part of the process to global peace and intercultural acceptance. The latter part of the response is congruent with the responses of other participants who state their motivation comes purely from an obedience to the Christian calling to carry the Christian message to the world. The question remains rhetorical, without the Christian motivation is isolation the alternative?

Jenkins (1984) in his text Missions: A Modern Definition discussed the call for a moratorium on Christian Missions to Africa given by the Reverend John Gatu who was then the President of the All Africa Conference of Churches. It was time for the Africans to carry the Christian message to their own people without the dominance of the West. The mainline churches began to heed the request. There were also a number of independent, indigenous African Christian Churches which were totally unrelated to established missions and they requested assistance in meeting the mission needs of their churches.

> Examples are the Africa Brotherhood Church and the African Christian Churches and Schools, requesting missionaries from Canadian Baptist Churches to help them fulfil their mission... It seems to me that the modern concept of missions is a very Biblical one. It is involvement of the world-wide church in world-wide ministry. (Jenkins, 1984, p.6)

The non-administrative Kenyan participants were, of course, the students or former students. Amongst the students there were three different statements about the reason for participation in the CMIN program. The most common response (eight students) was expressed as the desire for more knowledge. This was phrased by statements including "I lacked knowledge, I wanted to get wider knowledge", and discussions about having been forced out of school during childhood. The knowledge and skills were those which enabled the participant to preach and teach the message of Christianity. The paramount knowledge was that which would 1) assist in personal spiritual growth, 2) would bring other people into a faith relationship with Jesus Christ and 3) give the participant greater education in theology (this third issue will be addressed in a later chapter).

> Because I wanted to have the knowledge with which I could do the work that God gave me to do. Also I wanted the knowledge personally. The work we do requires people these days to have extra teaching, that way I can do better even though I know God enables.(KG4 1-2)

> Because I have always been looking forward to get skills on how I can bring many people to Jesus Christ and I have been a lay Pastor for about 18 years and I thought it would be good if I had a course and have these skills I would help them better. (KS1 1-4)

> I will tell you. The thing that got me into the CMIN was that I had a great desire for studies. I love to study. As well, in the work we do of preaching, as our country continues to grow we have a responsibility to uplift not to remain down or it becomes difficult to look after our sheep (parishioners). For example many of our people leave higher education and if the leader only knows Kiswahili or Kikuyu the work would be extremely difficult. Without a language to reach the people we serve, it is hard. This is why I came into the CMIN in order to increase my knowledge. (KS3 1-2)

> There are many reasons. For one I like education because my background I went to school only when I was fifteen years. My family was not willing to send me to educate me. So when I got a chance to go to school I thought I would promote myself in any field. To come to the ministry, a course like this, a seminar, this program I thought was going to improve my ministry in many areas. If you remain where you are and in, if you remain in a Bible college knowledge and you are not adding anything on what you learned you remain stagnant there. The world is changing and you have to know what the world is doing. So to me I decided to join this program because I thought it was going to give me a wider knowledge and it will minister to this present generation. Even if I get a more chance my brains would keep up working so I won't remain where I was. (KS5 1-2)

This last student desired more knowledge, not the specific knowledge from theological education, but rather a more holistic knowledge that would allow both personal growth and the potential for reaching beyond her/him self to the next generation. To stay stagnant is to regress because the changes in the world require a constant input of new knowledge. The student expected knowledge for spiritual growth but also transformative knowledge for survival.

Even though some of the Kenyans may have been forced to abandon their education in earlier years, one of the respondents wanted to be open with Canadians about the potential of self interest and personal gain being a motivating factor within the CMIN program. At the time of the initial discussions regarding the CMIN it was acknowledged that almost all of the potential CMIN students would have been excluded from Kenyan educational institutions because of their lack of credentialed education. Many of the CMIN participants had been forced out of schooling because of lack of resources. They had either lacked the fees for schooling or lacked secondary schooling because no schools were near enough to attend. Carey, however, was willing to accept mature experienced students into the CMIN program.

> The one thing I should not forget to mention here is that education is something that is cherished almost everywhere in the world and here in Kenya many people do not terminate their learning by way of choice. Actually they are forced to abandon studies by other dictates or circumstances and so when people come back to study, like these folks have come back to study, the Certificate of Ministry program, the notion that this will also develop their status is also very strong. Even as they grow as servants of the Lord they have another expectation that the church will recognize that they have also grown in education, in understanding that they will grow in performance. So they will want the church to have these considerations for them. Others may be aspiring perhaps to either take higher studies and, its not unlikely, that in a whole group of thirty there might be some who are not very much doing it for the sake of ministry but more so for the sake of their own aspirations. I am not saying this to discourage you I'm only saying this because it is a reality. People have used situations like this as stepping stones to something else they want to do. We know that ourselves and we care that Carey Hall also knows that this could be the case. (KA3 4-11)

The above statement, although given in honesty and mutual respect, stands in contrast to the expressed statements by all three of the female respondents and two male respondents. They expressed a motivation to be in the program in order to assist other people to gain a benefit from their opportunity to study. Their theology has expressed itself and could be exercised through their opportunity to pass their knowledge on to other people. The voices were sincere and heavy with the concern for those around them.

> When the General Secretary explained about the CMIN and how we would be helped to grow up and to build up in knowing the Bible more and probably

> other things related to it I thought as a women's coordinator, I lead the women, or rather we work together, I would benefit from the CMIN. I would learn more things which I would be taking to them or take to them as I learn. So not only am I adding to my knowledge but always sharing it with the other women in the rural areas as well in the city here in Nairobi as well. (KS2 1-2)

> I entered the program to benefit, as did the others, to assist and help my people. My heart wants to help Christians here in Africa but more particularly in the ABC. Because as I have observed the majority of leaders have not done much studying and they do not understand and so my aim is to assist them when they are weak like that. (KG2 2-9)

> I heard from our leader the General Secretary Rev. Karanja and from our Moderator James Ngugi the importance of the course that it will make some of the church leaders to be liberated so that we could do a good job to the church. So I had that interest to be one of those who would be equipped to liberate. To be liberated that I might be able to liberate others. (KS4 1-2)

These latter two statements also critique the leadership of the church in part because of the poor educational background of various leaders and in part because of the hierarchical system which controlled the ministry in the hands of only the clergy or a few elders. Both the ABC and the ACC & S have parish councils or pastorate committees which have the authority to transfer clergy to new locations without having to consult with the clergy involved.

WHAT ABOUT CHANGE?

The problem with a discussion of change is that there are multiple levels of interaction and there are actions and pressures which impact upon the micro and macro levels of society. Individuals are confronted with challenges to their values and assumptions as they participate in educational processes. At the same time there are economic and social pressures challenging the way life is experienced and ordered in their nation. All levels of change were not even remotely the purvey of the CMIN and no pretence should be assumed that participants viewed it that way. The CMIN was focused at the level of practical theological knowledge and its application in the lived-world of the churches.

The participants recognized that there were other factors acting in the current African context and impacting on the society which were allowing and forcing change in Kenyan society. These changes were perplexing and not without their implications for the lives of the participants.

> The major changes were not specifically introduced by the CMIN but we would also say they were not introduced by the ABC the changes are the normal changes over time. (KG1 4-1)

> ACC & S is in the midst of Kenyan culture which is in the midst of radical change culturally and at this point politically and societally so it is a big part of the whole system changing. The ACC & S is ready for it. The ACC & S is in a unique position being the Kikuyu tribe, the forthright change in leadership to a younger leadership they were prepared for it. Though change is part of life for most of these students, big radical change, family change, society change, community change and church changing is just part of the natural evolution of the society. (The pressure for change comes) From the media, Western pressure, the change that was brought about by multiparty (elections) was brought about by pressure from the IMF and World Bank. (It)brought radical change on a number of different levels. Urban pressures in Kenya because of the loss of land in Kikuyu country with the inability of the sons to survive on the father's shamba. People coming to the city, the urban pressure is part of the change. (CP8 4-7)

> (About changes) we were talking yesterday, how

> does the economy affect our people? How do the political changes like now in Africa we think about multi-parties. (The CMIN) it is to help them even to see the need to look for more resources which they can be able to refer and be able to carry to the members of their congregations in a way that they would be more effective and bring the gospel in a more likely manner that should be able to enter into the needs of our people. (KA2 2-4)

The Kenyans recognized the pressure from the macro-forces such as the IMF (International Monetary Fund), World Bank and foreign governments acting upon their country to force change which placed hardships on the people. During the duration of the CMIN project the Kenyan Shilling was devalued from thirteen Kenyan Shillings to one US dollar to a peak of 72 Kenyan Shillings for one US dollar. Staple products were removed from price control and sugar, milk and petroleum products went beyond the ability of the average Kenyan. The local Nairobi newspaper escalated from three shillings to thirteen shillings in the same period, however wages did not increase by more than ten percent. The price of one kilogram of raw coffee for export went from thirteen shillings down to two shillings during the structural adjustment pressure of the IMF and World Bank. The slum areas of Nairobi, Mathare Valley, Kibera, Kariobangi, Dandora and other smaller areas have grown in population from approximately 300,000 people at the start of the CMIN project to well over 1 Million people. The infrastructure was not able to sustain the original slum area let alone a tripling of the population. Job creation has not matched the rural to urban migration. People are in abject poverty, without justice and only beginning to find advocacy through NGOs and people's movements. The societal and government changes which came about perhaps forced the participants to be more receptive to content which would allow them some understanding of their changing environment.

The CMIN project appeared to introduce changes in the way the Canadians and Kenyans approached the theological experience through their participation in the CMIN. In the ABC there appeared to be an initial reaction against the CMIN project aimed specifically against the content of the course material. Some of the opposition to the changes suggested by the course material was from the student participants and other opposition came from those in parallel leadership roles in the churches. No parallel opposition has surfaced with the ACC & S CMIN. The project has raised some questions. What does it mean to introduce change into Kenya? For the Canadian participants there was the uncertainty thaat comes from moving into the unknown. Would introduced change have the effect of causing damage which was out of the control of the instructors? Information about the two African churches was shared by Canadian missionaries yet professors would enter the classroom without the experience of working with the churches. There perhaps was a large leap of faith into the project. Where was the evaluative process when the project was into its initial stages? The change process, or potential for change is always faced with a degree of uncertainty.

> It is like opening the door and throwing a stick of dynamite in and then closing the door. In some ways you never know what's going to happen. That dynamite could be used positively or negatively. I think that, we have to be very, very careful. We have to do evaluation more periodically in the whole program more carefully than I am aware we are doing thus far. I think we have to go back, I want to see KG5 debriefed and see what implications that has for it. I think a whole lot more of that has to be done. When we introduce change models we take responsibility for what that might in fact mean. We have introduced worship change models we introduced leadership change models we introduced counselling models, we've introduced field education models, and we've introduced urban models. We have got an awful lot

> of model introduction to this thing. I don't think we know what it means to put that all in the mix in the students. (CP1 8-3)

The Canadian professors expectation of rapid change was brought into direct contrast, and perhaps conflict, with a traditional and culturally codified process for change. The dialogue which ensued enabled a "conscientization" of both parties. Canadians and Kenyans were brought into dialogue and both became learners because the object of mediation was the change brought by the meeting of cultural differences regarding change. Freire (1972) stated:

> Only dialogue, which requires critical thinking, is also capable of generating critical thinking. Without dialogue there is no communication, and without communication there can be no true education. Education which is able to resolve the contradiction between teacher and student takes place in a situation in which both address their act of cognition to the object by which they are mediated. (p. 65)

The awakening of awareness in an individual opens the opportunity for critical thinking and reflection. McKinney (1984) suggests that the application of Freire's approach to theological education when community-based, has the potential to activate social change and development. The Kenyans had experienced years of slow change which is discussed and not accepted until the consensus of the elders has been reached. Some of the Canadians in the CMIN were introducing the possibility of change which was as a result of the process of evaluation and reflection, modification with ongoing evaluation and reflection. The individual project which each student was expected to apply in their ministry situation was designed for reflection and change.

> When change comes to us the most important thing is that we understand what or why there is a change. Usually if change comes quickly our people do not understand the change and it becomes a difficulty. If changes are small then it is OK. In

> our church the constitution specifically states that things are set for five years at a time, after that change can be fixed. For example this year there are congregational elections for elders in the churches and representatives to the Supreme Council. The chairman of this committee is the head of our church. (KA4 4-1)

Change which was identified as having been introduced through the specific teaching of the CMIN was identified as both trouble and difference in the participants' remarks.

> One course did bring some strife, not a lot, but the course on leadership did bring some problems. You know that every denomination has its own ways of organizing and operating and so this course introduced some difficulties. Perhaps this was a cultural change which was introduced because differences in culture and customs can bring conflicts. Other courses did not bring trouble. (KA4 4-3)

The meeting of two different cultures produces points of interaction when custom and socially formulated behaviour are not the same. These clash points surface when the established order in either culture can not use its social sanctions to challenge the difference. The challenge to the culture is often in the form or expression of alternate assumptions and values. Cultural norms are part of the individuals identity within a society. Challenge to an individuals ethnocentrism brings the accepted life-world into question. In Africa, social change "has meant progress in some parts and abject negation of self-determination in other parts" (Ayisi, 1992, p. 96). For the Kenyans and Canadians confronted with cultural differences the issues were of great concern. The Kenyan participants recognized that their society and culture do not sit in isolation from the environment. Changes were occurring and yet there was an attempt to maintain that which was familiar. The result was that the reaction of those opposed to change was fraught with tension and hard feelings. To some of the elders the teaching appeared to be a threat to the familiar. The students then became a target for verbal abuse as they represented the change that was to come.

> Change is normal and always is usual. Change when it came into the church it did bring a bit of problems. The trouble started from ourselves and was raised for the elders. These were the elders in each church who have not studied the Bible and do not know what it can say. They did not know that the Christian needs to grow in faith more than to just have the basics. When we taught the church along with those who know very little, but are elders, there was difficulty because the elders felt threatened. Those who do not understand are the ones who cause the trouble and do not want any one else to grow or develop because it threatens them. Really in summary most other people did not understand the purpose behind the CMIN or what we studied. Some think we wasted our time because they say there was no benefit to them. But the ones who say that are those who despise any form of change or development within the church. They want all the time to be in front of the people to be in control. I know for example that one of our leaders was told by the elders that the studies were useless, without meaning at all. But the Pastor told those people that they did not know what they were talking about because they did not know anything about the courses or the content. After the start, there were many people who spoke against it all, like it was overturning the church. (KG3 4-7)

The course on Christian Leadership introduced various leadership styles and methodologies for conflict management and resolution. The experience of the students in the course was totally outside this content. All clergy were assigned to pastoral positions and yet the course material suggested that there were some specific leadership styles which were better suited to different phases of the life of a local congregation. An instrument had been administered so that each student could evaluate their own preferred leadership style. Then the Canadian professor presented course content which suggested how the style could be modified to match ministry situations. The students began to apply the course content in their ministry situations. The elders of local congregations had not been challenged in their experience of resolving local situations and the CMIN students began to experiment with different leadership approaches and with conflict management techniques. The elders felt threatened because they saw their traditional role in religious social control eroded by the CMIN clergy who now challenged the traditional polity of the church. The long established hierarchy of the church was being challenged by a group of clergy who saw ways to change the church.

At the beginning of the CMIN the students in the first phase of the project were unsure of their own status within the church hierarchy because of their involvement in the CMIN program. They had to cope with their preconditioned notion that a student is someone in preparation and when the studies are completed then the application of the knowledge can be expected. The students were not removed from their work roles except for the few weeks of the classroom course sessions. The application of the course material began at once. Change was introduced and the students on return to their work assignments began to experiment with the course content they had learned. The process of the CMIN brought a challenge to the role of "student" as seen not only by the participants but also by the elders and non-participant church leadership.

> When we began the CMIN there was trouble because those who were being taught at the start were seen as learning something different from the rest. When they continued in the CMIN they began to dismiss this as they realized that the development of the church was the important goal. At this point we began to regain our leadership role as we saw that the examples of our own church was full

> of problems. This began to draw us together. There were some who thought they knew it all and as we progressed it became apparent that they did not know. The person was just acting big. So because of all that which we learned, it took a while, until the course on leadership before we understood how people acted. We were helped a great deal to lead our own churches through all this. Other people understood very quickly that there was a difference between the old leaders and those from now (in the CMIN), these new ones were not out to destroy but to bring positive development to the church. (KG4 3-7)

From the evidence submitted by the Kenyan participants there would appear to be a difference in the performance of the CMIN students significant enough to draw attention. This is true for both the graduates and the current students in the project. The difference between those in the project and those outside began to raise a level of suspicion as well as a note of confrontation between those who started to apply or practice different teaching and leadership processes and those without the benefit of the change models introduced in the CMIN. It would take time and the effects of the empowering potential of the CMIN before colleagues and elders would begin to accept the value of the CMIN.

> Some of the courses brought change. Those people who have received teaching have changed because they have left the old practices. So what I notice is they (those not originally in the CMIN) begin to follow the new ways as we teach things like leadership. We see that they respond by recognizing the styles. They say if I belong to a task oriented or person oriented style and it does not apply they change their ways because they did things without knowing. (KG2 4-7)

As the graduate, quoted below, talked about the people who "despised" the CMIN there was a look on the face of a friend who has somehow injured the friendship by some accident of action. The Bishop of the entire denomination had suggested and selected many of those who were to be students, yet those involved felt like they were learning secret or subversive material. The negative reaction from many of the elders was focused towards the students not against the Bishop. When the Bishop's confidence in the group of Canadians was born out by positive changes in the students, those who had been in opposition began to alter their attitude towards the program. The time delay in acceptance of the CMIN was also a result of the time required by the students themselves to believe in themselves, to begin to experiment and to use the knowledge from the CMIN project. The time necessary for the students to gain personal confidence in their ability to interact with received knowledge and extend it to constructed knowledge is not without importance.

> When we started many of the people despised the CMIN. The leadership and the elders of the church despised the CMIN. But when the CMIN left the confines of the classroom to begin to function outside things changed. I can give you the example of nearly six people who now cry loudly because if they had only known the benefit they also would have joined the CMIN. Three Pastors, like (...) say if they had only known, they would have entered. Even lay people like (...) say if they could get a chance to enter the CMIN they would enter. Now I think almost the entire church has seen and accepted the CMIN as valuable. Even our Bishop says the CMIN people, if they continue in their current activity, are certainly fit to guide the church. There was a time that the Bishop said to us that he had sent people to the Limuru Theological College and sent people to the CMIN but the ones in the CMIN were far superior to those who went to the Theological college. (KG6 4-3)

Course work which dealt with leadership styles and conflict management were extremely effective in presenting possibilities for alternative leadership styles. Many of the leaders had known only one model, that which was based on a traditional hierarchy. The introduction of alternatives brought some immediate changes in various situations and the ABC began to see evidence of conflict resolution which did not result in division and animosity. Traditionally disputes were taken to Headquarters for settlement, but within the churches guided by the CMIN participants the number of disputes began to subside. These churches were able to focus their attention on ministry issues rather than personal disputes as the CMIN students learned to utilize their conflict management and leadership skills. Several of the CMIN graduates have been placed in churches where there are several different tribal groupings represented and have applied the course content so that it has become practical professional knowledge.

> From the CMIN the first thing which I learned which was very important was leadership. The leadership knowledge I gained was sufficient. Before I entered the CMIN it was extremely difficult for me to comprehend what church leadership was doing. Now, since the CMIN course I can go into a church and after one or two months I can begin to understand the situation. I know now, that if I am transferred in a short time I can see what is going on and what I will do. The CMIN allowed me to learn how to lead and it taught me about the differences there are in people, that is to say their culture. Except the fact that we (Kamba) are all here, the people in Machakos are different from Kangundo and different again from Makueni or Yatta. All have different cultural habits. The CMIN taught me how to live with the various cultures. I can now be with and understand different peoples and they love me and I can love them.(KG6 2-1)

It is still too early to know if the entire structure of the ABC will be influenced but the graduates are now teaching the next generation of leaders what they have applied. The teaching has taken place without Canadians being involved in the Africa Brotherhood Church which implies that the content and process was significant enough for the ABC to retain the essence for their own teaching.

As a result of the "positive changes" the hierarchy of the ABC requested that the entire denominational leadership be given a shortened, simplified version of the program in Kiswahili. Most of these seminars were given by the graduates of the initial project. The ripple effect has not yet become fully known. This impact revealed a problem that had been under the surface without the full impact being known. There had been an initial orientation session when a small personal library of approximately 30 volumes was given to each participant. These theological texts and reference books were intended for the use of the students during the course of study and would remain their personal property thereafter. Several potential students had come and refused to return for the actual classes stating they could learn it all from the texts and had no need to participate particularly if there were participants of lower rank, or women. These individuals attempted to undermine the program by rumour and attack on the other students. When the administration required the balance of the clergy to attend the "simplified" version, the group who had opposed the CMIN were required to attend the seminars, by the Bishop of the denomination, but this time without receiving a Canadian credential. While it would be suspected that this would cause further resentment the team teaching of these seminars by myself and various CMIN graduates had a very different effect. The clergy made a request through the hierarchy to expand the seminar sessions so there would be an opportunity to receive the wider cross-section of teaching.

The ACC & S administrators were able to deal with a similar situation very early in their CMIN program.

> One of the things I have discovered is that the group that is in this program now is very different from the group that is not within the group. We have got pastors who are not

> participants of this program and you will see there is always some kind of difference that the one who are not in the program are very different from the ones who are in the program so you might see there is some kind of tension. They work together. They sometimes see some kind of difference and that is very dangerous to the church because it might divide the church so what I have been trying to do is provide alternate programs for training to those who are not in this program like Theological Education by Extension so those also may be able to benefit. Or look for any other local program of training even if it is a very short time program because you have to bring people together, so when they go to the congregation they go with just one agenda. There is not group that says we are inferior, or we are superior. In the first place actually the elders of some of the churches were kind of resistant because they didn't know what it was all about. Like one of the elders who has trained in this program happened to come from one local church and has got a chairman, and this chairman did not understand what it is and feared that he was going to be undermined and his chairmanship will be taken by this one. We have tried to help them, to see themselves as servants, not as the bosses but to provide the service required so out of their good effort out of the services they are rendering from the program then people will come to appreciate and when people start to appreciate and come together that will solve almost all the problems. I will not rule out that there might be some problems about which we are not aware and we will see how we can arrest them before they come. (KA2 5-7)

This need to be aware of potential conflict was evident in the comments of several of the participants. The change which the students experienced through their participation in the CMIN would begin to have an impact on the communities where the participants worked and lived. The church would be influenced by the CMIN participants and the change would begin to reach the local communities. The CMIN students recognized the difference in their teaching and in the effects of the course content on themselves but they were also resolved to bring such a positive change to their denominations.

> For my part I think now, like I did at the start, that it would be helpful (to have a second CMIN class). I say that because I know the change and growth it has brought for me by studying in the CMIN. For others maybe I would say it will cause difficulties but afterwards they will come to understand that it is not a problem. If some one does not understand the benefit of something it is not until later that they can appreciate what they have learned. If we continue with another course, let us say the CMIN there are others who want to study and some who would be helped by the CMIN. (KG3 4-9)
>
> I was suggesting in another meeting, in our pastors' meeting, if we get the old people, the elders in our church because they don't know this. They need to be taught about this, to be told about this, it is a bit difficult because they have always been there and to try to change might be a bit difficult and they may feel as if the church is trying to throw them away. If we cooperate and try to handle them very carefully, lovingly and let them know that they are there that they are important and that we respect them but we need to have more people taking over to help them in the church then it would be alright. For us the Pastors and workers it is not difficult, but we have those old elders in the church. It is very difficult, they don't want to change. It is hard but we can all get a method to change. (KS2 3-3)
>
> You know people are not willing to respond to new changes so we needed to be very wise not to bring change just once in one day. That needs a bold plan, a long plan not just one day saying we are going to do this and all that. People might be very much against that. So what we are learning here, there needs (to be) a gradual kind of change so not to bring confusion and whatever. People are not ready for change. - The leaders have to change first. If they pass on the change and if the people see you are being changed. - So to me it is the leader who has to change first of all. You can't be leading people in a way you haven't gone. (KS5 4-3)

Change will come in the church if the congregation sees and experiences the change in the life of their leader, and understands the reasons for change. The reduction in conflict and therefore a reduction in the frequency of rotation of clergy through the churches has been a positive change in the church. The impact of the change through the Kenyan participants has resulted in increased pressure to continue the CMIN project by allowing further classes to progress through the program. This message was repeated by every Kenyan who was interviewed. The message was also repeated by the Canadians who had been asked "when or if" Carey or CBIM would be starting the next course.

> I hear remarks from people who are not in the program saying when do I get to start? When can I be part of this? It is seen in a positive manner in the ACC & S particularly among the young pastors. We are running about 50% of the denomination's leadership at this point and the 50% who aren't in it are seeing something in those who are in it and they want it. Among the ACC & S people there is a, you know the Kikuyu always want to be advanced and take courses and things like that. But they also see their friends benefitting and being encouraged in it. (CP8 6-6)

> Really now the people are excited about the course and there are many who are asking if there is some way which they can enter the program. There are others in the ABC who are able to study (at this level). I have not seen any people now who want to obstruct the courses. When we began the CMIN there were those who thought this is only the Western/white-man thing it was the objective of an outside denomination but they later realized differently and agreed to the study. Some of them even now admit they did us wrong by opposing and now wish they could be included. They are even asking why can't we have teaching like the CMIN? (KG1 4-5)

> There are many lay people who could do this CMIN and they ask me all the time if there would be an

> opportunity for them to enter the CMIN. Many of the lay-leaders are school teachers and other professional people, they are many and they could be included with the clergy. The problem would be for the school teachers as they could only come during the time when schools are closed like December, April and August. (KA4 5-9)

The implication from these Kenyan participants is that the churches have a larger role in societal development than perhaps Canadians realize. The encouragement to increase the number of people in the CMIN suggests that other people will add to the influence of the church in the community. To add lay-people will add a secondary dimension to the sphere of influence. The church has the ear of portions of the population and these leaders recognize its potential in societal development.

The introduction of change through the CMIN was not only felt in Kenya but also made an impact in Canada, some of which parallels the initial opposition the ABC felt. The ramifications of doing this CMIN project created a ripple effect through both Carey Theological College and the Canadian constituency which supports the College. There were members of the constituency who seemed to complain about the assumption that it was not getting the benefit that the Kenyans are reported to be receiving. The criticism appears to be in the form of questions raised about the availability of a program in Nairobi which Carey does not provide on the prairies. If a church based model of theological education could be taken from Vancouver and offered in Kenya then why was it not taken across the Rocky Mountains. This Canadian professor expressed it well.

> Every single one of them (Faculty) shares my disappointment of our reception when we got back to Canada. NOBODY is fired up about it in Western Canada right now, for whatever reasons we could get into. They actually use that as a tool of

negatively critiqueing the program of Carey Theological College. I think that is bad news and frankly I think it is just pure jealousy. They have their own problems.They are scrambling for cash and people and programs too. That has been the disappointment. It changed my life, it scared me at times, and I have been deeply disappointed to come back to Canada and find out that there is only a handful of people who think this is something we can do. I do not understand that other than jealousy. When I go around to talk about Carey Theological College I do not talk about the Kenya project because every time I do and I open up for discussion I can count on some guy getting up and saying if you can do it in Kenya you can do it here. As if we were not doing anything here. That may have to do with a whole other set of dynamics that has very little to do with the Kenya project. I would not turn against the Kenya project I would carry it on for as long as we can regardless of what they say out there. (CA2 4-5)

I have a new empathy, if not sympathy for people like the General Secretary of CBIM and people like you who have the vision and have to deal with people like us. We are so self serving, we are so selfish and frankly the current generation between the ages of 35 to 55 are so self oriented that at times it will bring me to tears. Now I hope by saying that I am not exalting myself because I probably was the same until I went. I think the real problem is in Canada- it is not in Africa. I do not think it is in the mission board, other than that the mission board is going to have to change some of the strategies. The mission board is getting a little bit static...The systems are fossilizing so there needs to be some changes in the CBIM board. My swift, shortest answer is that the problem is not in Africa, the problem is in Canada. I have already expressed part of that, when I go to the denomination, the thing that has stunned me the most is to find that nobody, except the Faculty who have been there and people like you, there is not a whole lot of people really excited about it. They do not want to hear it, you can tell. They change the subject right in mid stream some times. "I don't want to hear this." I am saying to myself, "What is the problem?" I think it has something to do with our spiritual state here. We have jumping churches with hand

> clapping and praising God, and overhead transparencies and tap dancing on the floor but we are letting those people go to hell in a hand wagon. I am sorry that is the way I look at it. I am preaching now. (CP3 8-5)

Part of the conflict that the Canadian professors face is a common experience for overseas workers. Having been in this position myself I have faced audiences and individuals who feel threatened and jealous of the experience which has impacted and changed the life of those who have worked overseas. The uncomfortable position comes as Canadians, for example, are confronted with personal self-centred attitudes and a desire for self-satisfaction which might have come at the expense of others. Perhaps Canadians generally are unaware of the paradigm they assume for global development. It may be easier to "blame the victim" rather than address the root causes of injustice and inequity. The professors suggest that the personal experience of gratification even in a church setting has become so dominant as a theme in Canada that any confrontation of this issue is met with a closing of the ears and the mind. As mentioned in Chapter 1 the theological debate in Canadian Baptist churches has generally emphasized evangelism over the social justice issues. The negative reaction by Canadians as highlighted above then begs the question "What do you tell your colleagues about this educational endeavour?"

> Oh I tell them that it is the most exciting piece of theological education I have been part of in my whole life. I tell them that the students in Kenya couldn't graduate until they had convinced the Bishop and myself or the appropriate person that they had actually released other people for ministry not just become competent themselves. I tell my colleagues that I wish we could do that here, I wish we could take people who come to my college and say you won't graduate until this thing has been incorporated in your life. You can't graduate on the basis of regurgitating

> knowledge and information. I tell people that it was really fun and I learned a tremendous amount by doing it. (CP6 11-9)

Before leaving this section of the discussion I need to add a specific change which had not been part of any official agenda. One change which has had a dramatic effect was indeed a personal "hidden agenda". Before the project began I was aware that very few of our Canadian leadership and definitely our professors were uninformed about the reality of life in the Third World. I thought that their orientation was totally Eurocentric and that they subscribed to some modernization paradigm. I questioned whether any of them could articulate their development paradigm. Picture book tours do not bring about life changes; only reflected upon experience can change lives. If CBIM was to be effective our own people had to be educated. Therefore to gain the education required some experience was necessary in the situation to which we addressed our energy. Research subsequent to beginning the CMIN has verified that this premise was perhaps sound, though at the time it was only a "hunch". Evans (1990) states that transformative change for the "non-poor" requires an immersion and challenge to existing patterns and beliefs.

> The research points to the need for an experiential shock that challenges previous assumptions, reduces one's resistance to change, and requires the exploration of alternative patterns of living. For these reasons some type of immersion experience appears indispensable to transformative education. (Evans, 1990, p.276)

Perhaps because of the novelty and adventure of the project, or the opportunity, all but two of the professors took the opportunity to bring (at their own expense) their spouses and together the life changing experiences took place. Two of the professors, with accompanying spouses, were stoned in a riot in Nairobi, all spent time in both rural and urban Kenya and all were into the slums in Nairobi. They visited the homes of the students and saw the reality of life in Kenya. The changes in the lives of these professors have already begun to influence their teaching and efforts in Canada. While this text is being written a subcommittee has been struck to present a model of theological education which would be "church based" model of theological education as opposed to the traditional seminary based model. The committee has two of the key participants in the CMIN actively developing the proposal which could be implemented as early as 1995. Their thinking about how we can work together more effectively about theological education has developed from their dialogue with the CMIN project in Kenya.

CHAPTER 4

PEOPLE PARTICIPATE

Kulenga si kufuma.
(To aim is not to hit.)

> I'm bogged down, I know what to do in terms of what I think is transferable, but I don't think, I've figured out how to do it pedagogically yet. And I guess somehow I have to portray a facilitative rather than a master teacher, but I think that takes time and I don't know if I have time. I might just stand up there and look like a fool, I know I could be an expert for five days. But I wouldn't do it with a lot of integrity in myself. I don't know, I see myself as going not as a master teacher but as a facilitator in thinking, but I'm not sure they will let me play that role, - I'd have to be open enough to listen to another idea that might come from them. One of the problems about being culturally sensitive is, How does one be prophetic and speak to injustice or inconsistencies or things that don't work that are killing the culture? And, how does one speak to - as also a servant in the midst of that, I think that's the tension. (CP4 3-4)

This section allows the participants to express their understanding of the goals of the CMIN project along with their perceptions of the direction of the initiation or of the impetus for the project as well as the control of the CMIN. The views of the participants are also given some critical reflection by me as the researcher. The various participants reflect on the Canadians' attempts and successes at contextualization and their perception of the control of knowledge and whether it is seen as Western. Contextualization implies the process of giving course content the application, the illustrations, and the relevance for the situation in which the students are located. It also requires the educator to be aware of assumptions and values which are embodied in knowledge and to be willing to critically engage in dialogue with local knowledge, assumptions, values and understandings.

The section ends with a discussion of the problems which occurred in the project and indications of what each party suggests should be changed in the project.

Whose knowledge is it? Who sets the agenda for the Kenyans to get access? The Europeans who began to colonize East Africa established schools in the colonies as if they were the sole purveyors of knowledge, and the South was to be schooled and in so doing the indigenous people were able to fill the colonies' labour needs. Rodney (1972) says, "colonial education reached a limited number of Africans, it was restricted to elementary levels, and its pedagogical and ideological content was such as to serve the interests of Europe rather than Africa" (p.289). The role of the church was paramount in developing the school systems of Kenya and in so doing provided catechistic proselytisation. As Gould (1991) states the missions had the greatest impact on education in Kenya and were encouraged by the colonial government to continue their work of education and conversion to christianity. The colonial education system provided for a few Kenyans to be selected for academic specialization creating a dual system which was to carry over through independence. The intent was to train the majority of people for labour and a few of the selected nationals to be the elite, just like the Europeans.

The writers who discuss knowledge transfer suggest that the North has controlled the access to and the legitimation of knowledge, only allowing the most valued to be distributed on the North's own terms (Amin, 1974; Carnoy, 1974; Frank, 1967). Those terms have been modernization and development in the image of the North, yet keeping the South underdeveloped and dependent. The structure which controls knowledge is set and maintained by the elite in the capitalist West in collaboration with the local elite. The elite use the education system to prescribe the knowledge that is to be legitimated and ensure the selection system remains in their favour. Carnoy (1974) says, "knowledge itself emanates from the hierarchy. In a pyramidal capitalist hierarchy, learning in public schools is organized to maintain the hierarchical structure" (p.365).

There was, in Kenya, a petty bourgeoisie educated by the Europeans ready to assume control of capitalist enterprise and others ready for positions in the state apparatus which would support the continuity of capitalist expansion. The education system was in place to continue the reproduction of young workers and ensure the school system would maintain its Eurocentric knowledge focus. Sklair (1991) would suggest that this was part of the Trans National Corporations (TNCs) planned strategy to solicit a comprador elite from the indigenous people, who would favour the TNCs in policy in exchange for the upward mobility as members of the Trans-National Capitalist class. Sklair also suggests that knowledge, ideas and culture are being reshaped by the West through the media. Commercials in print as well as radio and television have made great strides in packaging western lifestyles for Kenyan consumption. The elite and the middle class have been reached with western commercials as have the millions of poor.

The control of knowledge through text book publication and control of scholarly journals in the North is documented by Altbach (1975). Arnove (1982) suggests that the benefit for knowledge production flows to the North with little opportunity for it to return to develop the South. Arnove (1980) states that the drain of knowledge from the Third World is similar to the capital drain experienced in unequal exchange theory.

WHOSE PLAN?

The role of parochial/sectarian agencies in the formation and development of education in Kenya should not be understated. In East Africa "education of Africans has owed almost everything to the Christian mission and very little to the colonial governments" (Rado, 1967, p.2). In the process of introducing education to Africa often the missionaries could not differentiate between Christian teaching/dogma and Western culture. The result has been a syncretism of religion and Western science and culture.

The church missionary societies readily took upon themselves the task of education in East Africa. This served well their stated purpose and intent to convert the African population (Mutua, 1975; Bray et al.,1986; D'Souza, 1987; Sifuna, 1990; Urch, 1968). The mission agencies also ran the elite schools for European children. Prior to 1924, funding assistance for schooling was only given to the European schools. Latterly, the taxation was distributed, albeit unequally, to both the European and African schools. The missions still provided between 20% and 33% of the funding to operate their schools in Kenya. At the time of independence of 5,894 primary schools operating in Kenya, all but 18 were mission sponsored schools and those remaining 18 were state sponsored. Of the 95 secondary schools in Kenya one was government sponsored, the remainder were all mission sponsored. The church dominated the educational system up until the early 1970's and remains a major sponsor of schools at all levels from primary through secondary to politechnical and tertiary institutions. In 1992 there were 14 Universities in Kenya, four state sponsored and 10 sponsored by parochial/sectarian agencies (Otiende et al., 1992).

The rate of growth of Christianity in Africa is outstripping the ability of educational institutions to produce trained leadership (Hogarth, Gatimu and Barrett, 1983). They raise the issue of whether or not theological education in Kenya could support itself with the financial and personnel resources locally available. Their answer was "No", that most East African theological institutions were not financially viable and must continue to be dependent on foreign aid. Scanlon (1966) spoke about the unfortunate residual effect of the missionary legacy for leaving the church dependent on foreign support. The drive for modernization had left the church dependent rather than empowered. The indigenous churches were not as critically affected because they had tried to be self-sustaining, or were isolated from overseas support and were forced to control their own financial and personnel resources. The Africa Brotherhood Church and ACC & S were both financially independent and were not dependent on Western support for their denominational work.

As Canadians had begun to discuss the possibility of an upgrading program with the Kenyans, the issue of dependency was an important part of that discussion. Canadians were concerned that the integrity and self-determination of these denominations be maintained. Collaboration does not have to mean equal participation. It can mean a sharing of strengths in order to assist all parties to minimize their weaknesses. Discussions were held to figure out how the work could be accomplished.

> You know there is a sense in which this whole thing came together more by accident, or rather I would say by "providential coincidence". Sure we were trying to figure out with the Kenyans how we could help them meet the needs they had articulated but nowhere did we sit and discuss any great theoretical design. The theory came into place later, really, we reflected on what we were doing as we went along. I think the Kenyans were asking us for help in upgrading based on their observation of the Canadians who worked along side

> of them in the Divinity School. The Kenyans wanted the knowledge we had and Canadians felt they could do a project to share some of it. (CP9 12-8)

Two interview questions directed the study into the planning and design process of the CMIN. The first tried to determine if the participants knew who had been involved in the planning of the project while the second question asked if there were other people who should have been involved in the planning process. The perceptions as to the participation in the initial stages of planning, that is the impetus or seed for the project, were mixed and varied. The responses were focused in four areas or themes: 1) I don't know, 2) committees, 3) individuals, 4) individuals and committees.

The current students in the project, expressing the first theme, said they did not really know.

> Now on your part of the planning I really don't know except for those ones I actually have seen, CP6 is a teacher, CP1 is a teacher, CP4, teacher, CP8, teacher so I don't know whether they sat and dreamed and planned it to the point it now reached what we have as the CMIN. But it is a great surprise that it has reached us here. On the part of the ACC & S the person who told us about it was the General Secretary. (KS3 3-2)

> I think this was fairly secret to us. But we feel happy because we have concerned leaders. I think it started with our General Secretary and our Moderator and some Canadian friends. I think there was something to do with somebody going to Canada to study, where, but they were open to see how much more the church could benefit if the people from Canada could come here instead of our Kenyan ACC & S leaders going to Canada. Maybe after hearing they heard the importance of them coming to us and the way was opened and very many people can be in the program. (KS4 3-5)

The second theme which emerged was one which suggested there were committee to committee negotiations. These participants stated that two groups of committees, Canadian and Kenyan, spent time discussing and determining what was able to be accomplished. From a historical perspective, the ABC committees never met face to face for discussions with Canadians. Representatives of ABC met with representatives of CBIM and Carey and the individuals discussed the proposed CMIN and later took the proposal to their respective committees. This was paralleled in the ACC & S situation as well.

> It was planned by a committee from Canada working with a committee from the ABC. (KG6 3-5)
>
> ABC where it came from, where you were working were the first beneficiaries. Personally when I was informed about the program and your students came to interview me I felt really jealous that we were not having the same program because it was a big group and I knew this production, when it goes out will be able to do so much that we in the ACC & S would not be able to do and that is when we felt the real need and saw the benefits of this program. I think that together with CBIM and Carey Theological College and ACC & S together we worked on and agreed to this program and started right away last year. (KA2 3-2)

The third major theme was that there were a number of individual people who created the project and it was these people who brought it to fruition.

> In accordance with what I understand, there was a teacher we call Nzyoka and another called Paul Stevens during the time with Canon Mangaya. They worked to put it together just as we have it now. At least that is how I understand the history of how they built this. I understand they put this all together on a long journey to Kisumu and the return. Out of that came the program we received called the Certificate in Ministry in the ABC. (KG2 2-7)
>
> Really if we look for the source we would say that there was a teacher here, who was given the Kikamba name Nzyoka, he saw the problems we were having and he brought some other teachers who were

> very suitable to plan, Paul Stevens, Dr. Collins but really it was his plan. (KA4 2-6)

The fourth major theme suggested that there was a combination of individuals who, acting together, were able to draw the institutions which they represented into agreement to attempt the CMIN project. In the first of the following two examples it can be noted that God is credited with a hand in the planning and creation of the project. This comment also speaks to a common theological perspective of many of the Kenyan participants that God controls and directs human actions as a matter of regular occurrence.

> For the teaching I think on the one hand really it was God. On the other hand it was God using his people to do His will with those who listened to Him. I would say it was the Canadians, the missionaries and Carey Hall they saw the need of the upgrading. Without doubt our Bishop, when he was asked he agreed to the plan and his representatives agreed to the vision presented by the missionaries from Canada to help us. (KP3 2-3)

> I'm under the impression they were mutually agreed upon between the ACC & S and Paul Steven, Regent College, CBIM and Carey hall. I have the documents, but I think the spark came from you and Paul. The spark came from our side of the river. (CP8 2-8)

The recollections of those of us who actually participated in the initial process would read like a combination of theme three and theme four. There were specific individuals who did represent their institutions yet were able to discuss the proposals with freedom and come to a design of the CMIN project which was then taken to the institutions involved for approval and implementation. The planning of the ABC CMIN involved Dr. R. Paul Stevens, Brian Stelck and Canon Rev. Samuel Mangaya who worked out a plan and then discussed it with the Bishop of the ABC. The Bishop signed the proposal and it was sent to Canada to CBIM and

Carey where it was approved. The ACC & S were introduced to the ABC CMIN through the Urban Mission course which toured one of the ACC & S Nairobi churches. The discussions were held first with representatives, then a full meeting was held with the ACC & S denominational officers, CBIM Kenya personnel and the Carey Principal and CMIN Director to finalize details of the program.

As is indicated in the previous quotation, the spark came from somewhere. Initially the ABC were asking for people to be sent to Canada for higher education. Two six hour sessions of "brain storming" and discussion lead to the proposal which became the CMIN. It was based on a modified Doctorate in Ministry program which was offered in several locations in the U.S.A. (Stevens & Stelck, 1993). One of the key sub-themes to the planning process was the direction of influence. Whose project was it in the design stage? Again participants saw it differently and the answers were varied. The Kenyan students, graduates and leadership, tended to state that their leadership was actively involved in the design and proposal stages and that they made a conscious choice to participate in the CMIN project.

> (The project was designed by) Our planning committee (ABC) lead by Mangaya, and the Bishop and his committee. (KG4 2-7)
>
> We didn't know about Carey Hall or Regent college for that matter and especially the CMIN until we heard something was going for our Brothers in the African Brotherhood Church. Since the role of the missionary working with the ACC & S and those working with the ABC sometimes overlap, the relationships overlap, so it didn't take us a long time to discover there was that exciting ministry going on. When we investigated we decided to ask more about it, and the missionaries who were actually involved in these programs with the ABC were very willing to share what it was and invite us to that kind of program if we so wished. Which we did. (KA3 2-9)

The Canadians, in contrast to the Kenyans, were split in their responses. The first participant below seemed to feel that the program came from Canadians impacting on the Kenyan bodies involved, while the second suggested it was a more mutual process of interaction and discussion which helped to create the CMIN.

> In the ABC I think we had the benefit of the input of Canon Mangaya. We had a little bit of input from the Bishop, but not a lot but we had a lot of input from Canon Mangaya. who was a thoughtful, fairly well educated Kenyan pastor who understood Western education, understood the needs of his own people and I think gave us some good advise. I think when we came to do the ACC & S one we felt we were repeating a program with some additions which we had learned from our experience with the ABC. And two additions that would have been significant one was the importance of the urban component and therefore we added a second mission course and tried to work the courses in the city. We tried to expose the students, to expose the students to urban issues much more. The second was to try to indigenize, if possible, the field supervision of the learners by having three people, two of them Kenyan and one a Canadian missionary undertake the field education supervision. These were two improvements we felt we wanted to bring to the first generation. Those improvements were made in full discussion with the ACC & S leaders who agreed with them, wanted them and shaped it to some extent their own way. (CA1 7-3)

The Kenyans participated right from the beginning in the design of the overall program. It was new to all parties (CBIM, Carey and ABC) and the discussion involved the exchange of the best information each was able to offer. The experience of the attempt to contextualize specific components lead to the realization by Carey that some modifications should be considered in discussion with the ACC & S. The example of the additional urban course was based on the knowledge that the ACC & S had three times the number of urban churches than the ABC and tended to focus on

Kikuyu's in those churches. The change to "indigenize" the field supervision was also in response to discussions regarding the observed difficulties in the ABC CMIN. When asked who planned the CMIN, this respondent stated;

> I think that is a loaded question. Theoretically and theologically and developmentally and every way, the African churches are the ones who created the objectives, the invitation and everything. But I think in practice, and I am not sure how you would really get away from this entirely, but I think we have impacted that. Basically what has emerged is some kind of cooperation. Ideally the cooperation is, (that) they are in charge in detail; they choose the students, they decide where it is going to be held, they look after that kind of thing. Our job is to come over there and they present us with these students and we sit down with these students and begin the process of certifying them and educating them for their ministry. That is the ideal. - The ideal set-up is this, it is their project not ours. The only place where we have to maintain control is academically. I think we have the right, even though we are invited, we have the right in accepting the invitation to say look it is your program and we are going to help with this, but if we are going to certify it then it has to be at a certain academic level and nobody should get the certificate unless they reach that. If they can't go along with that then we will not accept the invitation, because in our judgement there is a problem and that problem is poor education caving in at a level where there should be no if, ands or buts. If you are going to get certified you have to do it at some point. I feel we have that right in the negotiating. Even though the project is theirs, they have invited us somehow. Now historically I am not exactly sure who invited who but that was done with the ABC at some point, maybe with you or somebody. When the engines started running basically it is their project we are there to help except with the one proviso that we have to control the academic level of it. (CA2 6-3)
>
> I think, my feeling is and I don't have any objective basis for this, I feel that the ACC&S leadership looked over to the ABC project and

> said, "Is there something here we really want?", and then they must have decided, "yes there is". I don't know how closely they examined anything we had done before. But I think we sold them the project that, at least that was the meeting I was a part of, that was what was going on. We had a program to sell. (CP1 2-5)

The issue of control surfaces in the reflection on the planning of the CMIN. The Canadians tried to work collegially with their Kenyan counterparts and each party was able to carry some of the work and responsibility. The academic credential remained in the control of Carey. The budget, proposed by Carey was controlled by CBIM and the ABC controlled the student participation, selection, and the facilities. All the professors in the ABC CMIN were Canadian so the academic control was in their hands. With the ACC & S there are one course plus the field supervision in the hands of the Kenyans. The ACC & S discussions were ongoing with one of the CBIM missionaries and when the Carey people met with the ACC & S leadership there was a basic commitment by the ACC & S to request the CMIN for their church. The "selling" was more of a discussion of possible adaptations and problems previously encountered than a sales job.

In looking at who was involved in the design and planning stages it becomes necessary to ask who else should have been involved in the process. In the responses there is almost unanimous agreement from both Kenyans and Canadians that the people who were involved were the correct people and perhaps only augmenting these initial participants, with a few other people, would have brought an improvement. The answer from the Kenyan participants was that the right people were involved.

> I guess we involved the people we should have involved, from my own perspective we involved the people we should have involved. (KA3 2-11)

> I think at that stage we were the right people

> because we were representatives of different groups and those groups we represented they shared with us our vision and our dreams, so I think at that initial stage that was the core group that should have worked on this program which seemed to have worked very well. (KA2 3-4)

The Canadians were not as direct with their answers about who else should have been involved, but chose rather to respond in terms of the ideal plan of action, given the leisure and time to investigate, design and reflect before anything began. The result of this is that the lists of "who else should have been involved" vary only a small amount from the actual involvement registry.

> I don't know who else would have been involved in planning on the ACC & S side. On the CBIM side of things, if we had a person who was more knowledgeable in the areas of education and theological education. - Someone who had your training in the last year could fit in and give us guidance there. On the Kenya side the ACC & S, I don't know unless we went to the University or something or spoke to another agency that had some insights into Kenyan education. We really didn't have an expert. (CP8 3-2)

> Certainly CBIM missionaries on the field should have been in those meetings. I believe that (the Principal of Carey) should have been party to the negotiating meetings and that one of the difficulties we have with the program is that (the Principal) was brought into the program after the fact on a whole lot of elements of the program and he permitted that and its part of his leadership style to do that but I think he should have been more directly involved in negotiations. (CP1 3-3)

> I think if we were to do it again and had the leisure which we didn't seem to have at the time, of more preparatory reflection that we would have been wise to pull together a sample group of the people who would receive the program and meet with them intensively to find out where they were at, what their needs were, what their expectations were and even to get a history of what they learned and how they occurred so we could build on

> that. Now I need to tell you that as far as I know there is not one institution that does that. (CA1 7-5)

Kenyans had not expressed a need for anyone else to have been involved in the planning and design process yet Canadians talked about other potential participants in the process. The timing of involvement of the Carey Principal and the point at which people on the field were involved are important criticisms. For example, now a survey of a sample group of the students could be carried out. In the initial stages of the CMIN planning the Kenyan church leadership and the Canadian missionaries were working in theological education and believed they understood the situation and needs because of their daily classroom involvement with students. The human-dynamics which were present in the planning process enabled the CMIN "experiment" to be approved and applied. The individuals who worked to create the plan wanted to see the church benefit. The Canadians knew their own process and protocol and worked it through the Canadian institutional settings. The Kenyans were likewise able to process the CMIN through their structures. The students were not consulted, they were informed of the program start. As will be discussed in chapter five, the resistance which did surface from the students as the CMIN began, might have proved to prevent the CMIN from beginning or perhaps discussion with the potential students would have reduced the initial opposition. The question remains rhetorical.

One final item which bears reflection at this point surfaces around the question, Who is in charge of the CMIN?, that is, who are in the key positions of responsibility for the program continuation. The students in the current program saw their Kenyan practicum supervisors as filling the key role.

> According to the booklet we have been given we have supervisors of the program who are the General Secretary, the Moderator, the Canadian man who is here, and the lecturers who are coming. Usually we are in the hands of those people who are here. Even now the lecturers we are having have to go back so the people that we are given to supervise us are doing something good. (KS5 3-5)

The Kenyan supervisors acknowledged their roles and as being part of the process, that is, they were in charge of the continuation of the learning when no Canadian professor was in the classroom. Jurisdiction was split depending on the class schedule and location of personnel. The Canadians acknowledged the Director as being in charge of the project, yet at the same time the role and duty of the Director caused confusion for the Canadian participants.

> Here or there, I'd like to think at this point that for CBIM I'm in charge of the CMIN with ACC & S. On the Canadian side (the Director) is taking care of things and from the Kenyan side in the ACC & S (the General Secretary and Moderator) are in charge of it so its not clear cut. But no one thinks I'm in charge of it at this point. This is my own grabbing at some authority. (CP8 3-6)

> (The Director), and the fax from (the Principal) where we were asking about the $200.00 food subsidy and (the Principal) couldn't give an answer (so) he turned to (the Director) to send us the answer. (The Director) sets up the budget, (The Director) sets up the travel schedule. (The Director) sets up the assignments and (the Principal) endorses those decisions. I think one of the hurdles is, the relationship between the Principal and the Director are not clear. (CD 3-9)

The split responsibilities along with the distance between Nairobi and Vancouver created some ambiguity and confusion. The Principal of Carey was ultimately responsible for the CMIN and delegated the operation of the program to the Director. The Director in turn, with the ACC & S, delegated the field supervision role to the Kenyans with the assistance of the resident CBIM missionary. Budgets were set by Carey but are approved and funded by CBIM but, as will be discussed under problems of the CMIN in chapter five, CBIM does not have an accountability structure with Carey. The confusion stems, in part, from the human dynamics which developed the CMIN. The flexibility and vision which were able to react to change created some of the confusion as the project was incorporated into an institutional structure.

THE TARGET GOALS

In looking at the goals of the CMIN, not one of the participants identified, or quoted the written goals in reference to the goals of the CMIN. Only four of the Canadians had read the goals, as had only three of the Kenyans. (See Appendix B entitled CMIN Project Goals for these stated goals.) The predominant themes, expressed among the Canadians, regarding the goals of the CMIN, were theological upgrading and leadership development.

> The ultimate goal of course is to facilitate the maturation of the indigenous church. The means to that is by raising the expertise of its leaders in specific areas having to do with theological education. (CP5 1-6)

> The objective, I felt, and the reason I have been supporting it all along, is we were going there on invitation to assist the African people, the ABC first and now the ACC & S, to provide them with leadership development with the vision that, that objective would create a situation in which the African people would be able to do their own leadership development programs. My feeling is if we just go in and train a group of people to become above average leaders through a certification program and that is all we do I think. That is a lot but I don't think it is adequate as an objective. So it really is a two stage objective, leadership development with the hope that they can pick it up and do it

themselves. (CA2 5-3)

These two responses would suggest that to set up a goal is also to reach the goal. The Canadians did elaborate on the process of teaching and knowledge exchange but focused their responses to the question regarding their perception of the CMIN goal(s). They understood the task and proceeded to meet the objective of the CMIN each through their own course content.

The theme of contextually relevant theological education was raised as a goal by all of the Canadian participants. It was of concern to Canadians that the content of their courses and the program generally be contextualized. One of the basic components of the project was to give contextualized education in Kenya rather than transporting people into a Canadian environment and context where the transferability of context would be more difficult. Although this will be discussed more fully later in this chapter, it warrants mention here in that the Canadians saw as one of the goals the contextualization of the theological education and the leadership development. If knowledge is to be emancipatory and empowering it must be applicable to the lived experience. This applicability to the Kenyan setting was important to the Canadians.

> The goal of the CMIN from my point of view is to bring a contextually acceptable form of theological education to the group of Kenyans. (CP8 2-6)
>
> I've read most of the stuff that was written and the perception of what we are trying to do, the way I explained it to some people in our church, is that rather than bring third world people over, out of context and educate theologically etc. What we are trying to do is, at least contextually, at least work out of the context in which they are going, to be going, to be doing ministry in the long run and therefore rather than bringing people

> over actually educating them in the place where they will ultimately be ministering. (CP4 1-2)

The Kenyans interviewed had a basic understanding which followed two main themes, the first of which had a two branched sub-theme. The first theme was leadership upgrading and the second theme was the enhancement of denominational potential. Twelve of the Kenyans stated that the main goal of the CMIN was to upgrade or uplift the educational level of the leadership. The need for leadership development is a theme expressed by the church as well as by the secular society in most countries of the world. Must the leadership be developed in the West or is it possible to bring the knowledge to the potential leaders and make the application in the home context.

Education is a slow process and investment in it takes time to bring results. The African nations were encouraged to meet the shortfalls in education by importing foreign expertise and foreign development packages. As well, another quick solution was to accept the West's offer and send the top students overseas for tertiary education, after all, there was "widespread faith in the *superiority* of overseas qualifications, especially those from the West" (Toh & Farrelly, 1991, p.116). There was also belief that those educated overseas would return home and the benefit of their education would "trickle down" to the balance of the population (Moock, 1984). A cursory analysis of the studies cited in Toh and Farrelly (1991) show that the growth in the number of students in tertiary education who went overseas from the South had grown from just over 100,000 in 1950 to almost 1 million by 1980. There is a perceived reciprocal benefit for both countries in this process. The host nation gains from the cultural experience of having foreign students study in their institutions. This can also provide the potential for contacts and, therefore, a friendly future entry into the elite of the graduate's nation. Projects can potentially be linked with the contacts of former students or the students themselves. The South receives back "a ready source of highly qualified personnel with technological knowledge and skills deemed 'beneficial' to development in all its dimensions" (p.117). The top academic students sometimes are enticed to stay in the West through what is referred to as the "brain drain". Others facing uncertainty if they return home would choose to become permanent residents in the host country. The graduates who returned to their homes would invariably carry with them knowledge. As Toh and Farrelly (1991), Arnove (1980) and Berman (1979) have analyzed, such knowledge has been largely shaped by the modernization paradigm. The question of leadership development is therefore two-fold. How does a nation develop its top leadership without that leadership being enticed to remain abroad? Most importantly, whether local or overseas based, what paradigm assumptions, values and knowledge underpin the leadership development that is critical to South countries.

The responses to questions about the goal of leadership development in the CMIN proposed the sub-themes of upgrading of education and knowledge as well as the sub-theme of educating leadership in order to assist other people. The focus on being able to utilize the resultant knowledge in the individual's life situation was important.

> The main goal of the CMIN was to upgrade the leadership of the ABC. (KA4 2-4)
>
> When we began the CMIN I think the goal was to assist in upgrading our educational level. To gain knowledge about things of God, how to live with other people, how to grow spiritually. (KG3 2-1)

The sub-theme of educating leadership in order to assist other people was expressed. The care and concern for others was genuine and reveals the cultural understanding of the African community. There is a concept of African socialism which has stemmed from the cultural interdependency and survives in a desire to share with others the food, shelter or the knowledge an individual has gained (Nyerere, 1968). The Kenyan students were eager to share what they had learned with other people. Knowledge which prepared them to help others seemed to be like a treasure to be given away.

> So far, I understand the CMIN to be, where I will be equipped so by I can also be able to equip others, yes. In this case I think much about the women I work with. Because some of the sections I run, I go and teach them and we share, then they continue to do that, they continue to share with other ladies. (KS2 1-4)
>
> I think the most important goal is to have a change. They want to liberate us. You know a little knowledge can kill a man. We had that knowledge that we were Christians, we've been working before they came. We've been sharing what we had before they came but they have done a lot to try and liberate our spiritual, no, what can I say, No they try to liberate what we have to empower us to try to utilize what we already have. They are not bringing us anything, they are not equipping us with something new but they are training us to help us to use the power that we have. So the goal is to help us to use the power we have to liberate all God's people after ourselves being liberated. Yes! (KS4 3-3)

The printed transcript portion does not do justice, on its own, to the voiced expression of this student who spoke in English for the interview. The "Yes!" was a triumphant shout of jubilation emphasized by a rising to the feet and a clenched fist, somewhat akin to the sports player who scores after serious competition or struggle. Yes! It is the "Yes!" of someone whose personal liberation has found expression in the extension to others of that same liberation. The term liberation was used in the sense of freedom. It is the freedom to utilize knowledge so that the binding or enslavement of false perspectives can be set asside. It is the gaining of personal knowledge and skills in order to assist others. The setting loose of an individual to use their knowledge as they feel it is necessary to use. Their is a sense to which this is a release to link knowledge with the life-world in a holistic way. It is a form of liberation theology which permits this release. The second of these two statements expresses the empowering of individuals to utilize the knowledge in their own situation, that is liberation.

> The CMIN on the whole brings knowledge. It is educating. The goal is to help people to, you know, there are many people who are impoverished, people who are without joy in their lives, people with troubles, poverty stricken and they can-not even care for themselves. The goal of the CMIN is to assist the leadership, pastors, elders to work together to build the Kingdom of Heaven. (KS3 2-7)

The second major theme which was expressed as a goal of the CMIN by the Kenyan participants focused entirely on the manifestations of the individual Christian denominations to which this project was addressed. The Kenyans stated that the holistic application of Christian teaching provides for the social welfare of the poor, the oppressed and any who are not able to "care for themselves". The "Kingdom of Heaven" is understood as both a temporal and an eternal citizenship in which the Christian may participate. The church must act to eliminate injustice, oppression, poverty, and anything which hinders the expression of a full and abundant life. One of the areas where change was indicated was within the clergy structure and practice. The polity of both the Kenyan denominations has maintained an implied control of the ministry of the church in the hands of the clergy. The practice of the church and the doctrine which were espoused were not parallel. This criticism can be levelled against Canadian Baptists as well. The doctrine of a priesthood of all believers is upheld by all three denominations, however, the outworking and application of the doctrine seem to be subsumed with the clergy assuming office. The release of all the congregation to be part of the ministry was new to these students.

> I think the goals is to bring many people to the Lord, many many people to the Lord. (KS1 1-4)
>
> If you are a Christian and you know Jesus Christ they are trying to show you that you are a Christian. What can you do with that Christianity now with that theology you have, you know you are a Christian. What can you do so that your faith can be more effective as a Christian. So they are doing a lot to help us to know the power that is in us, to use that power so it will be effective in the ministry and they are doing very good. So the goal of them is to see that we are all liberated to know what we have received. What we received when we became a Christian, because some of us became a Christian and sometimes they have doubts of their faith but they just keep quiet they don't want to speak before people. They are very shy. When they (Canadians) are trying to show us what the life of a Christian is and how a Christian should behave and the work of a Christian we feel very much liberated because they are empowering us to do something with what God has done to (for) us. (KS4 3-3)
>
> One is to upgrade our existing personnel that needs some kind of upgrading in terms of handling their pastoral duties. The other one is to kind of help them to see the benefit of releasing the ministry to other people so they don't think that they are jack-of-all-trades that they can control the program. To help them to identify and appreciate other people's gifts and how those gifts can be utilized in our local churches. So I would see it as a revival, a regenerating kind of ministry so our objective is to see whether we can be able to bring up a group that can bring some kind of a revitalize(ation) of the gospel in our church and a group that can be able to see the church of the future. A group that can be able to cope with the pressing needs of our people. (KA2 2-4)

The Kenyan students and their administrators certainly felt that one of the key goals in the CMIN project was the enhancement of the proclamation of their Christian teaching and the strengthening of their church mission. There was a realization that by learning some skills and techniques the Kenyan church would be enhanced in its ability to carry the Christian message beyond themselves.

TEACHING IN CONTEXT

The Sub-Saharan region and the coastal strip of East Africa had a much earlier exposure to knowledge which was "revealed truth" with the impact of Islam and the Koranic schools. Later, during the early colonial period, mission organizations also presented the Christian "revealed truth" as knowledge to be obtained. However, the secular humanism which was gradually dominating Western knowledge soon replaced these two parallel sources of revealed truth as the knowledge to be acquired. The transfer was to be only that knowledge which would assist the capital accumulation process of the metropol. Mutua (1975), a Kenyan, wrote that the African saw development as that which was equated to Western civilization. The mission schools, in taking on the educative role in Kenya, also participated in the transfer of knowledge in fields beyond only religious doctrines. These included not only literacy, science and technology but also the shift in value formation which would open the way to a shift from traditional to commercial economies in Kenya. Western colonizers presented three components to their education model. To be Western was to be literate, educated and Christian. The indigenous people had traditionally seen no difference between spiritual and practical knowledge so it followed that there was no difference between the European's secular and religious instruction. "The African saw economic value in literacy, education and Christianity" (Mutua, 1975, p.11). Ezewu (1983), writing in Nigeria, states "European schooling, which was rejected at first, became important as it was seen as a source of becoming a black white man" (p.139). This same sentiment had been made by Fanon (1967). The modern holistic response to all of education, economics and spiritual life is in harmony with the unity that Africans believed should exist in life. Commenting on the tragedy of the removal of traditional spiritual and cultural values Verhelst (1990) says

> The tragedy of the Third World is therefore, profoundly cultural and spiritual, rather than merely technical, economic or political. If the cultural and spiritual basis is destroyed, one risks disaster. It is then that a society sets on the one-way road of inertia and fatalism. (p.158)

This is not to suggest that all that the mission schools did was wrong. There were a number of practices which the church challenged and, in so doing, forced the indigenous culture to confront itself. Rodney, although generally very critical of European and Christian mission intervention said,

> in its hostility towards African cultural and religious manifestations the Christian church did perform certain progressive tasks. Practices such as killing twins and trial by ordeal were frowned upon by the European missionaries, and those were reflections of superstitious ideas rooted in an early stage of African development, when something like the birth of twins could not be scientifically explained, and, therefore gave rise to religious fears. (Rodney, 1972, p.278)

The basic cultural belief that the material and the spiritual are linked still permeates the lived experience and, therefore, knowledge of most Africans. Education which does not clash with this knowledge would be readily assimilated. The CMIN professors hoped they would be able to take the course material they wanted to teach and by linking it with the spiritual and material dimensions give the Kenyans an opportunity to implement the knowledge in their experience.

The issue of ownership of the CMIN project was investigated from the position of contextualization of the course content or of the knowledge. Questions and concerns regarding the contextualization or lack of it were most significant for the Canadians. It would be fair to state that all but one of the Canadian participants interviewed were very concerned about their own and their colleagues' abilities to adequately contextualize the courses. This concern extended also to the Senate of Carey Theological College which pushed each professor to articulate the way they would contextualize. The Urban courses were planned with site visits to Kenyan projects where the CMIN students could encounter and experience new models within both their own cultural setting but also within the structures that control Kenyan society. The cross-cultural missions course drew extensively on the participants' experiences of ministry within different tribal groupings. Hiebert (1983) suggests "contextualization avoids the ethnocentrism of a monocultural approach by taking cultural differences seriously" (p. 108). Stackhouse (1988) suggests that contextualization attempt to place the content into the "here and now" for the learner, the question which he then raises is "how big is a here and how long is a now?" (p.80). To contextualize assumes the communication of meaning and its application in the life-world of the recipient culture. That is, what matters is how the content or work is re-signified in the context of linguistic, social and power relationships in a given environment, and over a specific period of time.

Even though the CMIN program followed the design of the Canadian CMIN with attempts to contextualize, there were problems which reflected the difficulty of adaptation.

> Carey Theological College was incredibly willing to embrace a version of their CMIN program which wasn't exactly like what they would do on their own campus. It was adapted for the Africa Brotherhood Church situation and their Senate basically didn't make a peep. They saw the program go and didn't make any recommendations, the second generation, wisely, they are being a little tougher and they are saying we want to see the course before it is taught. We want to make sure it is contextualized and not just teaching Western values and stuff like that. I think it is very responsible on the part of the Senate.
> I think all of the faculty and one of them, of course more than the others, but all of the faculty made enormous goofs culturally. Some they knew about and some they didn't. I see that as a problem in the program, it was partly ameliorated by your presence in three of the four years, it was partly ameliorated by the maturity of the class. A young class would not have told us what was going on. The age group we had by and large told us when they were upset about something, when they didn't understand something or if they were offended by something they often told us. We had a fair bit of that and still do with the ACC & S class but with a young class I don't think we would have got that because they would have had too high a level of respect for their teacher. We did make some cultural goofs. (CA1 8-3)

The cultural "goofs" were to the professors the moments when their ethnocentrism had not been challenged sufficiently by alternative cultural possibilities to be able to respond in a "locally appropriate" fashion. The professors wanted their course material and their personal dialogue with individual students to be "heard". When the attempts to bring illustrations, experiences, and life situations missed in meaning, the professors felt they or their colleagues had failed to contextualize.

The issue of contextualization and its correlation with the potential for bringing about the possibility for change was addressed by Freire (1972). To place the conversation or the teaching into the context in which the participants live and draw meaning greatly enhances the learning situation. In looking at university assistance to the Third World, Coleman and Court (1993) stated that "the results of efforts to indigenize the curriculum and teaching materials were mixed" (p.281). The facilitator within the learning setting has the responsibility of becoming sufficiently aware of the context, cultural, economic and socio-political background of the students to be effective in relating to the learners. Some of the Canadians really struggled with this issue. Perhaps one of the ways which a struggle, like the following, could be resolved is to give an orientation to each of the professors. The three of the first four professors who taught with the ABC each had five to ten days of in-Kenya orientation with the CBIM missionaries and ABC leadership before they entered the classroom. With the ACC & S only one of the professors had no orientation in Kenya before beginning the teaching. This is a weakness which is discussed in chapter five.

> Now I'm going over with a lot of qualms, I really am, I at one level, I'm thinking geez do I have the audacity to go over and do something you know when I've only been there a few times, this will be my third time. But very short periods of time. Are there not people there who could have taught some of this stuff, that are already there. So I have some particular (questions), but I wouldn't just say that about me, I would say that about most of the people who go over. Like does CD have to go over, to teach a class? Or could we have got someone else who was already over there, perhaps a Kenyan could do that. Are you buying into the "everything Western is better", so I'm going over with a lot of mixed feelings, like I really - because this year I'm teaching on contextualization, I think I'm so scared about that, like about not being contextual. And I'm probably more nervous about this than anything else I've ever done. I could go over and tell stories and do my thing - I don't know if it will translate. So I'm quite fearful actually. Its not culture shock as much as it is irrelevant. I'm

> going to go over there and be irrelevant, but they'll be nice to me because I'm the teacher who came over from Canada, and that's what I understand they are like. (CP4 2-3)

> I suspect when it is all said and done that contextually we will probably have missed the mark a lot of times, most of the time. I don't know. I really believe it would be best done with a (Kenyan leader) with the background skills of a (Canadian participants). Coming in, CD, I just fear. - I know the North American way and I don't think much has changed in the last couple of years. The North American urban approach just seems radically different from Third World Nairobi. He's coming in Friday and teaching Monday, you know Wednesday no Tuesday whatever. It is not long enough. Even me, I've been here two years, I should be an expert and to do things contextually, indigenous in a way that is acceptable. It takes a lifetime to do it well I suspect. (CP8 6-3)

The Canadians who were concerned about their ability to contextualize were all somewhat nervous about the probability that gross cultural errors might have been made. They did not want to offend in case that destroyed either the personal friendships established or the classroom opportunities provided within the project framework. Although the professors discussed the cultural context of the situation they constantly asked about the relevance of their material to the students and their work situations. Questions about the impact of the Leadership course on the relationships in the denomination were of great concern. There was a desire to help the Kenyans become more effective in their own church settings and that motivated the Canadians to ask about the needs and relevance of material as they taught. They asked the students, the leadership and they asked the CBIM missionaries. The ABC has a cross section of tribes in the church so the situations raised by the students in class were diverse. The issue of gender relevance was a constant struggle for the Canadians as not all of the men in the ABC CMIN were sympathetic to women being included in the course. The Canadians generally questioned each other's ability and success at contextualization in their responses, perhaps looking for re-assurance that they had not been major culture offenders.

Of the Kenyan participants only one spoke in terms of the Canadians' contextualization of the material. The balance of the discussion focused on the theme of "Western teaching", "whiteman's teaching" or, the most common term employed, "Mzungu teaching". The term "Mzungu" has both the neutral and negative connotations of whiteman and Westerner. My experience has been that there are times when for example a group of teens shout "Mzungu" they are using it in a very derogatory fashion. When I would pass the nursery school and the little children shouted "Mzungu" they were excited to see me again, the same word shouted but with totally different emphasis and meaning attached. It is a Swahili term which is used in Kenyan English and was used in both the Swahili and English interviews.

> One of the benefits of this program is that it is not teacher to student directed. It is horizontal, a sharing program a, its a discovering program. It comes right to the context and the participants will have time to disagree and bring the Mzungu to the context. That is why I said the Canadians will benefit because they are also learning from the students. I would like to convince that person that our work today, working as different people is not the work that was done by the early missionaries where they were coming to convert the "heathens". This is a ministry where we team up together, we share and try to discover together our different spiritual gifts. Not only our spiritual gifts but even the physical gifts, what the Canadians have and what I have and how we can be able to build ourselves up as brothers and sisters and appreciate those gifts together so that we can be able to strengthen the church of our Lord. (KA2 5-5)

> I could not agree with that person that these courses are western only. Because I have taken things myself from the courses, what I have achieved from the course is helping my congregation, so I cannot say that it is Western teaching. Let me tell you something. When we began to be taught 2 plus 2 equals 4 this was brought by the Westerners wasn't it. But now to say that this is only mzungu teaching is not correct because even we teach and learn these things. There are areas where we are down so we can not say it is bad or that it is only Western teaching. (KS3 3-10)

As I heard this participant make the statement I made a note to myself that this student had a dramatic truth that others need to hear. Just because a skin is "mzungu" (white) that is no reason to reject what they have to say. I was mentally taken back to a University class experience where I had been excluded from discussion for being a white male. This Kenyan had seen through superficial differences to look at the substance of the teaching.

Three of the graduates from the first phase of the CMIN project aired concern about the inability of one Canadian professor to bring the level of teaching within the grasp of the Kenyan students. The concern was that this particular professor did not adjust the vocabulary nor the content so that it had any meaning for the Kenyan situation. In hind sight the question is raised, Would or could an orientation program have altered this situation?

> One of the teachers came and he was absolutely impossible to understand. At least I can say from my perspective I did not understand but as I read the text book I began to understand a bit. (KG4 3-1)

> That course that was taught by CD was a great problem for us because his language was so far above us we could not understand it. (KG1 3-3)

The Kenyans knew that the professor who did not, or could not contextualize by either the use of examples or by a change in the level of English used, was not effective in the classroom setting. The course had been a waste. It had also almost caused a number of the students to withdraw from the CMIN. To contextualize for these students meant making the course understandable through illustrations, vocabulary and level of course concepts. Meaning and understanding were important aspects of contextualization.

The concern expressed by the Canadians over contextualization seemed to present a dichotomy of perspective. At one extreme were the professors who approached the Kenyan classroom with the same material and illustrations which would appear in the Canadian classroom. The other extreme were the professors who were so concerned with their needing to contextualize that they were apologetic about their going into a Kenyan classroom. Perhaps a better orientation process would have brought some balance between the positions. I was able to suggest to those who were concerned that they go and listen, ask questions and try to present their course material with a balance between their concern and their confidence in their teaching.

The discussion about contextualization did have an application within one course in the ABC CMIN. The course in cross-cultural mission discussed the need to be culturally sensitive in crossing tribal lines in mission work. The students expressed their knowledge and its application to their work during the interviews. Perhaps the example they had experienced, with both positive and negative attempts by professors, had been useful for their understanding of being contextual.

WHOSE KNOWLEDGE?

It has been established that the North/West with the help of the local elite controls knowledge and its access, thus maintaining a dependency and unequal exchange of that knowledge. However, this does not imply that dependency analysis is reductionist in dismissing all knowledge from the North. What is crucial is the underpinning paradigm of such knowledge and its implications for the well-being and cultural integrity of South peoples.

As discussed in Chapter 1 Habermas looked at knowledge through a conceptual framework with three basic constitutive interests, technical, practical and emancipatory. The knowledge of the "North" would be technical in descriptor. The preactical knowledge has cultural and historical social interaction so is less oriented on North-South divisions. The emancipatory knowledge for Habermas comes from the praxis of critique of the technical and practical knowledge.

One of the interesting texts regarding the theme of contextualization from this study, centres on the appearance of the assignment of knowledge to the West. The suggestion that North (West) has controlled the knowledge, and has some form of ownership over its legitimation and transfer, is discussed by the Kenyan participants. Nine of the Kenyans interviewed suggested that it was out of order to assume that the CMIN course content was Western material or knowledge. There was an escalation in the emotional tone in the voices as this subject was discussed. The very suggestion that Christianity was Western was an anathema to the Kenyan students.

> It is not teaching from abroad, it is the truth, international teaching which should be used to teach everybody. The books which we used from the teachers are indeed true. If there, this and that happened then we can not say it is Western teaching. The teaching of history, of the Bible is not Western teaching. It is God's teaching to be given to people to pass on to help others. If it were only Western teaching many would have deserted the teaching. (KG2 5-9)

The assumption by this participant that this "is the truth" comes out of the belief that the Christian Bible is the infallible revelation of God. The assumption that teaching based on the Bible also is "true", is an extrapolation beyond support. Some forms of Christianity rightly bear the criticism of historically being exclusive (Netland, 1987) in a pluralistic world. This means that claims of truth which are not compatible with the Biblical position must be false. Both the ABC and the ACC & S would take this stance but the stance would not find support among all Canadian Baptists.

The Kenyans suggest that this knowledge, which Canadians were bringing to the classroom, was the possession of all and was to be shared by all. There was also a differentiation in being able to learn from a Westerner and making a choice with regard to the content coming from the West and whether or not one would accept that knowledge into a life plan.

> It's very difficult to even contemplate the notion that someone is introducing something that would not be compatible with what we believe by way of faith or even teaching... We train with so many other people, short term courses, workshops and things like that. In fact, resource persons have come to the ACC & S and we often believe we have a right not to use that which we don't think is marketable in our own situation... Indeed that is why I said that Canadian Baptists are people whom we have known for a long time, people whose faith we have tested even in many ministries here in Kenya. We don't have anything on which to raise any suspicion that they are teaching wrong things. At any rate, even when we train locally here at places like Saint Paul's we still place our students under other people who have trained Western style or whatever so that does not bother us a bit. We have not detected anything that is contrary to our faith or teaching. (KA3 4-9)

In the above statement there is also a very subtle sub-text which indicates that the Kenyans will look for those who will assist them in their acquisition of the knowledge which is needed for their situation. The Kenyan leadership will attempt to find those who are willing to share the knowledge with the church. The statement refers to "what we don't think is marketable in our situation" and an example was given by one of the other participants.

> KS1; We tried to tell them that we seek the good things that fit in our lives but we are leave (ing out) those other things.
>
> Nzyoka; For example?
>
> KS1; There was one professor that told us that the Canadian Christians used to drink alcohol. We in African culture we don't. That is one that we rejected completely to say we can not encourage the Christian to drink alcohol because it finally adds to do other bad things.

The CMIN might introduce issues or content which clashed with the Kenyan practice and experience and these were neither accepted nor rejected without some discussion.

> I would say that some might call the teaching Western but I would say that it is not Western, it is not Whiteman's teaching. I would say that it is Christian, it is the will of God that brought it. Those who disagree and say this is Western teaching do not understand the true meaning of Christianity. Otherwise why would someone, whether white or whatever, give up what they have to come and stay with us. What would be their benefit? To come and stay maybe others do not understand this. If you close the door of opportunity for us to learn because a few people do not understand the value or use of this teaching it would be like binding the people or imprisoning them. So it is necessary to add the CMIN so that others can be included in the program. Others, whether they are women or men or whoever they are, should be given the opportunity. Those of us who have studied know the meaning of the teaching. (KG3 5-7)

There are two statements embedded in KG3 5-7 which warrant a further examination. This respondent asks an excellent question. The first statement, which was addressed by the Canadians in chapter three was, Why would someone give up a comfortable lifestyle in the West, with no hope of earthly gain, to go to the third world and live and work? It is understandable why a capitalist would go to seek capital accumulation potential. The motivation for the agents of world powers or transnational corporations has been relatively well stated (Sklair, 1991). However, while there may also be "non-capitalist" factors behind overseas work (e.g. egotistical pursuits, the desire for power, the wish to escape), the Kenyans did not impute any of these motives to the Canadians. This willingness of the Canadians to "come", as KG3 states, bringing the knowledge to help others around themselves was seen as "mandatory". The refusal to bring the knowledge would be a binding and imprisoning action. There is a responsibility for the Canadians to assist with this process. The arrogance of Westerners to think they can own "God's teaching" is not part of the understanding of this Kenyan participant. To suggest that Canadians, and therefore Westerners, even thought they held this teaching was contemptible. Kenyans "knew" the teaching did not belong to the West but was the property of everybody. It may not have been shared openly prior to this time but here, with the CMIN, Canadians had agreed to share it with Kenyans. These respondents express the theme that this is universal- international teaching and the Kenyans also are entitled to the use and application of that which the West has had for a number of years. There is a need to problematize the notion of what could be considered "international" or "universal" teaching as differentialed from localized or regionalized teaching. This issue is compounded when it refers to theological or "religious" teaching. Does theological knowledge have ownership? The Kenyans indicate they too want to be part of theological teaching.

> When we began the CMIN there were those who thought this is only the Western or White-man thing, it was the objective of an outside denomination but they later realized differently and agreed to the study. Some of them even now admit they did us wrong by opposing and now wish they could be included. They are even asking why can't we have teaching like the CMIN? (KG1 4-5)

There was an apparent initial tension within the greater body of recipients regarding the project. Perhaps it had come because of generations of abuse at the hands of colonial masters and from an educational system which denied access to knowledge except for an elite. The recipients of the CMIN were confronted with the dilemma. Was this teaching another form of domination and foreign control or was this a legitimate attempt to assist, to upgrade and to provide initial tools for the liberation of ideas and peoples? Those within the course made their decisions for the latter as the courses progressed. These will be discussed in chapter five. The administrators made their decisions about the value of the CMIN when they allowed the project to begin. Colleagues of those in the project waited until the results of the entire first phase of the project had been given a change to show some results before they were willing to suggest the CMIN did not follow the colonial pattern of educational control.

THE PROBLEMS

Lest the reader begin to assume that only the positive and the success has been retained in this study, this section is included to suggest some reflection was done on the problems in the project. The section speaks more about the overall transfer process and interaction with participants than it says about theory or theology. The participants were asked to reflect on those areas where problems, hurdles or difficulties surfaced in the project. They were also asked for "any suggestions they might have for improving the project for the future". This form of questioning was used as a means of circumventing the politeness of Kenyan culture which would only wish to give positive answers.

The participants came up with a total of five (5) major themes as well as several individual suggestions for improvement. Canadians put forward four (4) of the themes raised by the Kenyans as well as one Canadian sub-theme. Canadians and Kenyans alike touched on the problem areas with themes of 1)finances, 2)language of instruction, 3)participation in the project, 4)practicum experience and 5)course related issues.

Finances

The issue of finances was raised by almost all of the participants. Canadians focused on their attempts to remain within the budgets as well as the need for a more defined accountability process for the funding and expenditures of the budget.

> There seem to be very few problems at this point. finances, trying to keep things reasonable at this point for the students, for our organization. (CP8 5-3)

> Finances is one thing, I would change the way the money flows, that would be the first thing I would do. Money flows primarily from Mississauga to Vancouver and is dispensed. I don't think it is good that money flows from Mississauga to Vancouver but this time, (the director) is not here this time and he was always the dispenser of money everything I've had to do with him, I've got the money from (him) paid my bills while I was here gave me my $20.00 when I got to the Airport. And (the Director) is not here and now we have course costs and those kinds of things that we

> don't have a clear line of authority for. We get them from the treasurer here but we don't have any clear line. We have a budget, that we can work within but we don't have any clear line of accountability or authority that needs to be, I think the whole thing needs to come through the standard CBIM process. Accountability of funding is another thing. I carefully kept receipts last year against the money I was granted and nobody ever collected the receipts, in fact they are sitting in Vancouver today. I think that we ought to have an accountability system built in place that actually requires you to account for all the funds. (CP1 6-5)

The Kenyan difficulties with finances have partly to do with the economic situation in Kenya and the transportation costs of attending numerous short courses involved in the CMIN. Kenya has undergone dramatic devaluation of the Kenyan Shilling coupled with the upward price adjustments internally. This demand placed on Kenya by the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund (IMF) has cut very deeply into the pockets of the poor. The supervisors also found the cost of their supervision was a hindering factor in doing their task; the price of fuel, oil, repairs and public transportation had escalated beyond their ability to pay. The weakness of the planning process surfaces in this area. The cost of the Canadian supervision had been absorbed within the CBIM operational budget for missionaries in the ABC CMIN and so was not reflected in the budget process for the ACC & S.

> I know this program came to us at a time when things were too hard on us , economically, and some of the problems we are experiencing have nothing to do with your problems or are not emanating from the program they are coming from our day to day lives. (KA3 3-7)

> The other thing, as you know with us, is the local people here. One of the biggest problems I have is the problem of reaching where the students are because financially, you find that we really don't

> have enough finances and travelling now is becoming really difficult. The cost of fuel is going high every day. Repairing your car, which definitely doesn't belong to the church, which is your personal car, because our churches are very young churches. (KA2 3-6)

What Language?

Mutua (1975) suggests that the policy of English being used ever increasingly will not likely be reversed. The elite in Kenya have studied in British, Canadian, Australian and American Universities and will push for their children to study in English. The world economic order is controlled by the English speaking world which again adds to the desire for English competency amongst the business and government communities. Students feel the pressure to learn in English if they hope to enter business, government or the academic worlds.

Kenya has more than 30 vernacular languages, which in itself presents major logistical problems. There are economic factors because of the costs of production and distribution as well as problems of developing primary school text books in multiple mother tongues. The use of vernacular also restricts the mobility of teachers who come from different language backgrounds. Luo teachers are not readily accepted in schools where Kikuyu is the vernacular, however if the language of instruction is Kiswahili or English transfers can be facilitated.

The rapid urbanization of Kenya has brought changes to the education system as well. The major cities are no longer represented by any homogeneous language group. The city functions in two languages, Kiswahili and English, and all parents want their children to have the language advantages of the city schools. As mother tongue is ever increasingly seen as a part of a rural education, pressure will grow from parents in the rural areas to move away from the vernacular to one or both of the languages of instruction. This will eventually be inclusive for all levels of instruction.

One of the questions not addressed in the literature is whether the current demand for European language instruction has the potential of becoming a means by which a North-South knowledge control gap can be narrowed. Perhaps if there are numbers of the state elite and academic Africans who have the language skills of the West, knowledge will be able, over time, to find its way South. As a counter argument the Western educated elite has over the years since Kenyan independence not made a significant reduction in the gap.

This issue of the language of instruction was the second major theme raised by both Canadians and Kenyans regarding the CMIN project. Nida and Reyburn (1981) state that the language of instruction and teaching has an impact on the comprehension of the learner. Mother tongue is the primary language for effective learning except where literacy and formal education has been in a second language. The formal education in English, for example, reaches a point where it surpasses mother tongue because of the skills utilized in schooling. It was stated by both Canadians and Kenyans that some of the instruction in English posed problems. These problems were encountered by students who had their initial formal education in mother tongue and Kiswahili and only latterly in English.

Both the ACC & S and the ABC utilize mother-tongue(s) in the worship and practice of their local congregations. Song-books, Bibles, liturgy, as well as instruction at their Bible schools and theological schools are all in vernacular. Perhaps because of this use in local congregational settings there is perhaps a dynamic which fostered by confidence in their several languages, supports self-determination and empowerment (McLaughlin, 1989). The problems associated with language would not have been resolved if the teaching had only been in Swahili as that, too, was a second language to many of the participants, even though, those portions of the course work which were translated into Swahili had been beneficial to better understanding.

> With this group, and the demographics show, they can read and write English quite well. Kiswahili for most of them isn't a language they are using at work or during the week except for the urban Pastors. So I don't think English or Kiswahili has made that much difference, Kikuyu would have made a difference. Being a second or third language, having the ability to use Kiswahili I used it and then having someone to help me I used Kikuyu for key concepts and words for key areas of teaching. (CP8 4-3)

> Most of the people who are here can understand English. You know it is a bit hard to express some things even in my own language Kikuyu. I heard some things that are very hard to express and are very hard to explain and I try to mix both Kikuyu and English to stress the point. So Kiswahili would even be a problem for our lecturers, and even for some people who would lose Kiswahili because even Kiswahili is not our language it is a second language. (KS5 4-1)

The difficulty with English was not an issue for all the Kenyans. The number who expressed a struggle in English was equal to those who said they would struggle in Swahili.

> No! Some of us don't like Kiswahili, like me I don't like, some of us, although Kiswahili was introduced as a national language we don't enjoy speaking Kiswahili. We like speaking English so it is better for the program and never to be introduced in Kiswahili because some of us can't take notes in Kiswahili. These languages take time to put notes down, but in English it is easy to put notes down. So it is good, it would not be better to start in Kiswahili. Maybe it could help some people but others no. Anyway we enjoy it when the course is done in English although there are some barriers. Because not very much barriers

> because we have been taught to be using dictionaries to note down any word you don't understand, you go through it in the dictionary and you come to know the meaning. So it is easier to learn in English. (KS4 4-3)

> There is not much of a problem with the language. I understand, I can write. The problem of course is that the language of study is not my own language and if we talk ourselves in, for let us say Kikuyu, because it is not your mother tongue, "you will find it difficult although you have learned it". English is not a problem, but I have talked with you in Kiswahili because it is easier for me to communicate in Kiswahili. (KS3 3-8)

During the planning process for the ABC CMIN the question of language of instruction was discussed. The reality of Canadian professors without Swahili skills pressured the ABC to select the first CMIN class from the leadership who had English language skills. The definition of level of skill was not addressed and was part of the difficulty expressed by the class.

Who Participates?

The Kenyan education system has had a great deal of Africanisation applied and yet it still functions and behaves much like it did when the missionaries determined its structure. Mutua (1975) and D'Souza (1987) suggest that by Africanisation Kenya meant placing African Kenyans into the Ministry of Education, the Universities and schools and colleges. The curriculum was to be replaced with locally written texts which portrayed African illustrations and material rather than European material. Some of this occurred for the primary levels but secondary schools use a mix in their courses and tertiary education is still very similar to the western pattern.

Kenya, in its thirtieth year of "internal" self government, has a tiered education structure which exaggerate the stratification inequalities through the examination system. The two denominations ABC and ACC & S sponsor schools in order to meet the educational needs of students in their areas of church influence. Without these church sponsored schools many of the children would receive no formal education beyond the very earliest primary level.

The tertiary level of education in Kenya was not designed to absorb the students entering at primary levels. Along with the teacher training colleges, technical training institutions and private sectarian colleges, there are 4 national and 10 private universities. But as Foster (1985) says "From the mass... that enters the system, a tiny trickle emerges from the universities as a result of wastage or direct selection. This is a structurally very simple system with no opportunities for reentry or reprocessing, a system that is not going to change" (p.235). The university entrance system serves as both a gate-keeping function and as a selection process for social stratification while at the same time suggesting it gives an opportunity for social mobility based on merit. As Carnoy and Levin (1985) state "meritocracy becomes the rational for power divisions in a society on the grounds that power should be based on knowledge" (p.31). The effect of an education system such as Kenya's is to preclude many adult learners from continuing their formal education. This was the case for all but three of the Kenyan CMIN participants.

The opportunity and the access to the CMIN was the third theme which was raised. The discussion focused on the selection and admission of students to the CMIN. Who should participate in a program like this? The comments from the interviews suggest that the Kenyans believe a more homogeneous level should be ensured. The implication embedded in the comments of three participants was that entrance to the CMIN should be on merit, like the regular system. The interesting side note is the three with these comments were the three who had the opportunity for continuing their formal education. They suggested the level of entrance "ability or grade" should be higher than that which was expected. The selection of students to the program was left almost entirely to the jurisdiction of the Kenyan church leadership. The Canadian contacts had suggested that since the instruction and textbooks would be in English that an ability to cope in English would be preferable. The selection or screening was then left to the national Kenyan bodies to regulate.

> One problem I saw, let me say from our side, was that our understanding being low it brought a problem. When we began we were almost defeated because of the language. As we went along we began to realize that the problem really was not language but rather it was our foundation which was weak. (KG4 3-1)
>
> Maybe the process of screening students to enter should only accept those who are of a near equal level with all the other students. (KG3 4-3)
>
> There are a few things to change with regards to the teaching. If we are to chose again students for a class for the Certificate in Ministry those to be selected should only have higher qualifications. The teachers run into difficulty when the standard of education of the students is too low. If it had not been for the teacher Nzyoka giving of himself to help us by translating the language for those who were not able to understand. So that needs to be a change to consider so that everyone in the program can understand. (KG2 3-5)
>
> Actually there is no(t) much difficulties but actually we are experiencing some difficulties in starting because some of us left school many years ago and in that case we are experiencing some difficulties. But as we are going on we are catching up and probably at this time we are not having as much difficulties.(KS1 1-16)

The comment about the entrance level of the students is a moot point, as all of the initial participants who remained in the program completed the certificate and graduated. The results of "graduation" suggest that the students were able to overcome any lag in background learning to complete their course work. The problem, I believe, was expressed very well by AS "The teachers run into problems". The problem is one with which the instructor must grapple and the adjustments need to be made by the teacher. To select only those with the "higher" qualifications would have in part defeated the goal of reaching a target group otherwise excluded from the education system. This again is an area of extreme weakness in the orientation process for the professors. The professors who have made repeat visits have observed and learned the level of difficulty which can be used to present classroom material. The first time professors have to create their own reference points for their material. This is compounded if a professor has been teaching Canadian post graduate studies or doctoral studies then makes the shift to Kenya where some of the students have primary education.

The marginalization of people is a process of disempowerment and domination by the elite. The students from the ABC would never have been given the opportunity to participate in tertiary education (particularly overseas) as they are predominately Kamba people. They are not in the state elite and, therefore, outside the privileged class who are encouraged to proceed to tertiary education. The students in the ACC & S are also generally without tertiary education opportunities. Their opportunities have been marginalized and their voices somewhat silenced. The level of academic qualification would have required almost all of the 43 to upgrade in Kenya before they would be accepted in Canadian institutions. The process Carey and CBIM used gave these few an opportunity which otherwise would have been outside their domain and gave them a way to enter the discourse regarding their own future. The target group for the CMIN project was just the group who would struggle with the academic level of the courses therefore the pressure must remain on the professors to adjust their language and contextualization.

The theme of participation was also discussed by Canadians. However the discussion about participation was focused on the selection, orientation and inclusion of the faculty and not the students in the CMIN project. The selection of participating faculty was determined by the Director in consultation with the Principal of Carey. The professors, with one exception, all volunteered their services and did not have the Kenyan participation as part of their required teaching assignment. There was a criticism of Carey for not requiring the CMIN to be part of an assigned teaching load. This contributed to a looseness of both academic and financial accountability. Volunteers might not apply themselves in as productive a manner as they otherwise should. The volunteer nature perhaps also hindered the orientation to cross-cultural settings which was expressed as necessary before the faculty member went to Kenya.

> Failures, I think we failed to do an adequate job of orientation for the visiting faculty. I think we attempted a little bit. You attempted some and I attempted some. I pressed CA2 hard to come ten days before he had to teach and he did and he went visiting pastors and learned a whole lot. Now that is not very long but it sure is better than parachuting in and teaching the next day. I don't think I have been successful in getting all the faculty to do that. I almost think if I had to do another cycle of this I would now say that their being present in the program is conditional on their willingness to undertake a proper orientation both by reading and interviewing Kenyans in Canada. Reading appropriate stuff and by being orientated when they got there by both

> Kenyans and Canadians that are resident there. (CA1 10-3)

The failure to properly institutionalize the orientation suggests that the Canadians did not really believe there was a need. The need has shown itself in the criticism but the academic respect given by peers to their colleagues hides the question about competence. As was stated earlier faculty privately questioned peer ability to contextualize but did not openly confront each other on the situation. Coleman and Court (1993) and Arnold (1979) raised the question about the suitability of all those involved in educational aid projects. Carey and CBIM should demand a more rigorous screening and orientation.

The Kenyan comments centred around the need for teachers to adapt and focus their language and material at the level of the students in the classroom. There is a need for better orientation for the teachers, or a willingness to adapt the vocabulary and conceptualization to the level of the students' understanding.

> Only that course which I mentioned of CY, the course was not bad but maybe it was how he talked or something. The others were good... I know that the students can not choose the teachers but they need to be teachers who will be understood. To be understood is the basis for meeting the goals. (KG4 3-7)

Practicum Problems

During the CMIN course with the ABC the students complained of the difficulty that arose in their own practicum project implementation and completion which was a requirement for the Certificate. The project-assignment was meant to continue for the duration of the program and be a practical application of the classroom theory. The denomination, however, transferred all but three of the CMIN students which in turn interrupted the project-assignment flow.

> The problems that I saw were really only on the part of ourselves in the ABC because we who were the students also had other work responsibilities and there were occasions when some of us received transfers to move from where we were to another location. This lead to difficulties in our studies. (KG1 2-10)

> There were problems because the way the professors had planned the studies they had received a promises from our church leadership. And the students, we would have to say we became frustrated because the places we were sent we began to plan the work for the CMIN (practicum), which would be inspected, then we began to wither because after three months we were transferred. So the problem was that the work we had initiated in one location, before we had completed it, we had to start all over again after the transfer and so when the supervisors came they would think we had started with problems. So this occurred here and there and it caused problems for the professors as it did for the students. (KG3 2-11)

The planning process again may have been flawed in that the leadership responsible for transfers of the ABC clergy, were not part of the consultation process. The Bishop, who has the final responsibility and had been part of the approval process may not have understood the nature of the applied portion of the CMIN. As the CMIN project began some of the students began to introduce change which was interpreted as "overturning the church" and transfers were made to quell the opposition. It was not until positive progress was assessed that the transfers were stopped for the CMIN participants.

As is indicated above, the problem regarding practicum "inspection" produced some difficulties. These difficulties from the first CMIN were addressed before the ACC & S phase began. Canadians had hoped to address the difficulties found in the supervision of students in the ABC CMIN by the inclusion of Kenyan mentors in the ACC & S CMIN. This change was made in order to address a different set of dynamics that had arisen in the process.

> Also when we did our projects, there was only one of the Professors who did all the student visits and if there had been one of the teachers who really knew our culture and knew our ways it would have been far better. When the one (who did the visits) came he did not understand the language. When he talked to the local groups there was the language problem. Next time you must have someone who understands the habits, culture, language, and customs of our people. I can not say there was much deception in the projects, but many did not understand what the intent was, so some put on an act. Now if the project supervision had been done by a teacher like Nzyoka, he would have been able to establish where these had occurred because he travelled everywhere and knew the ABC. There were some of those who showed the supervisor all the things they had done but it was all a lie. (KA4 3-3)

There were two issues involved with the few students who may not have actually fulfilled the project application assignment. The first was the understanding of an ongoing application in the ministry situation. Some of the clergy had never planned their work so to begin a long term project in their work situation was initially beyond their understanding. Once the deception had begun it had to be carried through in order not to lose face. The second issue is the use of a Canadian as field supervisor. The original plan had been to have this responsibility shared but the individual who was to have Kenyan supervision role was not in the church when the project began and no replacement was evident. This failure allowed some of the students to complete one or two years without any application being supervised and those students may have suffered in their learning.

> Also this program is not a game, it is serious study with a purpose. If the students study for three years and the practicum is the same then those students must remain in one location for the whole three years. If they stay in one location it will be far more beneficial. Also if the supervision can be enhanced so that the visits would be more often than the once in two or three years. (KG2 4-5)

The participants in the current CMIN suggest that the way the supervision is operating presently is not without its own difficulties, not insurmountable, but in their view worthy of their comments.

> One of the problems that I have seen is that it is very, very difficult to know the students you want to supervise. Because the students themselves should feel very free with you and should be able even to come to say to you I want you to be my supervisor. In the course of that I have seen some students not really benefiting very much. The students have to have lots of confidence with the supervisor. But it is we have continued with lots of struggle but we have been able to do whatever we can be able to do. (KA2 3-6)
>
> I am one of the mentors in the program, although the actual role of the mentor hasn't quite started. What I am doing now encouraging them and following them up to see that they are faithful to their assignments as well as being faithful to that which they should be doing in their areas of operation. I find that also is very helpful. (KA3 2-3)
>
> Even the supervisors who have been approved by the CMIN, if I haven't been a teacher for that Urban ministry I can't be a help for anyone who is doing that paper. The improvement that I would like, if it were possible, is where we could go for a longer period not just for one week or two weeks. Then when the lecturer goes, the person who is left doesn't know the lecture well and can't help. That is the improvement. (KS5 5-3)

This criticism has some validity. If the supervisor does not have any background in the subject, it is difficult to act as a mentor and give assistance in understanding. The supervisors are experienced and educated and certainly know the church situations well enough to know how the students are managing the application of course material. The problem of dual roles does have the potential to hinder the ACC & S CMIN in that the supervisors are also in the hierarchy of the church and very senior to the students.

Schedules and Courses

This final theme regarding difficulties in the CMIN was that of the shortness of the individual courses. Although a number of Canadians saw it as a convenience for their schedule it did place the African student at a disadvantage. This is one area where the Kenyans were perhaps overly gracious in suggesting that because the Canadians had to come such a long distance their timetable and agenda should take precedence over the Kenyan learning.

> I would not have shortened the courses at present. Last year we did a longer course and I think we should have stuck to that model of a week and a half and the five and a half day course I think is too short, I haven't experienced it yet here but we are talking about all kinds of things that slow down the transfer rate of information, knowledge and experience and we are talking about changing attitudes and behaviours. That - I do not think the five and a half day model is right. (CP1 5-5)

> To change would be the time of the teaching. According to the way we study and learn here in Kenya we do not go so quickly. We usually study several things over a longer time rather than one compact fast study. We usually study for longer periods of time although we can get used to the shorter courses. The time should be increased a bit. It is not that we can not learn quickly but we usually take a longer time and have a couple of studies together. (KG1 3-5)

> This week we have much, much to be put on. If we

> are covering a one year work in one week or two weeks that is a lot. You know Africans are slow readers and to read a paper like this (the question sheet) would take me a bit of time. To someone who is acquainted with reading it would take him a few minutes to get everything from the paper. The improvement I would like to see is a longer time where people could go and cover, even if it is one year work, where they can stay for 2 months or three months, where they can have a dialogue and whatever, they can ask questions. (KS5 4-9)

> What I could say is that the time for classroom teaching was far to short, rather than only the week or two of classes it would be better to have three weeks and one every four months. When we enter for lectures there has to be a longer time. For me that would have been far more suitable rather than the way it was. Some who came for the short time spent more time travelling to and from the lesson than in class. So some would take the first couple of days to figure out what the lessons were about then the class was over and to read on their own they were defeated in that course. (KG4 3-3)

One other problem that did occur was participants arriving but not having finished assignments from previous courses nor having pre-read the text. This meant the first few days were used to "figure out what the lessons were about". The solution might be to call the students a few days early allowing them the time away from work to complete the requirements. This case did not apply to all of the students. The colleagues who were also in the CMIN did seek my advice and support in finishing assignments and preparing for the next class. We advised students to arrive early and some did.

There is one area of tension which is raised here for academics. The use of professors personal time is placed in tension the Kenyan CMIN teaching. It forces each participant to reassess their priorities. One of the participants asked whether the link to Kenya was the most effective utilization of his academic achievement. This is, and will be, part of the ongoing tension and debate at Carey. The classroom learning experience should never be put at risk because of the arrogance of any view of the value of a participants own time. The length of the course has to be contextualized to suit the learning patterns and ability of the students.

This final theme of course needs also was drawn from the areas of weakness and proposals for improvement and could be categorized as suggestions for additional course work which should be considered for inclusion in any future program. There were only three Kenyan participants who offered proposals for course additions to the program. These were evidently felt needs of the graduates two years after graduation. The need for the course additions the Kenyans suggest may not have been suggested in a pre-CMIN interview. As the participants began to be aware of their knowledge and began to believe in themselves their desire to grow and develop was enhanced. Perhaps it is part of the process of self-actualization, as you learn a little about a subject you then develop an interest in its benefit.

> Rather than removing any course because all were good we would rather add other things we did not study. Add not remove. We need to study, let me say, "pure psychology," philosophy by itself, others like sociology. These were discussed inside other courses but they need to be subjects by themselves. (KG2 3-8)
>
> Perhaps if we could have some teaching in accounting. Not the church accounts which we do already but accounts which are more extensive. We should also have other courses in Biblical exposition. (KG4 4-7)
>
> It would be helpful to add a course in the CMIN which would deal with teacher education skills. (KG3 3-9)

Perhaps the biggest shortfall in the CMIN course requirement was that expressed by KG3. Perhaps this was because Carey and CBIM differentiated the leadership development as aimed only at the clergy rather than towards teachers. The participants in the ABC were all clergy but most of them were also expected to act as teachers in their work situations. The focus was on developing church oriented leaders not on developing the teachers for the next generation. Carey knew it was able to assist in theological education but did not focus on the teacher preparation except as incidental to the program. This does not deviate from the pattern at most post secondary institutions other than pre-service teacher education institutions. Graduates of programs such as theology, law, engineering etc. do not do a teacher education component. It is assumed that they know their field so can teach. The CMIN had not included a teacher education course in the program of studies. However, a short course in teacher education was offered to the participants at the end of the ABC program and prior to graduation. This course was external to the official project but part of the informal curriculum. There must be a teacher education course if the expectation in the CMIN is for these leaders to continue teaching future generations of leaders.

The expressed feelings of the CMIN participants, after involvement, was that the project was mutually agreed upon, jointly determined and of benefit to the Kenyans. The Canadians tried very hard to contextualize the course material and in meeting the goals some mistakes were made. The Canadians made their first trips to teach in Kenya with a great deal of nervousness for safety and concern for being able to complete their teaching assignment with some positive result.

One of the Kenyan leaders discussed the expectations for Canadians coming from the West and living with his people. He knew the problem of being contextual and stated it this way;

> When you live among us, don't mock us by trying to be exactly like us. We know you have more money than we do. We know you can always leave. We know you are used to different foods and ways of doing things. Live a balance. Live in the middle between what you have come from and where we are. By doing that we know you don't stand away, removed from us and yet we can recognize that our way is not the only way. Walk with us and learn before you are too critical. We must walk together in friendship. (KA1 June 15, 1993)

CHAPTER 5

HANDLE WITH CARE

Kujikwaa si kuanguka, bali ni kwenda mbele.
(To stumble is not to fall down, but it is to go forward.)

EDUCATION IN KENYA

Rodney (1972) stated very bluntly,

> The colonizers did not introduce education into Africa, they introduced a new set of formal educational institutions which partly supplanted and partly replaced those which were there before. (p.263)

The population in Kenya, before the colonial era, had their own education and they had their own forms of governance. The British arrival as dominators brought values and processes steeped in British heritage which clashed with the indigenous peoples' values and views. Africans who, according to a Marxist definition of "tribal mode of production", understood the land as belonging to the entire tribal community came into conflict with the Europeans who understood land as the sole possession of a capitalist. The less technically advanced African (in scientific technology) was subdued and removed from the prime agricultural lands. The land went to the European settlers. The indigenous religious belief systems were placed under extreme pressure and centuries of cultural teachings were questioned by Eurocentric world views. Carnoy (1974) said, "It is impossible to _prove_ that schooling contributes to individual's colonized condition or that schooling is part and parcel of European Imperialism. These propositions are based on an _interpretation_ of historical data" (p.20). Carnoy is very clear that this interpretation reveals the imperial function of schools. What happened in Kenya? Mutua (1975) suggests that most colonial thinking was probably not clandestine and covert, but rather haphazard and disjointed reacting to the pressure group of the day. We have the ability and the privilege to review and reflect on a century of history and create patterns from it, "while British thinking was not probably as articulate as is suggested here, we can, on looking back, correlate events which then seemed coincidental, to explain subsequent happenings" (p.xi).

Thompson (1981) states that the colonial administration generally carried to Africa the belief that human beings could solve the problems which the world posed. They believed in progress and through technology and better management the environment could be mastered. Education, which in the traditions of the indigenous people, had been used for cultural transmission took on a new role. Although it had been "an instrument for promoting social stability and continuity, it increasingly had to serve as an instrument for promoting and controlling change, (and) for creating discontinuities" (p.27). The Europeans came and placed the African in submission to both the education and the economics of the North.

The European settlers were not alone in their efforts to control and to bring change to Kenya. The Arab traders, centuries earlier, brought Islam to the coastal strip of East Africa and with their goods trade and slave trade had permanently impacted and changed not only the traditional culture but also the language. The Arab influence, was followed by the Portuguese Catholic and European Protestant Christian missionary groups wanting to evangelize the "dark continent".

Scanlon (1966) suggests that the evangelical revival in North America and Britain during the 1870's produced the impetus for dramatic expansion of Protestant mission recruitment and deployment. This was coupled with a shift back to an emphasis on humanitarianism with its concern for human welfare and social reform. This social gospel, as it is known, had as its major focus the education of people to help them rise above their "backwardness".

> In North, South and East Africa, missions might forego many luxuries, but education was considered a necessity. Therefore, when the rapid expansion of missionary work in the 1880's began, it was only natural that education should be expanded. And added to the necessity of education for conversion was the new, powerful thrust of the social gospel. Education was the major means of alleviating the basic problems of health and poverty. There was no institution other than the school that could undertake this responsibility. (Scanlon, 1966, p.6)

Scanlon's hold on a seemingly functionalist interpretation of colonial education has some merit if the aim of the missions, who ran almost all of the schools in Kenya, was to create converts to their mission doctrine. The missions had control of education and from the missions' Eurocentric worldview, education would both assist to convert and to uplift the African people.

The missionary societies founded local village church-schools in order to give basic literacy skills to the Africans. By teaching the African children it was presumed that there would be an enhanced probability of the newly converted Christians being able to read the Bible for themselves. "Christian missionary groups took up the educational form and content currently in practice in England for the working class. This education emphasized the spiritual value of hard work and the tenants of evangelical christianity" (Sifuna, 1990, p.51). During the early part of the century there was a rapid expansion of mission stations in order to grab and hold territory from which each respective church could gain converts.

> The missionary vocation presumed that the supremely altruistic act was to spread the Christian message: those areas which had been denied the Christian gospel were truly

> unfortunate; once having had the opportunity to learn of it, they would surely realize its superiority to other creeds. Missionaries set out to rectify Africa's deprivation. (Berman, 1975, p.5)

The mission organizations did not see any difference between secular and religious instruction. In Europe there had not been the dramatic cleavage between church and state as there had been in America. "African church, state and educational policies became projections of respective European models" (Scanlon, 1966, p.7). Generally European missions saw the church and church-run-school as one entity and the evangelical task of the mission was in harmony with the teaching of catechetics through the village school. As Philip (1936) would state of the early missionaries "Education is simply the process of opening the darkened mind to the light. All missionary work, therefore, is educational in one form or another" (p.89). The missionaries further saw themselves as the trustees of the Africans because of both the historic relationship predating colonial rule and the allegiance to the church which Africans expressed. "The mission educated African stood above the rest of the population, not only through his Christianity, but in his desire to absorb the white man's way" (Urch, 1968, p.119). The result of the mission effort was a reinforcement of imperial control and dependency on Europe for the education, economics and political life of the colonized.

The Ominde Commission, the first education commission after independence, stated that "the practice of leaving the management of primary schools in the hands of the missions had 'outlived its usefulness' and was no longer appropriate in a secular state" (Stabler, 1969, p.xxiii). Despite this statement the Kenyan churches still sponsor several thousand schools. The curriculum is set by the national government but the operation of the schools is in the hands of the churches.

The education system which remains in Kenya impacts the participants' views of the significance of the CMIN project. This is reflected in the discussion on the change perceived to have come through the project as well as the criticisms levelled against the CMIN project.

EDUCATIONAL SIGNIFICANCE?

This section allows the educators and teachers, whatever their placement in the project, a voice with regards to the pedagogy which was part of the project along with both positive and negative comments about the educational process. This section includes a discussion of the significance of the project from each participant's individual and personal perspective as well as the effects of change within the participants' settings.

Adult education is the category of education in which the CMIN project could be classified. The adult education paradigm into which the CMIN would fall is, however, a more complex problem. If theoretical views of adult education are enunciated as humanistic, radical, behaviourist, liberal and progressive then the institutional definition (Courtney, 1989) would be liberal-progressive in that the CMIN was to meet specific needs while developing the moral-spiritual and rational side of the Kenyans. Knowledge in this definition is seen as truth or wisdom which is functional and useful. Knowles (1970) might suggest the project was "humanistic" in that it focused on self-development, institution specific tasks with a small amount of movement within social practice. Whether the CMIN could be remotely identified with the radical paradigm (Freire, 1972; Mezirow, 1991; Torres, 1991) is part of the focus of this study.

The Kenyan students were all adult learners. This alone forces us to consider the learning which took place in their lives from a perspective which assumes, unlike for children who are acquiring the values and beliefs of the culture, that these adults have already established referent points for culturally prescribed values and norms. To change any boundary there needs to be a transformation in perspective for those adult learners.

> Learning may be understood as the process of construing and appropriating a new or revised interpretation of the meaning of one's experience as a guide to action. No conscious experience is free from interpretation, indeed to have an experience means that we have identified its content, i.e. we have construed its meaning. (Mezirow, 1991, p.141)

When the participants were asked what they considered the most significant or most successful aspect of the CMIN, they responded with educational outcomes from the project. These were the results of specific course content in its application to their lives, work and ministry. The Canadians tended to talk about the changes for Kenyans in terms of the over-all way the Kenyans do ministry, teach, plan and express their lives. These same Canadians also talked about the changes in their own lives and the change in their teaching when they returned to Canada.

> It is a life changing experience for me. By reports, although there have been some failures, by and large some of those students were permanently changed, hopefully by the Spirit of God, through this process of education and are making a difference in the ABC church. I don't think we have sufficient data from the ACC & S at the present time. I like to believe that, if your dissertation tells me otherwise then I will rethink the program. There is no point in going over there if something like that is not happening. (CP3 8-3)
>
> Because of the experience in Kenya I talk much more about the grave disparity which is evident in the living standards between our countries. I

> introduce the subject in the churches and with any group I can find. Before going to Kenya I would not have even listened to news reports about Africa but now I have a personal interest in specific people who matter to me in Kenya. (CP9 2-9)

These Canadians' statements indicate one of the principles enunciated about the strategies and paradigms of development discussed in chapter three. The opportunity for mutual discussion and taking time to understand the local situation elevates the importance of the empowerment of the participants in the project.

Canadians went anticipating they would have some impact on the Kenyans, and the responses indicate that change did occur. Most of the Canadians had some understanding of the Kenyans' academic background and so they expected to see growth in the Kenyans' approach to the educational experience. They saw growth in theological knowledge expressed as practical professional knowledge. Teaching and preaching takes preparation time if it is to be effective and Kenyans saw this as valuable for their life-world.

> I think some of the good things they learned was the disciplined study and serious stuff that involved pouring over the books and writing about curriculums and reflecting in papers and organizing material and learning how to research and then applying it and thinking about it. They learned through *Praxis* a process of theoretical reflection and *Praxis* and further theoretical reflection. So they learned some disciplines, some life disciplines that can't help but spill over to everything from the preparation of their teaching for their people to how they handle their finances, though I think we wished they learned more about that, but those are life skills. Things that we probably didn't set out to teach them that but I think they probably learned that. (CP6 3-3)

> They feel they have latched onto something new. Education, the whole idea of a Bible study where you challenge people to do their own research, own

> Biblical research find out something for themselves. It is brand new. It has challenged these people, the students, to challenge the people in their own communities to think and learn scripture for themselves and develop leadership skills within their communities. It is really encouraging. (CP8 2-1)

My experience in the churches had been that there were no group discussion sessions in which participants could interact with the leadership. I had observed and participated in "lecture" teaching sessions where the leader stood facing the audience and told them what to learn, to respond to and to recite back. These groups were generally divided along gender lines with each group getting the teaching, even if it meant a double presentation. While doing the research I observed some change. I arrived unannounced and unexpectedly at two locations to find mixed groups in a full discussion with the leader who was sitting in a circle with the rest of the group. The leaders of these two groups were asked about the group session and responded that their local church clergy (who were CMIN graduates) had taught them how to lead this way.

The Kenyans spoke about their own learning in similar ways. They talked about life skill changes which went far beyond the course content. For example, several students spoke about personal budget planning for their family, others spoke about using a makeshift "daytimer" plan to organize their work. The changes were in skills which were never part of any stated curriculum, which became part of a hidden curriculum which Canadian participants did not plan nor did they initially recognize the larger skills impact. The Kenyans talked about the change in the way they plan, the way they teach and the way teacher-student relationships are different in and out of the classroom.

> In summary, the CMIN has given me a great deal of assistance in preaching, in urban ministry. Not

> that these were not the normal but they helped me. The leadership course gave us insight and the course in cross cultural mission challenged me because I had not understood any of the concepts needed to cross cultural barriers. I did not know that I had no knowledge of the subject until I began the course. I remember in 1986 we went to Maasai territory to preach and now I realize we did not know what we were doing. We treated them like they were uncivilized. We told them when they came to the meeting they should dress properly. We saw they were arriving in their shuka (Maasai traditional garment), with their clubs and their pouches. When we began that course I learned how we could have been more successful in introducing these people to hear the importance of Christianity and later the other cultural changes could be discussed. (KG3 5-9)

As a point of reference for Western readers, the speaker is a member of a tribal grouping which was historically enemies of the Maasai. I was told they were "blood enemies" which referred to the division of land which was determined by the railway. Maasai were to have land and remain south of the Kenya railway and Kamba remained north and crossing was considered a violation of the blood feud and was settled with violence. The Kamba expressed a superiority in progress and development over the somewhat nomadic Maasai pastoralists. The respondent quoted above had been part of a small team of ABC people who wanted to assist one extended Maasai family build a school and develop potable water. The ABC's initial attempt was in 1986 and had been rejected. The Kenyan and Tanzanian governments are restricting the Maasai cross-border movement and pressure is being exerted by the national governments to this end. The changes in life-style for the Maasai are going to affect all aspects of their lives. The CMIN did not suggest cultural invasion but rather a sensitivity to the existing culture as an entry point for discussion about change.

The dynamics of cross-cultural communication did not go unnoticed by the Kenyan students. The Canadians were concerned about being able to contextualize their material for the students in the classroom while at the same time the course content often dealt with the topic of cross-cultural communication. The message was received and the students were able to apply the knowledge to their own situations across tribal and cultural barriers.

> The CMIN brought a great difference from before it started as compared with the later with regards to the teaching level you find in our churches. Every church, where the CMIN people work, now has teaching like Bible studies and other things. The CMIN students have done a lot of work teaching many people. They are teaching the church elders, the women of the church, the youth, the children and the church in total. When you go (to churches) you will see there is a lot of teaching which was not there before. Also the CMIN brought a program of personal devotions to our churches. There is now personal devotions for the regular Christians which they never had before. Also the CMIN taught us how to help the church to develop itself. Each church now has a small group of people to work at things like to plant vegetables, to plant trees and these came because of the CMIN. (KG6 2-5)

The teaching has produced a ripple effect. The participants in the CMIN have taken not only the theological content which they received but also some of the concepts of development and now are passing their knowledge to others. It would be preferable to be able to provide a more critical analysis of the impact of the ripple effect of the CMIN across the social, political, economic, cultural and environmental dimensions however the researcher did not proceed beyond the immediate participants to determine the broader impact on society. A follow-up study could be undertaken which identifies these dimensions within the larger community context. Not only is course content being passed along but there is a recognition that colleagues have taken on a personal discipline in their approach to work which was not previously part of their life skills.

> First of all they are learning to do things in an orderly way. To do things in a systematic way and their idea of deadlines is coming alive to them and the importance of coping with it. I think commitment is also an art because some of the things they dread will be tested on the ground and they are also willing to test themselves to see if some of the things they learned in theory can also be practical. (KA3 1-6)

> Well I must say that I have seen new life within the participants, they are so different, they seem so different. They approach things so differently, and they can now think of planting new churches, you see the church is growing so rapidly where they are working. (KA2 4-3)

These two administrators recognized the change in the way the students and the graduates approached their work-related tasks. There was a change in the productivity. The students also saw the change in and for themselves as is expressed by the following response.

> (In our churches now) We select a group of people to teach, the educated. And when they receive some teaching we are telling them now you teach some other people. Those then teach others and so the church begins to grow and it draws other people, those who would not have come before. Another thing," what I have achieved", now if I leave here I can sit with my committee. We can find 5000 shillings and find five people we can give them a start to a small business like vegetable selling and tell them they must repay the loan when you have succeeded in establishing yourself in order to help another. This is the way we will rid ourselves of the extreme poverty. (KS3 4-3)

The development related skills and outcomes which appeared to be part of the CMIN project was directed towards the religious education of the participants. The need for a more systematic and explicit approach to contextualizing the insights and practices from development education is suggested from these responses. Resource people with expertise in their one academic discipline may not realize a parallel area of related study is available for assimilation. Perhaps this research can encourage theological educators to more closely examine development education as the reciprocal occurs.

The Canadians recognized changes in the Kenyans' approach to study which transferred to life skills. The Kenyans also spoke of this change which had been transferred into their daily work and life experience. The CMIN brought change. It had a transformational effect on the lives of the participants in both their work and their homes. Further research would have the potential for gathering a greater understanding of these life-changes.

TRANSFORMATION IN CLASS

Theological education and its development has faced similar problems in trying to reach the people with the greatest need. Rather than empower the people who are able to do the ministry, much more effort has been expended on the small group of highly educated clergy. The recent critical reflection has drawn into question this practice of dependency on a highly educated clergy. This reflection parallels the critical framework of conscientization for empowerment and change. Critical pedagogy and feminist pedagogy (Shor & Freire, 1987; McLaren, 1988, 1991; Giroux, 1991; Lather, 1992; Gore, 1992) emphasizes the need to intervene in those practices of teaching which maintain hegemony, oppression, racism, and injustice. Critical pedagogy is stated to be emancipatory, empowering, transformative, liberating and self-actualizing.

Transformation is also an adult learning process through which adults reassess the meaning of life experiences by participating in a rational discourse and allowing them time for self-reflection and life skills action.

> The transformation process appears to involve a disorienting dilemma; self-examination with feelings of guilt or shame; a critical assessment of presuppositions; recognition that one's discontent and the process of transformation is shared; exploring options for new roles, relationships and actions; planning as course of action; acquiring knowledge and skills for implementing one's plan; provisional efforts to try new roles and relationships; and a reintegration into society on the basis of conditions dictated by one's new perspective. (Mezirow, 1991, p.146)

The CMIN process provided the disorienting dilemma to which the students applied the new or alternative experiences. As they explored the knowledge and skills learned, they were pressured to assess their own situation and in turn were lead to a change in perspective.

The CMIN respondents state that classroom and public teaching methods and styles have been changed. Previous experience was the master-teacher style with knowledge poured forth to the recipient. The Kenyans suggest the teaching practice is different because of the CMIN project. The CMIN is probably the identifiable component on which the Kenyans focus.

> Really there is a change in my classroom practice. Things like equipping, leadership and personal spirituality we did not give any emphasis but now I push these things and the students seem so pleased. In the past the teachers and the students did not have anything to do with each other. The teachers were above and beyond the students, but now because of those subjects the students and the teachers have been brought together. There is a partnership in the process now.
>
> There was a change in my teaching because of the CMIN. Particularly as a result of some of the

> courses like spirituality, cross-cultural mission, urban and some others. These were introduced after we had taken them and as I began to introduce them people were very pleased with them. Even in the churches those in the CMIN began to introduce these and the church people were very willing to accept them. In the practicum for the current Divinity School class some of these new courses have been very beneficial. For example this last practicum we sent one student to Nairobi and they worked there because they had the Urban course.
>
> The other major change has been the use of time, rather than using up a whole day or several days for something now I plan and it takes a few hours. As well at the Divinity School rather than stretching some courses out we set aside a block of time to complete the teaching as a short course of two or three weeks. What we learned in the CMIN about intense courses we can now apply for the regular DS (Divinity School) terms. (KG1 5-3)

The ABC teachers did have a number of years of work with Canadian on-site-teachers (missionaries) who team taught and who worked alongside the Kenyan counter-parts. The working together, Kenyans and Canadians, over ten years is reflected in a few of the statements by the Kenyans. To cite my own experience, I was assigned to the Divinity School by CBIM to work with the Kenyan teachers. The housing built by the ABC was prescribed. The Bishop of the ABC was the Principal and assigned the courses to each of the staff. When I first began to teach, a Kenyan staff member was present in all my classes and the deputy for the Bishop reported these observations to the Bishop on a regular basis. I was assigned specific courses to teach and regular preaching duties by the Bishop. I was included in staff meeting discussions and, as I perceived I was becoming trusted, the suggestions I offered for courses were considered. I knew that anything Canadians would suggest had to be agreed to by both the Divinity School staff as well as the Bishop before it was included in the program of studies. Textbooks, whether in English or Kiswahili, were always given to the staff and the Bishop for approval before they were introduced into the classroom. After six full teaching terms at the Divinity School the Bishop began to ask for my opinion on improvements I might suggest to the leadership development within the ABC. Shortly thereafter the opportunity to discuss the CMIN came about. A suggestion by the Bishop of the ABC that a Canadian teacher not continue with the Divinity School teaching resulted in CBIM removing the individual from Kenya. The ABC controlled the Canadian teachers through their hierarchy supported by CBIM.

There are statements by the Kenyans in which it appears that the earlier work by the Canadians was truncated into the CMIN project. These statements seem to suggest that all of the years of influence and teaching surfaced in effect because of the CMIN. The CMIN was a culmination of effort which articulated for the ABC a direction of change in their teaching practice. The Kenyans incorporated into their practice, not only teaching style changes, but also changes in the course content and program requirements because of the CMIN program. As was cited in chapter three the inclusion of a course in leadership styles in the Divinity School was included because as was stated,

> Some of the courses brought change. Those people who have received teaching have changed because they have left the old practices. So what I notice is they begin to follow the new ways as we teach things like leadership we see that they respond by recognizing the styles. They say if I belong to a task oriented or person oriented style and it does not apply they change their ways because they did things without knowing. (KG2 4-7)

This was specifically the case with the ABC in their Divinity School and Bible schools.

> If we went back a few years in the DS there were some courses which were not taught at that time but now they have been added to the program. An

> example would be urban, or cross-cultural mission, or equipping but they are here now. Even a bigger change is that in the past the Headquarters committee decided the courses we would teach but now we the teachers ourselves we decide the courses, we decide the program and even run everything else and we now help each other. We also have those Bible stations which we began and there is a committee of those from the CMIN who help to select who will teach. (KG1 4-9)

The Kenyan participants also took ownership of the program and believed in the change that had come about in their practice, change which was worth defending even at great personal risk in the denomination. The CMIN participants believe in themselves, which was a change.

> I remember one day when we had a meeting or seminar with all the Pastors. One of the Pastors got up to tell the Bishop that the teachers were just wasting their time with the teaching. I opposed him strongly because I said that he did not understand where we (ABC) were heading. From this I realized that a number of them did not know or did not understand what we had learned. There are many leaders who do not have any vision, or do not know that anything could be of value from the teaching. Others may not be called to do the work. They certainly do not press ahead in the work. However the people like the elders who came in for the teaching, are beginning to understand the importance. They came in for a seminar and commented that the way that we teach at the Divinity School is not like we did in the past. We told them that the CMIN had helped us and they stated their surprise at how good the teaching was. (KG2 4-9)

The change has come in the classroom and it has been evidenced in the denomination. The credit is given to Canadians but the benefit is going to the Kenyans.

> I would say things are different now because of our meeting and working with various teachers. We studied together with you and other teachers. We were taught that there were new things which we

> could also use in our churches. There are many of us who really want to progress in our studies. There are some churches where our leaders have not had any upgrading yet...
> At this time (in the Divinity School) I see some minor differences because not everything the missionary teachers were able to teach has been picked up by our teachers. This is because our people do not have the level of education that you all have. (KG3 5-3)

One specific example of this difference would be in the degree of background knowledge which would be expected for the teaching of a course in exegesis. The Canadian teachers all have both Greek and Hebrew as language skills for the exegetical process. The ABC did not feel it was necessary for their students to acquire these skills so were somewhat restricted in their approach to exegetical teaching. The pedagogical techniques were assimilated into the classroom teaching but not all of the content. The classroom skills were utilized and transferred to other settings as well.

> In the past I never had a plan. I just went to speak to the people. I did not plan, I never put any plan to prayer, I just grabbed a passage without knowing what I would do. I never put down any notes like an introduction, a main theme or conclusion. I went with a blank piece of paper with the hope that the Spirit of God would direct me. Now I plan completely, why I am going to say something and I put it to prayer and I plan. So the Spirit now does the work. I know there is success because people talk about what I said afterwards. They tell me you said this or that. Or remember when you told me this. So I know people are understanding and gaining in knowledge. But the old times I did not even know where I would speak from. (KG4 4-5)

The ACC & S students in the CMIN, even though their CMIN is only partially complete, are also making positive statements about the change in their teaching practice. The students in the project are proud of the progress they are making.

> But I have changed my methods of teaching them since I started the CMIN because I want people to do things for themselves I don't tell them I make them find out. The kind of method that I am now using is quite different from what I was doing before. I was lecturing but now we share we participate and I have seen, I have found very many women who have gifts which I want to see. (KS2 4-1)

As was discussed earlier, with the change in the Kenyans' teaching, Canadians were impacted as well. The need to contextualize the content of the course material placed an emphasis on the teaching and planning process which had the effect of also making a change within the Canadian participants' classroom teaching. The first Urban course which was taught followed the general pattern of the Canadian CMIN. The second time the course was taught in Kenya the entire course outline was changed to include references to and readings by Kenyan authors. The Canadian teachers were also able to draw on their growing Kenyan experience to explain concepts to subsequent classes. The Kenyan students recognized these changes within the classroom setting.

> One of the benefits of this program is that it is not teacher to student directed. It is horizontal, a sharing program a, its a discovering program. It comes right to the context and the participants will have time to disagree and bring the Mzungu to the context. That is why I said the Canadians will benefit because they are also learning from the students. (KA2 5-5)

The Canadians also recognized the difference in themselves.

> (W)hile we didn't come back totally changed, in that we didn't teach everything differently when we got back, there were some significant, though others may say minor, changes because we realized that systematic theology is not the only way to teach theology. That Western logical methods of analysis are not the only way of appropriating

> truth. I think there is a more holistic approach to truth at least within the rural culture in Kenyans than we have in the Western enlightened academic institutions which are unfortunately so cognitively based in learning. (CP6 6-3)

> I think I go back to my courses enriched by African Kenyan illustrations which I use continually in my teaching in the North American setting. I have a new appreciation of how you can do church without all the fancy props we use in the west. That has created a conviction in me that has transferred into my teaching... (CP1 2-1)

> (Another) difference was in relationship to the experience of putting North American professors in a minority situation where we are dealing with mature enough people that they could say "Teacher it doesn't work that way here." , which I have never had here (in Canada). I think I have had one African student in all my years of teaching at Regent/ Carey I think I have had one African student risk in the classroom to say "it doesn't work that way in my country". Whereas over and over and over again we as visiting professors would have people saying that it is not quite that way here. (CP6 3-2)

This last comment stresses one potential advantage of in-country teaching. Mature students who are within their own context have the experiences on which to examine material presented by the visiting professor. The open attitude of the teacher to contextualizing allows the in-country student the confidence to participate in the process of contextual learning. When learning "overseas" out of context, the risks are increased and the consciousness of the teacher to contextualization is reduced. These comments from both Canadian and Kenyan participants indicate that changes did occur in the teaching practice and process of the students and, to a lesser degree, the professors. Yet there has been a reciprocity of learning.

With classroom observation and the responses to the interview questions a parallel could be drawn between the teaching philosophies of the Canadian professors and the philosophies discussed in the research of Scott, Chovanec and Young (1993). In their study entitled "Philosophy-In-Action in University Teaching" they state that there are five basic philosophies of adult education which interface with the pedagogy. "These are: 1) traditional, 2) humanist, 3) humanist/critical, 4) critical and 5) feminist" (p. 5). The research refers to the work of Shor and Freire (1987), Mezirow (1991), Knowles (1984) for philosophies of adult education and for critical pedagogy Briskin (1990), Grundy (1987) and McLaren (1989). The professors who went to Kenya fell into two of these categories, traditional and humanist/critical. The traditional instructor is one who assumes the teacher has information and knowledge in which the student is deficient. The task of the traditional teacher is to impart to the student that which will push the student to become more competent in thinking and behaviour. The Canadian participants in the CMIN used the term "master teacher" or "expert" to describe colleagues with this orientation.

The second category of philosophy encountered, humanist/critical, is a blend of humanist philosophy which "assumes that adults are intrinsically oriented to self-direction and that increased self-direction in life leads to enhanced self esteem" (Scott et al. 1993, p.6). This is blended with the critical philosophy which assumes that there is never neutrality in education and that knowledge is socially and culturally constructed and reflects the language, power and assumptions of people. No Canadian would have been described in the feminist philosophy, perhaps because of the limited numbers of professors involved. This gap is certainly one area which needs a critical examination for a future CMIN in order to address issues of women and development.

The classroom provides a safe space for a learning experience which is collaborative and contextual. Each party has been co-learner and therefore each party has gained in knowledge. The CMIN professors who went as learners also were those who returned saying they had learned from the experience. The teachers with a traditional philosophy towards pedagogy returned to Canada with their own knowledge and experience intact.

The Kenyans learned perhaps because there was a deliberate design to the courses. A cyclical model of learning had been employed for the project. In order to understand the model used it is necessary to hear the Canadian participants' views about the methodology or model of education they believed they were utilizing.

> I'm still convinced the methodology works, and I came with the conviction that the methodology worked. This is reflection, that you can make changes in attitude and behaviour more quickly if you can see them and interact with them and respond to them yourself than when someone else tries to tell you what the changes should be. I still think that is good methodology. (CP1 4-3)

> ...the pattern of concentrated learning then a period of reflection in the context of their normal work world and life with preparation for the next seminar then moving into a period of focused reflection and learning. Then following learning again in the field so there is a cycle of *Praxis* and *Theoria* and then back into *Praxis and Theoria* what I think is sometimes called the spiral of learning where you re-enter the learning circle at a higher level which was conceptually integrated by the ministry project which lasted for three and a half years. Though technically it might not have been as successful as we may have dreamed because it was there, because they were expected to be integrating all this stuff and were expected to learn how to pass it on to others or to equip others for ministry, not just be excellent themselves, there is an assumption behind everything we did that this can not be a classroom learning project. It is twelve months a year and four years of continuous learning focused at certain seminars but continues through their application and preparatory reading stuff they

> did. (CP6 3-1)
>
> I think we were weaker on theological reflection in *Praxis* than we were on doing the traditional thing in teaching the information. I don't think we failed in that but I think we didn't succeed in that as we should have. I don't know if we did a really good job of teaching how to reflect theologically on their experiences. We could have done a lot more and we are doing more in the ACC & S on that score. I think in the first generation we were too classroom based and not enough *Praxis* based. In the second one we are more *Praxis* based or balanced. (CP6 11-3)

The simple explanation regarding the model used for the educational process would be as follows. Prior to each course each of the students was provided with all the necessary textbooks and reading material for the course. These texts were primarily supplied from the west but where texts were locally available in Kiswahili these were provided. As mentioned earlier, the availability of local texts is a problem for Kenyan students. The students were required to read the material in expectation of the classroom discussion and teaching. The professor then had an intensive ten day classroom time with the students. The students were then expected to complete two assignments. The first assignment for each course was the supervised practicum application of the course content within the student's work environment. This was also to be written into the CMIN project report. The second assignment was a more theoretical or academic experience of reflecting on the practical application with reference to the textual material. These assignments would then be presented for evaluation prior to the succeeding course. The cycle was then repeated.

This process, or model, was followed in both the ABC and the initial ACC & S courses. Because of personal scheduling problems for professors in the ACC & S project, this pattern had been somewhat altered. Canadians knew what the model and design of the process was, yet some were rightly concerned that the process was altered without projecting what the effect might be on learning. This Canadian says,

> I would not have shortened the courses at present. Last year we did a longer course and I think we should have stuck to that model of a week and a half and the five and a half day course I think is too short, I haven't experienced it yet here but we are talking about all kinds of things that slow down the transfer rate of information, knowledge and experience and we are talking about changing attitudes and behaviours that - I do not think the five and a half day model is right. We have a crisis in the current urban course because the books have not come in. Ideally the students were supposed to have completed all the readings for the course before the course began. It's not their fault but the books are not here. We have violated our own model which is student preparation prior to the course, intensive experience then the reflection and writing period afterward. And the length is shortened and we are jemmying up that system partly by our own inattention to detail and partly by circumstance. The fact that the leadership course wasn't taught in December and the exegesis was brought in April has violated our own sequence of a specific course. The students have actually started one course before they finished another course. That should not have happened. (CP1 5-5)

THE PROJECT CRITICISMS

In critique of the CMIN process the Kenyan participants had comments which focused on four (4) areas. These included 1) the shortness of the classroom time for courses, 2) the supervision of the practicum 3) the resources available for assignments,and 4) the nature of the assignments.

The comments surrounding the shortness of the time frame utilized for in-class teaching, indicated that more days need to be added for teaching.

> There are many lay people who could do this CMIN and they ask me all the time if there would be an opportunity for them to enter the CMIN. Many of the lay-leaders are school teachers and other professional people, they are many and they could be included with the clergy. The problem would be for the school teachers as they could only come during the time when schools are closed like December, April and August. Three times per year would be much better for us than just the two times like we did. Our course was one and half weeks but they should be three weeks. (KG1 6-3)

The length of class time is a critical issue which has not been addressed with the proper dialogue and extent of discussion needed to meet both the Kenyan desire for longer class periods and the problems of international travel for the Canadians. The extension of the length of class time was expressed by the clergy but the lay-people in the course were not of the same opinion.

> If it were longer it would be boring and you know many people tend to have short things. Shorter courses is good because like myself I am a business person and if it is longer I would miss or lose my work. (KS1 2-10)

The issue is complex but more complete dialogue would bring a balance in both the length of each course and the frequency of courses in each year.

The supervision problems addressed included the falsification of a few projects in part because of the background knowledge, or lack of knowledge, of the supervisor. One specific incidence which occurred was the staging of a performance in Kikamba so that the English speaking supervisor would not know the event was a one time staged performance rather than part of the ongoing project application. The problems included not only the lack of language skill on the part of the Canadian supervisor but also there were a few complaints over the potential lack of course understanding from Kenyan supervisors. The problem of a potential dependency on Canadian supervision would be alleviated as the Kenyan supervisors continue to participate in the course material and take the responsibility for the supervision. A second CMIN with each of the ABC and ACC & S would potentially allow for totally Kenyan supervision. Canadians recognized this area of weakness and attempted to make the change in supervision duties between the ABC and the ACC & S projects. As is stated, perhaps it is too soon to give a final verdict on the changes for the ACC & S CMIN.

> I think we learned from the first one that is complicated having a Canadian as the director of the field education component. From my point of view that was where I got my best orientation. I learned most not in the classroom but I learned most by visiting students in their settings. If you asked me for the single most significant factor in my own learning in the program it would not be in the second generation where I fly in and teach one course and go home though I hope to visit one third of the students in their situation. - To me the most significant learning experience was driving all day spending two days with someone, listening to their questions, meeting their families, meeting the people they work with, interviewing the people they work with. Seeing people, and sometimes I saw more than I should have sometimes I saw less, sometimes I saw what they wanted me to see but I am smart enough to know that I can make my own judgements and I don't have to buy what they told me about themselves. Though I wasn't always smart enough to know that difference. I learned more about education and Kenyan people and about theological education in Kenya through my own investment as Director of the field education component than I did teaching in the classroom. So it was a compromise in a way when we moved in the second generation saying that didn't work as well as it would work if we had Kenyans doing that. When we acknowledged the leaders would mentor and involve their lives anyways and we could ask them to be involved in the field education along with the missionary. (Field Supervisor 10-5)

The need for extra resources and the nature of the assignments were discussed as a theme by the Kenyan participants. Taking a project to another continent has some drawbacks. The CMIN which is offered in Canada has the advantage of libraries and bookstores which are usually accessible for the students. This was not the case for Kenya. Some texts sent to Kenya from Canada arrived long after the course was complete. The local, Tanzanian printed Kiswahili texts, are limited in the disciplines that are available. These resources were placed in the library as well as being part of the course work. CBIM provided the ABC with a large printing press and one of the CMIN students had their CMIN project printed in Kiswahili by the ABC press.

> To change would be the time of the teaching. According to the way we study and learn here in Kenya we do not go so quickly. We usually study several things over a longer time rather than one compact fast study. We usually study for longer periods of time although we can get used to the shorter courses. The time should be increased a bit. It is not that we can not learn quickly but we usually take a longer time and have a couple of studies together. Also there is always a need for extra resources when we study. If more books could be added it would help a great deal. (KG1 3-5)
>
> Somebody who has been out of school, I think, even I told the Principal of the program, we don't have enough books. We are given many assignments and we don't have the resources to refer. You think someone is writing a paper of more than 2000 words and relying just on The New Bible Commentary, Lions Handbook, the Bible we struggle very much with that. I wonder for, I sympathize with the laymen who are with us who are relying on three books. Someone like myself who has a small library in his room somebody who doesn't have the (resources) there is a struggle. The lack of books is something we struggle with. (KS5 3-4)

The CMIN budget included the provision of an initial small basic library for the Kenyan students and this was augmented with the addition of textbooks for each of the courses. If supplementary financial gifts are received in Canada then extra resource books are provided to the Kenyans. The ABC library had sufficient volumes for the needs of the assignments but the ACC & S has no such library. In two specific cases the students found the text-books far too difficult to understand.

> The problem with the assignments was that some wanted to commit themselves entirely to the studies but we all had our jobs to look after like Pastors, teachers at the Divinity School. The assignments themselves were not excessive, they took a lot of work, a lot of reading and the time was short and work responsibilities were heavy. The assignments were good because they forced us to read and apply ourselves. All the assignments had an explanation and we had books to use on the project assignment. Each person could design their own project to fit the work they were doing. I would plan the assignments with specific reference to the students who were in the course. Individualize them for the work they are doing whether it be short or long assignments to do in a week or months. (KG1 6-5)

The projects were all designed in conjunction with the supervisors and negotiated with regard to the situation in which each student was working. There was a desire by a few students to do only written projects but the intent of the application project was to be a reflective interaction in the work setting. The students were not familiar with this form of project work and the professors needed several attempts to explain the intent before the students were able to proceed with the process.

WHO LEARNED WHAT?

The determination of the answers to a question like "who learned what?", has often been placed in the hands of international consultants and experts in the field. These consultants have been critiqued by Hoole (1978), Arnove (1982), Conyers and Hills (1984) and Fry and Thurber (1989) for the role they play in development and exchange. The research conducted by Fry and Thurber (1989) did however point out some positive advantages for the in-country educational programs conducted by "advisers/consultants". These included not only the cost reduction but also the availability of in-country education to people from lower socioeconomic backgrounds. Effectiveness in ones own setting did not assure success in cross-cultural settings. "Another important measure of success is the extent to which advisers can overcome ethnocentrism and cultural arrogance, to become genuinely multicultural protean individuals" (p.85). In the summary of their research they suggested that three elements needed to function together for the success of in-country adviser projects. These were the individual traits and competencies of the adviser, the organizational context and relationships and the national context with all its historical socio-political pressures. This research into consultation indicates that there must be some reciprocal learning in order for the project to be successful. The adviser must learn and adapt to some of the cultural components and national participants need also to be receptive to the outsider.

Within the CMIN project the questions of what the various parties learned presented some entangled answers. Both Kenyans and Canadians were asked "What did Kenyans learn?", and "What did Canadians learn from the CMIN?" These questions were often answered by an indication of "what I learned was..." and a comment that "you should ask them". Following such comments all participants went on to offer their own statements about what the other parties were learning or might have learned. The responses from Canadians about what the Kenyans learned brought four general answers. The initial response was one which suggested both good and bad were part of the learning. Fears of the bad surrounded courses which introduced new concepts. These were specifically courses such as "Leadership", "Cross cultural mission", and "Urban Ministry". The fear was that the courses had planted the seeds of dissatisfaction with the present leadership and direction of the denomination. This was initially very distressing to the professors involved as the dramatic paradigm shift which took place among the students had not been anticipated. In planning the overall project a measure of potential areas of change had been recognized. The Canadians knew that some of the course content would be totally new to the Kenyans but the magnitude was only revealed after the application portion of each course was undertaken. When the students began to implement the changes in their work and teaching situations the enormity of the change was recognized. The courses encouraged the students to believe in their own knowledge and to act upon that knowledge. As the students experimented with the application they began to see results in their own lives and in the lives of their congregations. The changes appeared to challenge the way the church had expected results to be accomplished. This forced the students to question themselves as the church increased in numbers and vigour, both results deemed positive by the leadership.

> That is a tough question if we are really going to be honest about that. I have had some fears that some of the things they have learned may have shattered some things. (CP3 3-3)

> The down-side of a program like this is that they will be restless for more and they will be unhappy with the structure and policies of the contexts in which they are working. A classic example which you may not know about, yes it happened when you were there. When (CD) held the leadership course with the ABC several people came out of the seminar and said "This pours salt in our wounds!" I said "What do you mean?" They said "Now we know how badly we have been treated by all our superiors." We had to immediately shift gears and had to sit down, if you remember, to figure out

> how this could help them relate better to their superiors and being a lot better to the people under them. That is symbolic, even though we caught that one in the bud. The general impact of what this program does is that they could become dissatisfied with the senior leadership of their denomination. (CP6 5-3)

The dramatic change in the students' awareness was seen initially in a negative light because of the consciousness of the Canadians that they were coming to assist the church in an upgrading process not to overturn the structures. Historically Canadian teachers had come as "supply" teachers to augment the staffing needs of the national church theological school. The Canadians were unresolved in the juxtaposition of the respect for local indigenous culture and the empowerment of participants within that setting. The professors had come as invited guests by the administration and the course content was challenging the structure. The participants only represented a portion of the leadership and the change in the few began to impact on the larger group. The pedagogical orientation of the leadership course introduced both pedagogical change and content change as part of the course. This placed a few participants with new skills which were empowering to them but stood in contrast to the cultural practices used in the hierarchy of the church. Canadians felt they had come as guests to help with the teaching of leaders. In hindsight perhaps the magnitude of change should have been anticipated, but it wasn't. Why not?, perhaps is answered, because the content of the courses were determined after the general CMIN was designed and no real consultation transpired over the detailed content of the courses.

> I really think that when I went I had not thought about any major change that we might bring. Sure I knew that some of the course material would cause some mental struggles as they tried to grasp the content. I guess I wasn't prepared, you couldn't

> be prepared for the way the Kenyans tried to make such an immediate application of the lessons. If you teach this stuff in Canada it is thought about, written about and maybe some individual gets the dream of actually using this stuff. There, they took what we said and ran with it. Within weeks the course was being field tested beyond anything you could design as research. It caused a panic inside me. Here are people who actually heard and wanted to use what we said. I guess I also had to ask myself, did I really believe the theory I said could be applied. They proved it could. (CP9 12-4)

The second response to what Kenyans learned focused on the content of either their own course or one about which they had received feedback. Everyone expressed an optimism that their own course had been received and content learned by the students. All professors believed that the students were able to take the course content and apply it both in their personal lives and in their ministry situations. The skills acquired were practical. These included conflict management skills, preaching techniques, exegesis and hermeneutical skills, awareness of the possibilities for alternate forms of ministry in the cities, and a reduced fear and heightened understanding of how cities work. Rural ministry was not specifically addressed because the churches indicated they were doing an adequate task in the rural community and Canadians felt their skills were better suited to teaching about the urban task. The urban ministry allowed for the introduction of cooperatives, polytechnical schools, aids shelters, women's and men's hostels, daycares, nursery schools, self-help groups, sanctuary space, housing developments, home ministry groups, nutrition education and church property utilization. Each course introduced a few new issues to the Kenyans.

> Different things in each of the courses as I understand it, one of the things they are going to learn is a disciplined approach to exegesis, and with the exegesis the application of that in their preaching and teaching ministries, I think, they

> gain some new skills they do not currently have that they can then apply to their ministries, in the situation they are in. In the case of leadership they are going to learn some leadership models which will help them to choose their leadership style more intentionally and probably lead them to experiment with leadership styles that they have not experienced themselves. In urban mission thing in which I have the most understanding, I believe they are learning to look at cities differently than they did before they're interacting with some models of ministry that are going on right here in Nairobi and in this environment I believe they can transfer or modify in their own situations. And my other agenda for that course is that they will have a different attitude towards cities and urbanization than they have currently. In the other courses, systematic theology overview I hope they are going to pull together an understanding of how all these elements of theology fit together.
> I'm not sure that one course is adequate for that. I see us taking mature people who have some to a lot of experience and giving them tools that come out of the Western model of theological education for their use.(CPl 1-5)

It is worth noting here that only one professor remained static with his response in terms of only discussing his own course content and not commenting on the general experience of learning for the Kenyans. There are reasons perhaps for this anomaly which would reflect the amount of time that was invested beyond the demands of the classroom. Most of the other professors were able to arrive early and stay beyond their teaching period to interact with the Kenyans.

A third comment made by seven of the professors focused on the learning processes which the Kenyans have now made part of their study habits. The sharpened planning and discipline needed for the CMIN was believed to have been internalized as a life skill for the Kenyans. This was an accurate perception made by the Canadians and was expressed and confirmed by the Kenyans. The Canadians stated as follows:

> They can tell you themselves, but what I think they learned is subject to their correction. They might have learned some bad things. I think some of the good things they learned was the disciplined study and serious stuff that involved pouring over the books and writing about curriculums and reflecting in papers and organizing material and learning how to research and then applying it and thinking about it. They learned through *Praxis* a process of theoretical reflection and *Praxis* and further theoretical reflection. So they learned some disciplines, some life disciplines that can't help but spill over to everything from the preparation of their teaching for their people to how they handle their finances, though I think we wished they learned more about that, but those are life skills. Things that we probably didn't set out to teach them that but I think they probably learned that. The down side of that which could be bad learning was the fascination with cognitive learning and the pride of knowledge which is almost always attached to the upper level of education and the sense that having mastered knowledge they have wisdom which they don't have and I don't have. (CP6 3-3)

Praxis refers to the application of knowledge into the life experience of an individual. It is the incarnation of theory. "People learn in *praxis*, by doing as well as by studying, especially when the teacher is no longer the-one-who-teaches, but a fellow learner-teacher (Freire 1972:67)" (Stevens & Stelck, 1993, p.37). *Praxis* is the critical reflection on one's own experience. This reflection and application allows for movement along the spiral of learning (Sano, 1990). *Praxis* is the reinforcement of the learning or the empowerment and self-actualization which are key factors within critical pedagogy.

> From what I can assume out of the first few courses is, a big part of the education is the self actualization of the students themselves, they are learning this material to pass it on. We are not training people just to use this material themselves, just to advance themselves but to use this knowledge to encourage their church , their communities, their families. Partnership seems to

> be a big part of it.(CP8 5-10)

As was confirmed by the Kenyans, the skills, course content and application are being passed to another generation of leaders and laity. The self-discipline even to family planning and finances did spill over and there is a heightened fascination by a small group for more education and knowledge. In the wider ABC church community there has been increasing pressure on the administration to include the lay people in any further CMIN which might be planned. The clergy have expressed their support for this inclusion which indicates a change in adversarial positions by both parties. The ACC & S CMIN has included the lay people and they in turn are proposing self-help cooperatives, business, and educational endeavours for the larger community. It is perhaps premature to predict success for this direction of lay involvement in social and economic development within their communities. As suggested earlier, further research would assist in determining the extent to which this extension of social action through the lay participants.

The fourth major comment centres around the holistic concept of life and ministry in a Christian context. This is expressed as a Christian world view by the Canadians, and represented by:

> I also think that because of the orientation of the program and the professors and the material they covered that they learned something about a Christian world view which they would have had to synthesize with their existing world view. They would not have bought ours just as we have not bought theirs totally. They would have developed a more holistic approach to their life as disciples of Jesus and Christian believers, so it is not simply the religious aspects of it that we are concerned with by the teaching of observances of the church but that would be for the totality of their life, family life, values and relationships and stewardship of creation that would be part of

> their view of the Christian vocation. I think some of them would have had a vocational conversion, not all but some of them would say "I now understand what it means to be a disciple of Jesus". They will have gained some valuable skills in handling the Bible exegetically in being communicators, in counselling, in doing mission work, in church planting, in administration, in leadership. (CP6 4-3)

This Canadian had observed a group of people in a rural community meeting together to discuss how they could work together collectively to improve the conditions of their village. The difference was that the group came together because an ABC CMIN graduate had responded to a combination of courses and crossed tribal and ecumenical lines to gather the people together.

All of the Kenyans responded with at least one specific reference to courses which were part of the overall program of studies. These generally were courses which they expressed as having left a dramatic impact on their life and work. If the tone of voice for the responses could be taken into account it would be evident that some courses have been far greater change channels than was anticipated. All of the graduates interviewed stated that the courses in Leadership, Urban Ministry and Cross-cultural Mission had dramatic impact. Three of the five graduates talked that way about the Preaching course and the Equipping course. The Equipping course focused on the inclusion of the lay people in the entire ministry of the church. Of the current ACC & S students all spoke of the Equipping course and the Urban course(s) as having an impact. The Leadership course had, at writing, not yet been taught and the Cross-Cultural Missions course was excluded from the ACC & S CMIN. The ABC describes itself as inter-tribal and had students at the Divinity School from at least 13 different tribes. The ACC & S sees its mandate as being primarily with one tribal group and suggested that at this time in their ministry perhaps the course should be replaced by a course which focused on the History of Missions in Africa. I can respect the ACC & S decision to focus its attention on the Kikuyu people. It is the largest tribal group and with the ACC & S's limited resources the focus of mission has been decided. From another perspective this might be somewhat short sighted in that the rapid urban growth of Nairobi brings an interaction of all Kenya's tribes within the city and therefore potentially also within the church and its community.

> Really of the nine courses we received all were excellent but to a greater extent now I really use the preaching because that is the most important work we were given to do by Jesus Christ when he returned to heaven. Now our preaching makes sense and people can learn from it. The other was equipping, I love that task of equipping people. And also the leadership course, because I am a leader. It is valuable also the cross-cultural course. The other courses I am not saying were bad but these others I use far more in the work I do.(KA4 2-2)

> We Kenyan students learned a great deal particularly to say Urban ministry. Before, we did not know how to welcome or how to take the news by any route or path to those people who live in an urban context. We learned how to help people who live in the city to live and serve God even where they work. Also we learned about God's Word and how we could cross over cultural boundaries to other tribal groups like the Maasai. To begin to understand the differences in approaches necessary to reach them without forcing them to abandon their cultural base, like not changing clothes as if it were part of Christianity. Rather to allow them to learn, and read and hear in their own language so that they might know enough to accept Jesus Christ. (KG3 1-6)

The dialogue has begun to introduce the CMIN participants to the potential for ministry beyond themselves but the limited extent of the CMIN course did not provide the opportunity for discussion to proceed to an understanding of indigenous belief. Perhaps a future course in cross cultural mission could develop this issue more completely.

The Kenyans also responded with compound or entangled answers and which overlap with the Canadian responses. The Kenyans stated that they had learned to discipline themselves in their work by planning and organizing.

> The development I myself have gone through since I entered the CMIN has been my ability to plan and organize the work I do. Now I plan what I will do each day, each week and even how I plan the overall year for the work. I now have the knowledge about how to plan my work. Also from the CMIN I have even begun to plan my own personal family matters including family planning. I came to realize that if I just kept having children eventually I would not be able to raise them and they would be beyond my abilities to support them. So here is one important knowledge I got from the CMIN. (KG6 1-4)

> First of all they are learning to do things in an orderly way. To do things in a systematic way and their idea of deadlines is coming alive to them and the importance of coping with it. I think commitment is also an art because some of the things they dread will be tested on the ground and they are also willing to test themselves to see if some of the things they learned in theory can also be practical.(KA3 1-6)

As a further subset of organization and planning, Kenyans expressed a change in their teaching styles and the ways in which they planned the lessons for both the classroom and congregational settings in their church work.

> In sum the CMIN did a great deal to assist our church. If I remember when the CMIN students, I think we were 18, as I try to go to the places we all work I see the difference in how we were helped. The CMIN had the aim of raising up some capable teachers and now I am one. There are others who are also teaching now and others who are teaching even if it is just their churches they teach and there is a benefit to our people. (KG1 1-12)

The themes of equipping others for work, which at times were expressed by the term "equipping" and liberation, were explicit in the responses of ten of the Kenyan participants. It is worth noting that the women who were interviewed all spoke of the liberation with great emotion and in two cases the emotional fervour was augmented by table slapping as punctuation. The term liberation is used as a freeing of opportunity to function. The Kenyans saw the clergy as controlling the entire ministry and so liberation means two things. First it is a freeing of the clergy in that it allows them to release and trust the laity with ministry which the clergy have retained as the domain only of themselves. The second step is then to free the laity to take the ownership opportunity and to exercise the freedom within the newly released ministry areas. The male participants tended to focus on the "giving up of their power" in liberation while the female participants tended to emphasize the sharing and giving over to others as the essence of liberation. Gore (1992) has commented on empowerment and stated that when power is seen as property rather than productivity the focus of its process is differentiated therefore "attempts to empower can (and probably will) have inconsistent effects" (p.60). The responses which follow could be differentiated with the first two passages indicating a desire to share the work, control or power with the others and the third passage suggesting a giving up of some of the possessed power. This in no way suggests that the task is complete nor that its effects are permanent.

> Actually they are learning new things especially on the liberating the laity. As in our church it seems the Pastors have been doing the work by themselves. They were not really involving the lay people but now actually we are encouraging those lay people to get into the work, the work of our

> Lord. (KS1 1-6)
>
> The other course was the liberation. There are so many things in our learning so up to now I cannot tell you what I am learning because I have not completed the course. I only know what has gone through up to now. But our course learning up to this year '93 is based on liberation and trying to reach others. (KS4 2-3)
>
> You mean Kenyans? I think the whole thing it is effecting my ministry. Even now if you were to say the program is finished you are pushed somewhere, we are in a bit higher frame than where we were. It is challenging us. Let me say it is going to affect our ministry mostly where the Pastor has been clinging to power and he has been thinking he is the only minister with in the church. Something that has given us a lot to think about. Even trusting the people we have been working with, the laity, the members who have no skill. But since, since I have come into this program I have been liberating some people, trusting them, delegating my power but not responsibility. It has been liberating us we the leaders of the church. (KS5 2-1)

The reverse question was also asked of all the participants, "What did Canadians learn from this process?" The Kenyans did not want to be presumptuous by suggesting they "knew" what the Canadians learned but all proffered suggestions. The Canadians, with one exception, all had a common theme. They had learned a great deal about a culture to which they were outsiders. The responses of both Canadians and Kenyans were parallel in the expression of cultural exposure and learning as the core of the Canadians' new knowledge. One of the Canadians expressed it well for the rest.

> How to begin to see another culture sometimes informed by the people who live here and informed by cross cultural missionaries they begin to see other cultures differently. I certainly feel that I have a different understanding of the cultures I've interacted with here now than before I came and every visit has created a deeper understanding

> than before. I think I go back to my courses enriched by African Kenyan illustrations which I use continually in my teaching in the North American setting. (CP1 1-7)

Answering in a similar vein with a common theme from the Kenyans' point of view one student stated;

> The Canadians, as far as I could understand or see, learned many things, for example, they learned about our habits and our culture. They received a benefit because when they were teaching us they increased their own understanding about our culture and how to work with us. (KG6 2-3)

The above statement, which was echoed by at least 12 of the Kenyans, was absent from the conversation of only one of the Canadian participants. Perhaps again it is because of the length of time invested with the Kenyans that the others learned. Perhaps the difference was because of the pedagogy which was different.

> I went in wanting to hear stories of traditional Kenyan religions and was exposed to that. I think what I learned was more in the area of surprising things. I wasn't anticipating how close there would be parallels between traditional African stories and some of the Biblical stories. There is a universal human narrative that is at work there. So the parallels were somewhat unexpected to me. What was unexpected to me was the great number of common questions that are being raised, which are similar regardless of context. So I was surprised at the number of questions I got from the Kenyans which would be the same questions you'd get from Canadians in a classroom setting. (CP5 2-5)

The inference drawn here is that this Canadian participant went to Kenya looking to accomplish a specific teaching task not with the accompanying goal of being a learner. When the balance of Canadians came away with a significant, if not life changing, experience the above noted learning is the anomaly. Others came away saying they learned about "time", "oral art", "boundaries of Western disciplines", about "other world views", and about "African religion and theology". These Canadians say it for the rest.

> It fired them up. For me personally it was a life changing experience. I have been to other countries. That is one way to go see a country. This time I went I had a job to do and the great thing about the job I was invited there to do it. When I got there I was received and also I got the opportunity when I went with you. And especially the first five days, they were absolutely critical to the program when I went out through the villages...
>
> I would say existentially I was changed, for the rest of them it was a true experience. They are really excited about it.(CA2 4-3)

> I'm learning a little bit of anthropology, a little bit of sociology, a little bit of theology a lot of psychology, I'm learning about African situations, African concepts of marriage, the Kenyan concepts of pre-marriage of dating, inter-generational relationships, within the class. The Canadians on the whole I hope we are learning how to do cross cultural education better in the long run. I think you are part of that, at least gathering all this stuff and trying to put it through the sieve and find out what we are doing wrong and right. For me personally, shoot it's a gold mine for me to have this opportunity to get into peoples lives. I think you must have done the same thing. It just came at the right time, it gave me an in into their families, I know so many grandfathers and grandmothers and children and but also the way we are doing it with a partnership of one on one I'm allowed into their homes. It has given me a relationship with them that is more than just a teaching relationship. (CP8 2-3)

The Canadians also learned that the project model which was used for the CMIN was able to bring change beyond that which was anticipated. Mutual respect and collaborative design will allow for an impact far greater than imaginable. Canadians also learned, along with Kenyans, that the church has the potential for far greater impact in the nation's development than would have been previously credited. The

CMIN was designed to reach the clergy and latterly the lay people. The goal was to assist these people to carry to their congregational settings the ministry potentials. As was discussed in earlier chapters, the expansion of the empowering aspects of the CMIN as development education could reach a far greater base. The inclusion of educational components less theologically specific like nutrition education, reforestation, water and soil conservation, accounting, or self-help cooperatives could utilize the same networks which the current CMIN used to reach the larger community. Local teachers in these disciplines could have an impact far larger than that of the Canadians who struggled with language barriers, cultural differences and contextualization problems.

The Kenyans added several other component themes to that of the Canadians' learning. The first theme, after the cultural component, was the learning which took place by the teachers in the classroom as they learned who the students were and the makeup of the students' background. The learning which the Canadians applied was the ongoing adjustment of pedagogy while in the classroom setting. It was a reflective model with the collaboration of the students.

> Also as they were teaching us they learned or gained the knowledge of how to adjust their teaching. When we asked questions they realized where we were with our knowledge and where they needed to take us. (KG6 2-3)
>
> From my perspective, I can say perhaps because all of them were experienced with teaching people with much knowledge so when they had to teach us they came to understand that even if they were able to teach those with greater knowledge they could also teach those with lesser knowledge. We have a knowledge level that is way down. But because of their humility and their love for us they were able to teach those of us with less knowledge.

> Also our customs, they were able to see and begin to understand the way we are. (KG4 2-3)

This Divinity School teacher was aware of the education of the students who enter both the school and some of those who were in the CMIN. With better than two thirds of the school with less than standard eight and several of the CMIN participants being standard 6-8 leavers this statement was not a self-reflection. The speaker had a post-secondary education before entering the CMIN. There is another subtlety in this second response which could slip unnoticed were it not for its repetition in another form expressed by other Kenyan participants. The willingness to live among the Kenyans was important. A swahili saying puts their perspective cogently; *Asiekujua hakuthamani,* which means "He who does not know you, does not value you". To learn from the students was an important factor in the Kenyans' openness to allow Canadians to be the teachers.

> Also they learned how to live with different people no matter what their tribal origin. Because they experienced things like sleeping, eating that the habits and cultures are not one but are varied and different. They learned to stay and live with us even if we are people below or higher. We stayed together like brothers and sisters. (KG1 1-10)

> Without doubt the Canadians learned various things from us. First they saw or understood the importance of staying with us. That is that it was important. They learned the relevancy of Christians of various cultures and tribes and the unity we have when we are gathered together. (KG3 1-8)

> The Professors from Canada are learning how we operate our church because just as they have come to teach us they see how we really are and they teach us in accordance with what they see. They help to correct areas that we have troubles. Here we are fine. Those are the things they learn from us because it is necessary for the teacher even to learn from the students. He then sees that here I

> must correct this a bit and there the students can understand more. If the teacher thinks he knows everything they cannot be a good teacher. (KS3 2-5)

This latter theme ties very closely with the theme of mutuality in development which was expressed earlier. As Shor and Freire (1987) and Torres (1991) state, the horizontal positioning of student and teacher where role exchange takes place provides the ideal opportunity for empowerment. The willingness of each party to become vulnerable gives the sensitivity needed for learning to take place in a cross-cultural setting. How can knowledge be transferred if there is no context into which the knowledge can be received? Mutuality brings a level of trust which enhances the receptivity. The teacher who is also a learner will encourage a mutuality in development to a greater extent than the vertically oriented expert, the master teacher who remains aloof.

> "Mwalimu Nzyoka (Teacher), may I carry your books for you up to the house?"
> I thought to myself, "Don't I look capable of carrying them myself?"
> But the thought remained hidden within my proud Western front.
> "But teacher", her reply seemed to sense my tightening hold on the notes and books in hand, "but teacher you have given so much to us. Can't I even carry your books?"

The CMIN project worked with the Kenyan church leadership who are all in roles which include their churches, the denominational theological schools and the development work which they carry. There has been a developmental impact on the both the ABC and the ACC & S.

Teaching at the Divinity School, Bible schools and local churches has been impacted by the leadership involved in the CMIN. They have translated their CMIN learning into classroom action as well as denominational and community participation. The students and graduates along with their denominational leaders state that the CMIN has had an impact. The Canadians also state there has been an impact in Canada. The teaching-learner time in Kenya gave Canadians a perspective on development which changed as their involvement brought them into situations of pedagogical choice. The professors faced choices which ranged from traditional pedagogy through to critical pedagogy. They may not have identified the shift but the change was seen by the students. Change in Canadian theological institutions has a greater potential for change than before these professors were involved in the CMIN. As Shor and Freire (1987) suggest the fear of transformation, or "relearning their profession in front of their students" (p.53) can prevent a teacher from changing. The Kenyan experience provided an opportunity to change with the students. Perhaps greater impact will be possible as Canadian professors continue to reflect on the process and as their pedagogy shifts and their development paradigm shifts towards the critical-feminist paradigm social transformation paradigm respectively.

CHAPTER 6

RECIPROCITY OF VOICES

Jifya moja haliinjiki chungu.
(One stone will not support a cooking pot.)

In the cooking hut of the traditional Kamba home there were, and still are, always three very carefully chosen stones. These stones were matched with great care so that they would be able to support the household cooking vessel. Whether that cooking vessel was a clay pot, an aluminum sufuria (a basin-like pot), or a stainless steel or cast iron kettle should not matter because the three stones were chosen in order that the firewood could be fed under any pot at the rate the cook determined. One or two stones would never function in the same fashion. The same can be said for the isolationism of knowledge control. As we globally work and learn together we discover that it is through collaboration that we grow and develop our potential. To stand in isolation weakens the potential for each of the participants.

The web of relationships between the west and the national elites has historically legitimated the control and possession of knowledge. Publishing, technology, credentials, resources and the direction of knowledge flow all have been influenced by these North-South interactions. There are exceptions and there are examples of attempts to redress the situation. This Kenyan Case study would confirm that the Kenyans wanted knowledge which they believed Canadians could share with them. Canadians agreed to share their theological education with the Kenyans. The interaction between Kenyans and Canadians opened the opportunity for each party to see that knowledge could be shared in both directions. Canadians who had gone as learners and were willing to contextualize and collaborate with Kenyans learned a great deal and were able to understand that learning and knowledge flows in both directions when there is mutual understanding and collaboration. In the CMIN knowledge did not proceed in a uni-directional flow from the West to the Third World. There was learning on both sides, there was knowledge from the South which impacted (and is still impacting) the West, and there was knowledge which the South wanted and the West shared. In this case there was an attempt by Canadians to contextualize the course content with no expectation of return gain. However, those professors who were concerned about their ability to contextualize, who saw themselves also as learners, were able to encounter a life changing experience. They returned to Canada with knowledge they did not take to Kenya.

Initially all Canadian participants believed they were taking some unique knowledge to Kenya, knowledge which was from the West. These participants operated on a somewhat modified modernization paradigm. With this paradigm the Canadians went to Kenya to up-grade, to some degree, people who suffered some "deficit" in their knowledge. This deficit type of viewpoint was verbally supported by the Kenyans who suggested they needed the assistance because they lacked what the Canadians could supply and so a partnership was formed. The discussion which followed the CMIN project revealed that the Canadians had made the largest paradigm shift. Most of the Canadians had gone to Kenya with an openness to learn, mainly for the purpose of their own classroom preparation and contextualization in the Kenyan situation. Their stay with Kenyans, their time in homes, in life situations and the classroom altered the Canadian perspective on the knowledge they brought and the knowledge they were to take back to Canada. The Canadians began to incorporate pedagogical lessons which were learned in Kenya into their Canadian classrooms. The Canadians expressed a greater sensitivity to problems and issues of the Third world than before their experiences. This in turn has been aired in the churches and the seminary classrooms in Canada. The ongoing discussion surrounding future educational relationships with these African church leaders has opened dialogue which was not present before the project. The Canadians who believed in the transformational ability of learning were changed and in so doing were also able to impact the Kenyan students with a transformation in perspective, in experience and in pedagogy.

All but one of the Canadians made a shift in their understanding of education for development, to an understanding and practice of the need to share in a process which leads towards self-support of the students with whom they worked. This suggests support for Wagner's (1992) hypothesis that there can be a movement in roles and models from a "market" Western domination of and competition for knowledge, through the "liberal" global cooperation to a "social transformation model" which "adds a dimension of critical social analysis to the idea of international consciousness" (p.21). The experience in the classroom of three of the Canadians when the leadership course was presented pushed them to re-examine their paradigm of development. The conscientization of the students through the critical examination of leadership models forced a re-evaluation of the premise that Canadians had come to upgrade without critically analyzing or changing the hierarchical structure and power structures of the church. The process of critical pedagogy used to examine ministry formats and control by the clergy brought the personal empowerment issue to the Kenyan and Canadian consciousness. The curriculum, though not designed to address the paradigm of development, produced, through the pedagogical shift, a transformation in development paradigm. The interaction in classroom and field experience situations allowed for the Canadians to shift from teacher to teacher-learner and through this change the Kenyans began to shift their learning to participatory and self-actualization.

The CMIN program was seen as a development project by the Kenyans. It was more than just a series of theological courses to be credited to a transcript. It went far beyond the classroom not only transforming the lives of the immediate participants but also brought change to the larger community. Kenyan participants spoke about the local development projects like home gardens, water storage, tree nurseries, women's groups and technical training classes which they were influential in assisting. The Kenyans spoke about holistic theology that brought changes in their personal life and work planning which impacted the community. Planned lessons or sermons were now replacing the "off the cuff" style previously employed. One participant acknowledged the inclusion of family planning in the realm of influence from the CMIN. Not only were there personal and community changes there also were changes to the church because of the CMIN.

> For me personally I don't see any difference between development and the CMIN because development is people progressing and development is not to say, development is not to say Nzyoka's work continues. It is necessary that all the work of Nzyoka, of (myself), of others continue because the development of only one person does not make development of the country or the church. It is necessary for the leaders and their energy to proceed. The CMIN, as we began with the very first course in how to liberate the laity I have now some knowledge which I can give to others and so it will no longer be just me by myself that knows this. I want others in the church to know so that it grows and develops. In this country it is like our church is way down in spirit because the pastor does everything. If the pastor is away one

> Sunday you see people shrinking back because they don't know how to proceed. So I don't know if there is a difference between the CMIN and development because the CMIN is designed to uplift, to liberate the laity, and to lift up the youth, the women, the sunday school and the elders of the church. Every person should feel they are part and parcel of the church. (KS3 1-8)

The CMIN had components of what the Kenyans understood as necessary for development. They believed the CMIN was liberating. It was holistic in focus and empowering. It was uplifting and its end goal was people centred self-sufficiency. As Gutierrez (1983) and Ferm (1986) suggest the awareness of the disenfranchisement moved the Kenyans to a critical reflection and action. Theological education was seen as holistic by the CMIN students and therefore to be spread beyond themselves.

> Now from the course, what I think will continue to benefit me and I have been thinking this even before the course. It not really important to give somebody something to eat or something to ease her problems. But if somebody is equipped that is something that will help a person for many years. So on business of projects I think it is something that will help a lot. I have in mind, if God will help me, to start a project that will last for many years in ACC & S. So I think that area of projects it will help me a lot. Where I think it is important in the project area is because it can be done in urban areas and also in rural areas. Those who are coming here from Urban, you feel OK if you can start any project in the Urban. Those who are coming from (the) country side will feel alright because we can take that one outside. If by so doing you involve people to come to your project (it) is a good way because you have much to share to them about Christ. It doesn't mean that they will come only those who are Christians to your project. It is for the needy people and I think that is the time to use the power that has been liberated to use. People will be empowered to do more to do practical and theory will be very much beneficial to us after the project. (KS4 4-5)

The examples of community development projects in health, nutrition, child care, transient housing, cooperative business, self-help groups and skills training were the "project area" referred to in this participant's response. The CMIN helped to free (liberate) the Kenyans to make their own applications of projects in their own setting. As the respondent stated these projects are all transferable to rural and urban settings. The CMIN project in stimulating an emancipatory praxis exhibited a consistency with Habermas' premis. The emancipatory praxis placed technical and practical knowledge into the lived-world of the participants and through that liberatory action theory can expand. The "needy people" include the slum dwellers, those living in the urban garbage dumps, the poor, the landless and the marginalized. The CMIN participants began to suggest how they could assist specific populations to enhance their own life potential. The CMIN has opened up possibilities for moving beyond a modernization paradigm to a social transformation paradigm, that is, development which begins with the individual and is carried through ones own social context to those in ever increasing contact circles. Transformation which holistically impacts and changes the self sufficiency of others is social transformation. There is a need for further research to look directly at the impact on development which is holistically oriented.

PROCESS IN REFLECTION

The CMIN project was not developed in a few days of meetings. As was stated in chapter 4 the Kenyans believe the CMIN was built on the individual, personal relationships of trust and respect which came from the investment of a number of years of working and living together. The time together had provided a level of understanding and a sharing of the needs and the possible solutions to problems which were encountered. The African Church bodies had faith in the work the Canadians had done in Kenya, as they said they tested it over time. There was a sense of mutuality, a working together to some common ends. The participating bodies shared a common belief in the "mission" of the church. For the CMIN the parties expressed an open and honest willingness to work together, the parties had a respect for the strengths and weaknesses of the other. One of the key factors in the project's success as an international partnership is that the individuals working together had a mutual respect for the total work that needed to be accomplished. The theological expectations of the parties was sufficiently compatible so the parties involved gave their time and effort to "make" things work. When there were difficulties discussions were held to seek solutions to the problems. The institutions involved trusted their personnel with the task of completing the CMIN.

This should not be taken to assume that the CMIN process was without problems. The planning and design process did include participants from both Canada and Kenya. The administrators and on site personnel from Carey, CBIM and the African churches planned the project together. The criticism could be levelled that the students were not involved in the design process. A future project with these two churches will have the benefit of the feedback from participants. Recollections of the planning process imply a collaboration, each party bringing what it had to offer and discussing together the processes involved. This is probably a more accurate reflection on the ACC & S CMIN. The ABC CMIN may have been more cooperative in design. The Canadians made suggestions for meeting the felt needs and the ABC cooperated in the process designed to reach the goals.

The orientation of Canadian professors was very weak. The sensitivity to local culture takes a great deal of time and expended effort to study and understand. The short or non-existent orientation perhaps reduced the effectiveness of professors in the experience. The attempt by some of the professors to go to Kenya ahead of their teaching date seemed to allow an opportunity for a moderate orientation to the situation and contextual placement of the CMIN.

Reflection and ongoing evaluation of the project would be an area of weakness. There was always discussion about courses and students progress but no collective reporting nor re-design of the first CMIN as it progressed. Before the ACC & S CMIN there was limited discussion. Canadians talked with each other and with the ACC & S but without much feedback from the ABC. This problem has been rectified by this study and has allowed for further discussions in the future direction of education in the ABC.

Travel for Canadians to Kenya and the travel by the Kenyans to the classroom sites posed some difficulties for the implementation of the CMIN. There were cost factors, time constraints and communication difficulties which surfaced because of distance. Discussion and planning is never as extensive as it should be when time and distance mitigate against the process.

OUTCOMES

In summary the impact of the CMIN had components which were both planned and accidental. Change in leadership models was introduced and will bring about long term and perhaps permanent differences in the way the Kenyan CMIN participants apply their knowledge of leadership to their churches. New conflict management styles are being attempted and some will not be as effective as others because of the cultural heritage of the people, but the Kenyans have exercised their freedom to choose and reject the knowledge which they received from the West. Classroom teaching methods have definitely and dramatically changed for most of those involved. The treatment of students as co-learners, the planning of lessons, the expansion of course formats to include short course, site visits, and to use other teaching styles than lectures are some of the changes. Women have been allowed into new office, and through new doors. There is a role for women in development which had not been acknowledged. The women of these African denominations will not let the doors close after them but will have the strength to continue to liberate and empower others. A sense of self-worth has been gained by most of the participants. Several new institutions for training Kenyans have been initiated by the ABC based on their enhanced self confidence and teaching skill. CBIM has seen that it is possible to meet the requests, for student support to study in Canada, with a more equitable and sounder return on investment and better chance of contextualization.

Regarding contextualization it has become clear that the awareness of the need to contextualize is a prerequisite to the process of moving into context. The understanding of the need is part of the process of actually contextualizing. The awareness of the process of contextualization is also a step in understanding critical thinking as part of cultural sensitivity. There is a dual context which each professor faced in the CMIN experience. The first was the actual classroom pedagogical situations in which they were placed. Students were used to a master-teacher model and so a change in pedagogical style or philosophy was a challenge for the teacher as well as for the students. Language, cultural expectations and classroom dynamics were all part of the contextualization problem. The second major problem in contextualization was in terms of the wider Kenyan situation. The poverty, structural readjustment, currency devaluation, slum conditions, political stress (including being stoned in a political riot), the social upheaval of rapid urbanization and the educational background all were factors involved in the contextualization difficulties. At times the problems of Kenyan life appeared to be overwhelming for the Canadians.

To the Kenyans it appeared to be extremely important and significant that Canadians were also learning from them. Canadians who participated stated they had life changing experiences. It is easier for educators to understand the need for contextualization in an international cross-cultural setting. Is the need any less in a public school, a college or a university where the cultures of teachers and students interface? Several of the Canadian professors are actively involved in the redesign of Canadian theological education. The statement was made in early 1994 that "the model keeps bringing us back to Nairobi and the CMIN process"(CD 7.3.1994). The Carey Faculty and the denomination are actively discussing the initiation of a "church based" model for theological education which would blend cohort groups in the process of pastoral preparation. The Kenya CMIN was an experience which moved the professors to a vision beyond the limited goals and scope of the project.

The shift, if even partial, to a more critical pedagogy has impacted the Kenyan participants. They are asking questions of their leadership. They are pressing for change which they believe will continue to assist their congregations to become more self-reliant. The influence of these denominations within their communities is far greater than might be imagined from a Canadian world-view of the church. There are communities within walking distance of many rural ABC or ACC & S churches where everyone in the community considers themselves members of the church. The professors who preached in the ABC Mitaboni church spoke on an ordinary Sunday to more than a thousand people in the church building. This is stated to reflect that the impact of a rural church like the ABC or ACC & S has a dramatic community contact for development. The church still has a vast following in rural areas and a diminishing following in the urban areas. Both these churches take their strength of membership from the rural areas.

It would be presumptuous to pretend that the CMIN had a vast impact in development and transformation within the Kenyan setting. The numbers of people who were involved were only 17 in the ABC and 24 in the ACC & S. These people in turn have circles of influence or contact. There was some evidence that the CMIN graduates and a few of the students have initiated local development projects with the people in their communities. Whether the influence beyond the CMIN circles will be permanent, empowering and life changing will need another piece of research to discover.

One area which this research did not follow was classroom observation in Canada after the professors returned. The suggestion was made by Canadians that they had made some shift in their pedagogy but again to ascertain its permanence as change was not thought about in the proposal stage and therefore this investigation was not carried to the Canadian classroom. The Kenyan teachers, former CMIN participants, were observed in their Kenyan classroom settings but the Canadian professors were not observed.

RESEARCHER'S REFLECTIONS

What a thrill it was for me to return to Kenya to a project of which I had been part. What happens when the researcher is a piece of the program and then researches the project? I had been one of the teachers in the CMIN project. I had helped plan and implement the program and I had been present for the graduation. Would the graduates see me as the researcher, or as the teacher? The insider researcher faces the dilemma of establishing enough critical distance to provide independent critique of the projects outcomes. In this instance I approached the research with a scepticism about any positive results. I thought that the CMIN project had created more problems than it could solve. I wondered if I had been party to the creation of another western aid project. I thought maybe the changes introduced in the leadership course might cause a church split. I questioned the potential credential-elitism of a few graduates who might now demand leadership rather than earn it. I feared Canadians might have exposed some latent anti-colonial hostility so the Kenyans would sever their fellowship with us. I had opposed the second phase of the CMIN beginning without a full evaluation but it had proceeded in spite of my protest. There was a shadow on my thinking which expected to confirm a modernization-dependency paradigm maintained by a master-teacher philosophy. I had convinced myself that none of the professors would exhibit anything resembling my preferred paradigm of critical social transformation. To find some shift therefore was a surprise.

The risk I took in returning to Kenya to research was that I might have been excluded from access to the participants if my fears had materialized. The graduates received me with great emotion and celebration. They wanted to know all about all of the other CMIN professors, about family and about my university studies. They wanted to tell me, without sparing detail, about their own personal growth and the growth of the church. I experienced the church changes with my eyes, my ears and my heart. I had known the state of the church and so could support the graduates' claims with my visits. I saw the increased attendance in the churches and Sunday schools. I visited several tree nurseries, saw water storage tanks, and ate produce from community gardens. There was no false performance, I could speak to the clergy and laity alike to confirm the changes. My inside background knowledge had been built over years of personal involvement in their lives. I knew the former status of the Divinity School and could hear from the students and teachers about the changes the CMIN had begun. There were different courses introduced and the students spoke about learning with their teachers. I heard some of the lay-people and some of the clergy plead for another CMIN program in which they could participate. These were all people who knew and trusted me and I, them. Their answers could be confirmed by talking to their colleagues or other members of their community. No outside researcher could have had access to the participants and this depth of contact without years of living with them. To be a participant researcher gives windows of opportunity not open to the outsider.

For the researcher who has also been a participant of the program there are some areas of concern which surface. I posed the following question, how could a former student criticize my teaching if I had been inappropriate with language or cultural behaviour or contextualization? With two of the participants we had been so close in our years of teaching together that these two had spoken to me on numerous occasions to assist me to understand the culture. They had been language and culture informants and had corrected me and allowed me to be included in their family "crisis" and grief situations. I know that during the interview process I listened carefully to the voices and watched the body language of participants to determine when I was being told something they thought "I wanted to hear". If you live within a culture for sufficient time to be considered an inside-outsider you can read through the culturally appropriate answer.

There are some ethical issues which surface when you are an insider to the program process. From the inside you can evaluate the potential risks to people because you have personal knowledge of their circumstances. The criticisms which may be levelled against colleagues are difficult, if not impossible to disguise and could damage ongoing relationships within or between institutions. I found, that as an insider, I was able to dig far beyond the questions I had designed. This information, if it were used, could damage peoples' careers or put someone at risk. There are, in my transcripts, three sections which were prefaced by the participants saying, "you are the one person who will see and hear this", "now I don't want this in your study but..." and "if I tell this, I don't want (x) to see it". Several other conversations which were frank, blunt, exposing and off the record were also held but without the tape recorder. All these passages were kept confidential and have not been included in the thesis. This in itself raises another vital ethical issue, that of confidentiality of the subjects and their informed consent. When a participant says an issue is not to be included the consent has been withdrawn for that section. Does the exclusion of such data influence the conclusions? The answer is always yes. There has been an influence on the direction of the conclusions or some part of it when data is excluded. The researcher needs however, to look for parallel or complementary information to include which does not compromise the study. This has been the process utilized in the CMIN research.

There is an ethical issue which every educational project raises and theological education is no exception. An attempt to try something new, or different even with mutual consent becomes an experiment with human subjects. The project, the teaching, even the research and evaluation impacts on human lives. The very process of education brings change in peoples lives. We go to do a project like this knowing some things will change but also not certain what the effects and reactions might be. Who decides what is harmful or beneficial? The answer from the CMIN study is that the participants through collaborative reflection and critical analysis will decide. The questions of change must be faced with a mutual sharing of the knowledge of all participants. I believe it is better to err on the side of trying than to remain static.

There are also some negative aspects to research which is designed and conducted after a project is along its path. The evaluation of problems as they occur, as well as the reflection on design and implementation do not get the emphasis that may be needed, at the time, for the best interests of the participants. The most serious problem is perhaps the expectations raised within the participant circle by the researcher-participant. If the study shows that the process is of value and should be repeated, then the question is pushed, will another CMIN be planned? There will be pressure for another project which also carries the "weight" of a research study as support. Institutionalizing the program will not bring results if the commitment is not held by the parties involved.

The participant researcher can also provide direct input into the project or future parallel projects from the results of the research. Areas of concern can be addressed with the addition of anecdotal reflection. The students who wanted me to thank the Canadian sponsors for the project will have their request fulfilled. Will their request for another CMIN for their colleagues be as easy to fulfil?

> Student: What I want to say is " this class we have, when it ends we don't want it to stop there" we want it to help others. If we include others in this course work we will be able to assist our country as a whole. If we stop only with this class then people, when they retire, will reduce our strength to work and won't continue with strength.
>
> Now I want to ask you a question.
>
> Nzyoka: Yes

> Student: I want to know when our class finishes, will it mean you will leave us in the ACC & S and return to the ABC or will you go to another church, AIC or someone?
>
> Nzyoka: At this point I don't have an answer to that question.
>
> Student: Why don't you select 20 students from the ACC & S and 20 students from the ABC and then find a place where you can bring them together and teach them together. Then you could really begin to see the fruit. That fruit has to grow and it must be fruit which continues to flourish and not to end.

GRADS' VOICE

The CMIN set a number of mutually agreed upon goals which were based on the felt development needs of the African church. The church had expressed some areas where they wanted Canadians to participate. The specific educational aid relationship focused on empowering Kenyans to assume the teaching and leadership roles of the church. The in-country education plan allowed the participants to examine their own potential as teachers and leaders and through a cycle of theory, application and evaluation the Kenyans assumed new roles with changes to their pedagogy.

Maero (which means the eager one):

> In sum the CMIN did a great deal to assist our church. The CMIN students, I think we were 18, as I try to go to the places we all work I see the difference in how we were helped. The CMIN had the aim of raising up some capable teachers and now I am one. There are others who are also teaching now and others who are teaching even if it is just their churches they teach and there is a benefit to our people. Really there is a change in my classroom practice. Things like equipping, leadership and personal spirituality we did not give any emphasis but now I push these things and the students seem so pleased.
>
> In the past the teachers and the students did

> not have anything to do with each other. The teachers were above and beyond the students, but now because of those subjects the students and the teachers have been brought together. There is a partnership in the process now. There was a change in my teaching because of the CMIN, particularly as a result of some of the courses like spirituality, cross-cultural mission, urban and some others. These we introduced after we had taken them and as I began to introduce them people were very pleased. Even in the churches those in the CMIN began to introduce these and the church people were very willing to accept them. For example, (during) this last practicum we sent one student to Nairobi and that one worked there because he had the Urban course. The other major change has been the use of time, rather than using up a whole day or several days for something, now I plan and it takes a few hours. As well, at the Divinity School rather than stretching some courses out we set aside a block of time to complete the teaching as a short course of two or three weeks. What we learned in the CMIN about intense courses we can now apply for the regular D.S. terms.
>
> I can give you the example of nearly six people who now cry loudly because if they had only known the benefit they also would have joined the CMIN. Now I think almost the entire church has seen and accepted the CMIN as valuable. Even our Bishop says the CMIN people if they continue in their current activity are certainly fit to guide the church. There was a time that the Bishop said to us that he had sent people to the Limuru Theological College and sent people to the CMIN but the ones in the CMIN were far superior to those who went to the Theological college.

STUDENT VOICE

Development paradigms can operate on global, national or local level and the CMIN was able to impact a small group of Kenyans in such a way as to change their lives. One of the goals of the CMIN was to bring the clergy to a point of recognition that the entire congregation, clergy and lay people should be liberated to carry the work of the church. The power structures of the church were established with a hierarchy of clergy. There was a need to both liberate the clergy from their need or desire to control the ministry and to empower the lay people to believe in themselves and their capacity or potential to be part of the ministry of the church. The development goal was to help people so they could help themselves. As Kenyans began to believe in their own vision and potential they began to change their teaching "from lecture to sharing, participation" as symbolic of the movement to self-actualization of members of their communities. The implications for women and development are evident.

Nawire (which means the beloved one):

> The CMIN on the whole brings knowledge, it is educating. The goal is to help people to, you know, there are many people who are impoverished, people who are without joy in their lives, people with troubles, poverty stricken and they can not even care for themselves. The goal of the CMIN is to assist the leadership, pastors, elders to work together to build the Kingdom of heaven.
>
> Because now we select a group of people to teach the educated. And when they receive some teaching we are telling them now you teach some other people. Those then teach others and so the church begins to grow and it draws other people, those who would not have come before. Another thing, what I have achieved, now if I leave here I can sit with my committee. We can find 5000 shillings and find five people we can give them a start to a small business like vegetable selling and tell them "you must repay the loan when you have succeeded in establishing yourself in order to help another". This is the way we will rid ourselves of the extreme poverty.
>
> I have changed my methods of teaching them since I started the CMIN because I want people to do things for themselves. I don't tell them, I make them find out. The kind of method that I am now using is quite different from what I was doing before. I was lecturing but now we share, we participate and I have seen, I have found very many women who have gifts which I want to see. So I tell them I am learning I may get a certificate

> after this or whatever but mostly the knowledge I am getting is the most important.
> I would like them, when you go back and you see those people who organize the CMIN. Really, we are very grateful, especially myself. If they can probably continue the CMIN we would be grateful. We are very grateful, especially myself I am grateful, very happy that I joined this one.

TEACHERS' VOICE

The CMIN project had Canadian professors participate in the process. Though most went to Kenya with the assumption that they were the teachers, they soon became teacher-learners. Their pedagogical experiences from Canada were challenged and a more critical pedagogy began to move into their classroom practice. The scepticism about what motives and what Canadians could offer was replaced by an excitement that change was evident in the students lives and work. People were released for the ministry, confident, that they were able to release others in the same fashion. Canadians learned from the Kenyan experience. They learned something about Kenyan culture and they were able to enrich their teaching practice when they returned to a Canadian classroom. The expansion of world views, the opening of experiences beyond themselves adds to the classroom effectiveness. The newly initiated and anticipated changes to the location and tradition of theological education in Canada awaits a follow-up study.

Wangira (which means born on safari):

> The first thing I want to say is I am really excited about the project. It has flaws but it has blessings and it looks very viable, it looks valuable. I think it is approximating or approaching its purpose. It is changing lives. I would not want to see it stopped. I hope it could be carried on , if not in this form , then in some form. I think it is essential to the African and I think it is essential to the Canadian from the

> point of view of getting them to become better Christians as a result. There is nothing like giving away a part of your life to enrich your life. I tell colleagues that it is the most exciting piece of theological education I have been part of in my whole life. I tell them that the students in Kenya couldn't graduate until they had convinced the Bishop and myself or the appropriate person that they had actually released other people for ministry not just become competent themselves. I tell my colleagues that I wish we could do that here. I wish we could take people who come to my college and say you won't graduate until this thing has been incorporated in your life. You can't graduate on the basis of regurgitating knowledge and information. I tell people that it was really fun and I learned a tremendous amount by doing it.
>
> I certainly feel that I have a different understanding of the cultures I've interacted with than before I went and every visit has created a deeper understanding than before. I think I go back to my courses enriched by African Kenyan illustrations which I use continually in my teaching in the North American setting. I have a new appreciation of how you can do church without all the fancy props we use in the west. That has created a conviction in me that has transferred into my teaching that we do not need to use all the subsidies, and grants and props that we think we do in order to do church planting or church renewal. And I think I've got some friends in Africa, in Kenya that have been made. And I use it all the time in dealing with my African students.

MY VOICE

There is room for the individual in education and development. The "system, the structures, the elites, the powerful, the North" do not have to control legitimacy, hegemony and reproduction. The NGO's, the grassroots movements and individuals can make a difference. If we are able to begin to share relationships with a small sphere of people perhaps those who are oppressed, marginalized, and treated unjustly will be enabled to find their potential.

Nzyoka (which means the one who replaces them):

> I have to admit that I wanted some of our Canadian professors to have the experience of something far bigger than their world at a Canadian theological college. I felt that the graduates from our seminaries were afraid to leave their offices and go out where the people live. There was a sense of isolation and fear evident as I travelled across Canada visiting churches. The clergy acted as if the presence of a building should be enough to draw the people. Perhaps that attitude had come from the seminary, an isolated academic experience removed from the lives of people in need. By getting a few professors to Kenya maybe we could light a spark which would eventually change the whole life of the Canadian seminary.
>
> I have seen the effect on the individual professors and I have seen the results in the lives of the Kenyans. I know there are a number of the Africa Brotherhood Church graduates and African Christian Church and Schools students who would never have been included in any other formal education process at this level. These Kenyans have applied what they learned to their life situation before the teachers had left the classroom for Canada. There are changes in the lives of people in the North and people in the South because of the CMIN project. I believe the changes to the Canadian seminary will eventually be dramatic. The next phase will bring some of the CMIN graduates from Kenya to Canada to teach Canadian students, then the transfer of knowledge will be demonstrated to be complete.
>
> I know the most significant aspect of the success of this process has been the willingness of individuals to work together. It is not an easy task to pass through a new culture and contextualize programs and course material. Nor is it easy to sit in a classroom where people from Canada visually remind the Kenyans of colonial days. Mistakes are made by everyone, but when there is maturity and trust there is the potential for a successful resolution of conflict. I endorse what Mendez (1993) said about the challenge of development, "Being 'people friendly' is, in the final analysis, the true meaning of human development"(p. 87). I know the CMIN worked because the people on both continents believed in the project. The partners believed in each other, were open, trusting and friendly. The teachers and

> the students constantly exchanged roles as both were empowered.

THE LAST WORD

A project like the CMIN is only successful because the people who are involved have a willingness to work and care for the other participants. Individual people made the project work. The institutions gave their support but it was individuals who expedited planning, processes and conflict resolution. It was because of the efforts of individual people with a vision for something beyond the established, beyond the status quo. It was effective because these individuals, while getting the agreement of the institutions, were willing to make experimentation, reflection and change part of the process of education. Other projects and future projects of this nature need to maintain the collaborative effort which ensures all parties understand the goals, the process and the adjustments that need to be made. Corrections in direction should be made as the need arises. Classroom critical pedagogy presents the teacher-learner and the learner-teacher with the possibility for life changing dialogue and experience.

> OK, with me as I earlier said, I have been in the leadership machinery and you know the African set up; once you are given a position you might even protect that position so that nobody could come in. I have been changed. My elders, the women in ministry and I have been like Moses who has been making people line up the whole day because, I know, because I have been the counsellor. I have been the only one talking. I am the only person who knows it. To delegate the power I feel very much relieved and I can do other things in the church while other people are doing something else. I have been going around with my handbag thinking I am the only one who can help these

> people to come to the Lord. To see some women both old and young sitting down and reading a Bible study for themselves I feel much encouraged.(KS5 3-8)

The participants or teachers from the West, must be concerned about the contextualization of their course content and be willing to respond as learners to the experience of the local participants. Knowledge transfer should be a reciprocal process. It should be mutually empowering and not build dependency. The small group of Kenyan participants in the CMIN have begun their own process of contextualization and through their influence in local church and community settings they are able to impact the larger Kenyan development needs. Kenya has needs which have a greater potential for being addressed because a few CMIN participants are familiar with their own context.

Would I attempt to tackle another development project like the CMIN? Yes, with vigour and with an increase in collaboration and continuous reflective interaction. Research is needed to determine if participants in development projects enter with fixed and unchanging development paradigms, or is there a process for making a paradigm shift? Where does cooperation and collaboration intersect in development work? What sensitizes an individual to the need for contextualization?

In Kenya with a CMIN like project there is still much more for Canadians to learn and to share.

> Nzyoka: Is there anything you want to add to our conversation?
>
> KG6: Yes, what I would like to ask (say) is that we entered into studies, we were taught and we went to apply the teaching. But those others with whom we work are more numerous than those of us who were in the CMIN. If you look at our sub headquarters you see that there are more without the teaching than with. What I want to request of

the CMIN (is) to return to do another project to bring into the CMIN those who have not yet had the chance in order that we would be many in numbers, those who could do the work. We need to pull together to do this work. We need something like two more classes to take this teaching. If there were say 20 - 60 people with the CMIN then there would not be a problem carrying the work.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abbott, M. (1966). The Documents of Vatican II. New York: Guild Press.

ABC,(Africa Brotherhood Church). (1984). Mafundisho Ya Viongozi Wa Kanisa. Machakos, Kenya: ABC.

ABC,(Africa Brotherhood Church). (1985). Africa Brotherhood Church: Miaka Arobaini Ya Kazi. Machakos: ABC.

Abubakar, A. (1989). Africa and the Challenge of Development. New York: Praeger.

Achebe, C., Hyden, G., Magadza, C., & Okeyo, A.P. (1990). Beyond Hunger in Africa. Nairobi: Heinemann Kenya.

Adams, R. S., & Chen, D. (1981). The Process of Educational Innovation. Paris:IIEP UNESCO.

Ajeyalemi, D. (Ed.).(1990). Science and Technology Education in Africa: Focus on Seven Sub-Saharan Countries. Lagos: University of Lagos Press.

Allahar, A. L. (1989). Sociology and the Periphery:Theories and Issues. Toronto: Garamond Press.

Almond, G. A., & Coleman, James S. (Eds.).(1960). The Politics of Developing Areas. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Altbach, P. G. (1975). Literary Colonialism: Books in the Third World. Harvard Educational Review, 45 (May 1975).

Altbach, P.G. (1991). Impact and adjustment: Foreign students in comparative perspective. Higher Education, 21.

Amin, S. (1974). Accumulation on a World Scale: Vol.2. (B. Pearce, Trans.). New York: Monthly Review Press.

Anderson, J. E. (1973). Organization and Financing of Self-help Education in Kenya. Paris: UNESCO.

Anderson, R. S. (1993). Ministry on the Fire Line : A practical Theory for an Empowered Church. Downers Grove, Ill.: Intervarsity Press.

Apple, M. W. (1979). Ideology and Curriculum. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Apple, M. W. (Ed.).(1982). Cultural and Economic Reproduction in Education. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Arnold, G. (1979). Aid in Africa. London: Kogan Page.

Arnold, S. H. (1982). Implementing Development Assistance: European approaches to Basic Needs. Boulder: Westview.

Arnold, S. H., & Nitecki, A.(Eds.).(1990). Culture and Development in Africa. Trenton, NJ:Africa World Press.

Arnove, R. F. (1980). Comparative education and world systems analysis. Comparative Education Review, 24,48-62.

Arnove, R. F.(Ed.).(1982).Philanthropy and Cultural Imperialism The Foundations at Home and Abroad. Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press.

Arnove, R. F., Altbach, P.G., & Kelly, G.P. (Eds.).(1992). Emergent Issues in Education: Comparative Perspectives. New York: State University of New York Press.

Ayisi, E. O. (1992). An Introduction to the Study of African Culture, Second Edition. Nairobi: East African Educational Publications

Bacchus, M. K. (1991). Education in the third world: Present realities and future prospects. In R.Burns & A.Welch (Eds.), Contemporary Perspectives in Comparative Education. New York: Garland.

Baran, P. (1957). The Political Economy Of Growth. New York: Monthly review.

Barman, J., Hebert, Y., & McCaskill, D. (Eds.).(1986). Indian Education in Canada, Volume 1: The Legacy. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press.

Barman, J., Hebert, Y., & McCaskill, D. (Eds.).(1987). Indian Education in Canada, Volume 2: The Challenge Vancouver:University of British Columbia Press.

Belenky, M., Clinchy, B., Goldberger, N., Tarule, J. (1986). Women's Ways of Knowing. New York: Basic Books.

Bell, D. E. (1978). Report of the external Advisory Panel on Education to the World Bank. (Oct.31,1978).

Berman, E. H. (Ed.).(1975). African Reactions to Missionary Education. New York: Teachers College Press.

Berman, E. H. (1979). Foundations, U.S. foreign policy and

African education. Harvard Educational Review, 49(2).

Best, J. W., & Kahn, J. V. (1989). Research in Education (6th ed.). New Delhi: Prentice Hall.

Bishop, G. (1986). Innovation in Education. London: Macmillan.

Bogdan, R. C., & Biklen, S. K. (1992). Qualitative Research for Education (2nd ed.). Boston: Allyn & Bacon.

Bray, M, Clarke, P. B., & Stephens, D. (1986). Education and Society in Africa. London: Edward Arnold.

Brewer, A. (1990). Marxist Theories of Imperialism. New York: Routledge.

Briskin, L. (1990). Feminist pedagogy: Teaching and learning liberation. Feminist Perspectives, No.19. Ottawa: Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women.

Brownstein, L. (1972). Education and Development in Rural Kenya. New York: Praeger.

Bruner, J. (1990). Acts of Meaning. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.

BUWC. (1980). What Baptists believe. Calgary: Baptist Union of Western Canada.

Cassen, R. (Ed.).(1986). Does Aid Work?. Oxford: Carendon.

Castle, E. B. (1966). Growing up in East Africa. London: Oxford University Press.

Carnoy, M. (1974). Education as Cultural Imperialism. New York: David McKay.

Carnoy, M. (1982) Education, economy and the state. In M.W. Apple (Ed.). Cultural and Economic Reproduction In Education. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Carnoy, M., & Levin, H. M. (1985). Schooling and Work in the Democratic State. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Carnoy, M., & Samoff, J. (1990). Education and Social Transition in the Third World. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Chatman, S. B. (1990). Coming to terms: the rhetoric of narrative in fiction and film. Ithica N.Y.: Cornell University Press.

Clandinin, D. J. (1993). Narrative and story in teacher education.In D.J.Clandinin (Ed.),Learning to Teach, Teaching to Learn: Stories of collaboration in teacher education. New York: Teachers College Press.

Clandinin, D. J., & Connelly, F. M. (1985). Personal practical knowledge and ways of knowing: Relevance for teaching and learning. In E.Eisner (Ed.), Learning and Teaching: The Ways of Knowing. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Clark, J. (1991). Democritizing Development: The role of Voluntary Organizations. London: Earthscan Publishing.

Coleman, J. S., & Court, D. (1993). University Development in the Third World:The Rockerfeller Foundation Experience. New York: Pergamon Press.

Collins, R., & Makowsky, M. (1989). The Discovery of Society 4th edition. New York: McGraw Hill.

Connelly, F. M., & Clandinin, D. J. (1988). Teachers as Curriculum Planners: Narratives of Experience. Toronto: OISE Press.

Connelly, F. M., & Clandinin, D. J. (1990). Stories of experience and narrative inquiry. Educational Researcher, 19(5), 2-14.

Conyers, D., & Hills, P. (1984). An Introduction to Development Planning in the Third World. New York: John Wiley and Sons.

Coombs, P. H. (1985). The World Crisis in Education: The View from the Eighties. New York: Oxford University Press.

Coombs, P., & Ahmed, M. (1975). Education for Rural Development. New York: Praeger.

Coughlin, P., Ikiara, G.K. (Eds.).(1991). Kenya's Industrialization Dilemma. Nairobi: Heinemann.

Dilley, M. R. (1966). British Policy in Kenya Colony (2nd ed.). New York: Barnes & Noble.

Dinesen, I. (1937). Out Of Africa. Middlesex: Penguin Books.

Dore, R. (1976). The Diploma Disease. London: George Allen & Unwin.

D'Souza, H. (1987). Kenyan Education in its African Context:

Volume 2. New York: Vantage Press.

Eisenstadt, S. N. (1974). Studies of modernization and sociological theory. History and Theory: Studies in Philosphy of History, 8(3),225-252.

Evans, R. A. (1990). Education for emancipation: Movement toward transformation. In A.F. Evans, R.A. Evans & W.B. Kennedy (Eds.), Pedagogies for the Non-Poor. Maryknoll: Orbis Books.

Ezewu, E. (1983). Sociology of Education. Lagos: Longman.

Fabella, V., & Torres, S. (Eds.). (1983). Irruption of the Third World: Challenge to Theology. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books.

Fafunwa, P. B.,& Aisiku, J. U.(Eds.).(1982). Education in Africa: A Comparative Survey. London: George Allen & Unwin.

Fanon, F. (1967). Black Skins, White Masks. New York:Grove.

Ferm, D. W. (1986). Third World Liberation Theologies. New York: Orbis Books.

Foster, P. (1985). Africa. In Burton R. Clark (Ed.). The School and the University. Berkely: University of California Press.

Foster-Carter, A. (1976). From Rostow to Gundar Frank: Conflicting paradigms in the analysis of Underdevelopment. World Development, 4(3),167-180.

Foucault, M. (1983). Afterword: The subject and power. In H.L. Dreyfus & P. Robinow Michel Foucault: Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Foucault, M. (1984). What is Enlightenment. In P. Rabinow Foucault Reader. New York: Pantheon.

Frank, A. G. (1967). Capitalism and Underdevelopment in Latin America. New York: Monthly Review Press.

Freire, P. (1972). Pedagogy of the Oppressed. (Trans. by Myrna Bergman). New York: Ramos.

Fry, G. W., & Thurber, C. E. (1990). The International Education of the Development Consultant. Oxford: Pergamon Press.

Gakunga, M. N. (1980). A survey of the causes of reading

Inabilities among Primary school Children in Nairobi Area. Nairobi:Curriculum Development & Evaluation.

Galli, R. E. (Ed.).(1992). Rethinking the Third World: Contributions Towards a New Conceptualization. New York: Crane Russak.

George, S. (1976). How the Other Half Dies: The real reason for World Hunger. New York: Penguin Books.

George, S. (1988). A Fate Worse Than Debt. New York: Penguin Books.

Ghai, D. P. (1982). Economic Independence in Africa. Nairobi: Kenya Literature Bureau.

Giroux, H., Penna, A.,& Pinar, W. (Eds.).(1981). Curriculum and Instruction. Berkley: McCutchan.

Giroux, H. A. (1988). Postmodernism and the discourse of educational criticism. Journal of Education, 170(3), 1988.

Giroux, H. A. (1991). Border pedagogy and the politics of postmodernism. Education and Society, 9(1).

Girvan, N. (1979). The approach to technology policy studies. Social and Economic Studies, 28(1).

Gore, J. (1992). What we can do for you! What can we do for you: Struggling over empowerment in critical and feminist pedagogy. In C. Luke & J. Gore (Eds.). Feminisms and Critical Pedagogy. New York: Routledge.

Gorman, R. F. (Ed.).(1984). Private Voluntary Organizations as Agents of Development. Boulder: Westview Press.

Gould, W. T. S. (1991). Mission and migration in colonial Kenya. In C. Dixon & M. Hefferman, Colonialism and Development in the Contemporary World. London: Mansell.

Goulet, D. (1971). The Cruel Choice: A new concept in the Theory of Development. New York: Atheneum.

Gran, G. (1986). Beyond African famines: Whose knowledge matters? Alternatives, 275-296.

Grundy, S. (1987). Curriculum: Product or Praxis. Philidelphia: Falmer

Gutierrez, G. (1983). The Power of the Poor in History.

New York: Orbis Books.

Habermas, J. (1971). Knowledge and Human Interests. Boston: Beacon Press.

Habermas, J. (1987). The Theory of Communicative Action: Vol. 2 Lifeworld and System: A critique of Fundamentalist Reason. Boston: Beacon Press.

Haggard, S. (1990). Pathways from the Periphery. Ithaca; Cornell University.

Haight, R. (1985). An Alternate Vision: An interpretation of Liberation Theology. New York: Paulist Press.

Hamilton, E. (1992). Adult Education for Community Development. New York: Greenwood Press.

Hansen, E. (Ed.).(1987). Africa: Perspectives on Peace and Development. London: Zed Books.

Harbison, F., & Myers, C.A. (1964). Education, Manpower, and Economic Growth: Strategies of Human Resource Development. New York: McGraw-Hill.

Harden, B. (1990). Africa: Dispatches from a Fragile Continent. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.

Harrison, P. (1980). Inside the Third World: The Anatomy of Poverty. Sussex: Harvester Press.

Havelock, R. G. , & Huberman, A. M. (1977). Solving Educational Problems. Paris: UNESCO.

Hettne, B. (1990). Development Theory and the Three Worlds. Hong Kong: Longman Group.

Hiebert, P. G. (1983). Cultural Anthropology (2nd ed.). Grand Rapids: Baker Book House.

Hiebert, P. G. (1987). Critical Contextualization. International Bulletin of Missionary Research, 11, No.3.

Hogarth, J., Gatimu, K., & Barrett, D. (1983). Theological Education in Context. Nairobi: Afropress.

Hoogvelt, A. M. M. (1978). The Sociology of Developing Societies (2nd ed.). London: Macmillan.

Hoogvelt, A. M. M. (1982). The Third World in Global Development. London: Macmillan.

Hoole, F. W. (1978). Evaluation Research and Development Activities. London: Sage.

Huberman, A. M. (1973). Understanding Change in Education: an Introduction. Paris: UNESCO:IBE.

Huberman, A. M., & Miles, M. B. (1984). Innovation Up Close: How School Improvement Works. New York: Plenum Press.

Iliffe, J. (1983). The Emergence of African Capitalism. London: Macmillan.

Ishumi, A. G. M. (1976). Education and Development. Nairobi: East African Literature Bureau.

Jenkins, O. B. (1984). Missions: A Modern Definition. Nairobi: Communication Press.

Jennings, A. (Ed.). (1984). Our Response to the POOREST of the Third World. Oxford: Pergamon Press.

Jones, R. K. (1984). Sociology of Adult Education. Brookfield, Vt: Gower.

Jones, W. H. (1980). What Canadian Baptists Believe. Niagra Falls: JBTS Publishing House.

Kalilombe, P. A. (1985). Doing theology at the grassroots level: A challenge for professional theologians. African Ecclesial Review, 27.

Kato, B. H. (1985). Biblical christianity in Africa. Achimota, Ghana: African Christian Press.

Kayongo-Male, D., Onyango, P. (1984). The Sociology of the African Family. New York: Longman group.

Kieti, M. & Coughlin, P. (1990). Barking You'll Be Eaten!: The Wisdom of Kamba Oral Literature. Nairobi: Phoenix.

Kinsler, F. R. (1983). Ministry by the People: Theological Education by Extension. New York: Orbis Books.

Kitching, G. (1980). Class and Economic Change in Kenya. New Haven: Yale University Press.

Kohli, W. (1991). Postmodernism, critical theory and the "New" pedagogies: What's at stake in the discourse?. Education and Society, 9(1).

Korten, D. C. (1990). Getting to the 21st century: Voluntary Action and the Global Agenda. West Hartland: Kumarian.

Knowles, M. (1970). The modern practice of adult education: From Pedagogy to Androgogy. New York: Association Press.

Knowles, M. (1984). The adult learner: a neglected species (3rd ed.). Houston: Gulf.

Lakoff, G., & Johnson, M. (1980). Metaphors We Live By. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Lane, D. A. (1984). Foundations for a Social Theology: Praxis Process and Salvation. New York: Paulist Press.

Larrain, J. (1989). Theories of Development. London: Polity Press.

Lather, P. (1992). Post-critical pedagogies. In C. Luke & J. Gore (Eds.), Feminisms and Critical Pedagogy. New York: Routledge.

Lewis, L. J. (Ed.). (1962). Phelps-Stokes Report on Education In Africa: Abridged with Introduction. London: Oxford University Press.

Leys, C. (1975). Underdevelopment in Kenya: The Political Economy of Neo-Colonialism 1964-1971. Nairobi:Heinemann.

Leys, C. (1980). Samuel Huntington and the end of classical modernization theory. In H. Alavi, & T. Shanin.(Eds.), Introduction to the Sociology of Developing Societies. New York: Monthly Review.

Lyotard, J. (1984). The Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Macgoye, M. O. (1986). The Story of Kenya: A Nation in the Making. Nairobi: Oxford University Press.

Maduro, O. (1987). Notes for a North-South Dialogue in Mission from a Latin American Perspective. Missiology, 15, No.2.

Marshall, J. D. (1989). Foucault and Education. Australian Journal of Education, Vol. 33, No. 2.

Masemann, V. L. (1990). Ways of knowing: Implications for comparative education. Comparative Education Review, 34(4).

Mazrui, A. A. (1968). From social Darwinism to current theories of modernization. World Politics, 21,69-83.

Mazrui, A. A. (1975). The African university as a multinational corporation: Problems of penetration and dependency. Harvard Educational Review,45. May 1975.

Mbiti, D. M. (1981). An Introduction to Education: Its meaning and significance for society. Nairobi: Oxford University.

Mbiti, J. S. (1975). Introduction to African Religion. Nairobi: Heinemann.

McLaren, P. (1988). Schooling the postmodern body: Critical pedagogy and the politics of enfleshment, Journal of Education, 170(3), 1988.

McLaren, P. (1989). Life in schools: an introduction to critical pedagogy in the foundations of education. Toronto: Irwin.

McLaren, P. (Ed.).(1991). Postmodernism,post-colonialism and pedegogy, Part 1 & Part II. Special Issues of Education and Scociety, 9(1) and 9(2).

McLaughlin, D. (1989). The Sociolinguistics of Navajo Literacy. Anthropology & Education Quarterly, 20, 1989.

McKinney, L. (1984). Contextualizing instruction: Contributions to missiology from the field of education. Missiology: an International Review, 12(3),1988.

Mendez, R. P. (1993). The World Bank: Market- or People-Friendly. In A.D.Tillett (Ed.), The Challenge of The Challenge of Development. Halifax: Dalhousie University Press.

Mezirow, J. (1991). A transformative theory of adult learning. Adult Education Research Colloquim.

Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A.M. (1984). Qualitative Data Analysis: A sourcebook of new methods. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Moock, J. L. (1984). Overseas Training and National Development Objectives in Sub-Saharan Africa. Comparative Education Review, 28(2),221-240.

Moorhouse, G. (1964). In A. A. Mazrui & M. Tidy (1984). Nationalism and New States in Africa. London: Macmillan.

Montero-Sieburth, M. (1992). Models and practice of curriculum change in developing countries. Comparative

Education Review, 36(2).

Moreau, S. A. (1990). The World of the Spirits. Nairobi: Evangel Publshing House.

Mukwilu, M. (1988). The How of development: Notes from an African Development Specialist. The Enterprise, 322.

Mutua, R. W. (1975). Development of Education in Kenya. Nairobi: East African Literature Bureau.

Mwiria, K. (1990). Kenya's harambee secondary school movement:Its meaning and significance to society. Comparative Education Review, 34(3).

Myers, R. G. (1992). The Twelve Who Survive. London: Routledge.

Ndegwa, P. (1985). Africa's Development Crisis. Nairobi: Heinemann.

Netland, H. (1987). Exclusivism, tolerance, and truth. Missiology:an International Review, 15(2), April 1987.

Nida, E. A., & Reyburn, W.D. (1981). Meaning Across Cultures. MaryKnoll, NY: Orbis.

Nyerere, J. K. (1968). Freedom and Socialism. Dar es Salaam: Oxford University Press.

Ominde, S. H. (1964). Kenya Education Commission Report. Nairobi: Government of Kenya.

Opoku, K. A. (1988). The church in Africa and contemporary sociological challenges. The Ecumenical Review,40(2).

Otiende, J. E.,Wamahui, S.P., & Karugu, A.M. (1992). Education and Development In Kenya: A Historical Perspective. Nairobi: Oxford University Press.

Padilla, C. R. (1987). A new ecclesiology in Latin America. International Bulletin of Missionary Research, 11(4).

Patton, M. Q. (1980). Qualitative Evaluation Methods. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Penwill, D. J. (1951). Kamba Customary Law. Nairobi: Kenya Literature Bureau.

Perinbam, L. (1983). North and South: Toward a new

Interdependence of Nations. Halifax: Centre for Development Projects.

Peshkin, A. (1993). The goodness of qualitative research. Educational Researcher, March 1993, 23-29.

Philip, H. R. A. (1936). A New Day in Kenya. London: World Dominion Press.

Ritzer, G. (1992). Contemporary Sociological Theory. Third Edition. New York: McGraw-Hill,Inc.

Rodney, W. (1972). How Europe Underdeveloped Africa. Nairobi: Heinemann Kenya.

Rostow, W. W. (1960). The Stages of Economic Growth: A Non-communist Manifesto. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Roxburgh, A. J. (1993). Reaching a New Generation: Strategies for Tomorrow's Church. Downers Grove, Ill.:Intervarsity.

Rust, V. D. (1991). Postmodernism and its comparative education implications. Comparative Education Review, 35(4).

Sandbrook, R. (1985). The Politics of Africa's Economic Stagnation. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Sano, R. I. (1990). Theological faculties as mentors of ministers for the church. Theological Education, 7(2),11-34.

Scanlon, D. G. (1966). Traditions of African Education. New York: Teachers College Press.

Schon, D. A. (1983). The Reflective Practitioner. New York: Basic Books.

Scott, S. M., Chovanec, D. M.,& Young, B. (1993). Philosophy-in-action in university teaching. Adult Education Research Conference Proceedings. University Park: Penn State University.

Sharing Way. (1992). Strategy and Guidelines Paper for Canadian Baptist Relief and Development Committee. Mississauga: CBIM-CBF

Shor, I., & Freire, P. (1987). What is the "dialogical method" of teaching? Journal of Education, 169(3), 11-31.

Shor, I., & Freire, P. (1987b). A Pedagogy for Liberation:

Dialogues on Transforming Education. Massachusetts: Bergin & Garvey.

Sifuna, D. N. (1990). Development of Education in Africa the Kenyan Experience. Nairobi:Initiatives.

Sklair, L. (1991). Sociology of the Global System. Baltimore; John Hopkins University Press.

Sleeter, C. E. (1991). Empowerment through Multicultural Education. New York: State of New York University Press.

Spradley, J. P. (1979). The Ethnographic Interview. New York: Holt, Rhinehart & Winston.

Stabler, E. (1969). Education Since Uhuru: The Schools of Kenya. Middletown: Wesleyan University Press.

Stackhouse, M. L. (1986). Contextualization and theological education. Theological education 23, No.1.

Stackhouse, M. L. (1988). Apologia: Contextualization, Globalization and Mission. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans.

Stelck, B. F. (1989). Mission with both hands. The Enterprise, 322, Winter 1988-1989. Mississauga.

Stevens, R. P., & Stelck, B.F. (1993). Equipping equippers cross-culturally: An experiment in the appropriate globalization of theological education. Missiology: An International Review, XXI(1), January 1993.

Stewart,F. (Ed.).(1987). Macro-Policies for Appropriate Technology in Developing Countries. London: Westview Press.

Swainson, N. (1980). The Development of Corporate Capitalism In Kenya: 1918-1977. Nairobi; Heinemann.

Temu, A. J. (1972). British Protestant Missions. London: Longman Group.

Thiongo, N. (1986). Decolonising the Mind: The politics of Language in African Literature. Nairobi: Heinemann.

Thompson, A. R. (1981). Education And Development In Africa. HongKong: Macmillan.

Toh, S. H. (1980). The Overseas Development Council: an elite policy-planning group on U.S.-Third World relations, its power-structure and international development-education ideology. Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Alberta.

Toh, S. H., & Farrelly, T. (1991). The formation of third world technocrats for rural development: A critical perspective on Australia's role in study abroad. In R.Burns & A.Welch (Eds.), Contemporary Perspectives in Comparative Education. New York: Garland.

Torres, C. A. (1991). The Politics of Nonformal Education in Latin America. New York: Praeger.

Torres, S. & Fabella, V. (Eds.). (1978). The Emergent Gospel: Theology from the underside of History. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books.

Tostensen, A. (1991). Between shamba and factory: Industrial labour migration. In P. Coughlin & G.K. Ikiara (Eds.), Kenya's Industrialization Dilemma. Nairobi: Heinemann.

Turaki, Y. (1991). The QUest for Cooperation, Renewal and Relevance in Theological Education. Africa Journal of Evangelical Theology, 10, No.1.

Urch, G. E.F. (1968). The Africanization of the Curriculum In Kenya. Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan.

Vaitsos, C. (1991). The state and foreign-business interests. In P. Coughlin & G.K. Ikiara (Eds.), Kenya's Industrialization Dilemma. Nairobi: Heinemann.

Verhelst, T. C. (1990). No Life without Roots: Culture and Development. (B. Cumming, Trans.). London: Zed Books.

Wallerstein, I. (1974). The Capitalist World Economy: Essays. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Wagner, G. (1992). Internationalization models and the role of the university. International Education Magazine de l'education internationale.

Webster, A. (1984). Introduction to the Sociology of Development. London: MacMillan.

Welch, A. (1991). "Knowledge, Culture, and Power: Educational Knowledge and Legitimation in Comparative Education" in R. Burns & A. Welch (eds.) Contempary Perspectives in Comparative Education. New York: Garland.

Were, G. S. (1983). Leadership and Underdevelopment in Africa. Nairobi: University of Nairobi.

Whyte, W.H. (1979). "On making the most of participant observation", The American Sociologist, 14,56-66.

Zeman, J. K. (Ed.). (1980). Baptists in Canada: Search for Identity amidst Diversity. Burlington Ont.: G.R. Welch.

Appendix A

QUESTIONS

(for interviews)

A. [How do participants of the C.Min describe development/aid?]

How would you describe the C.Min project in terms of what it does for development?

Describe any work you have done in overseas development.

What does the term development mean to you?

How is the C.Min project similar/different from development or aid projects?

Why would you (a Canadian) agree to participate, to do this task?

What did the Kenyans learn from this process?

What did the Canadians learn from this process?

B. [How do participants of the Kenyan-Canadian project describe experiences associated with this continuing education, teacher education process, including orientation, contextualization, implementation, and re-entry? Is the process underpinned by any theory, practice or structures?]

What is the C.Min project in Kenya?

What are you (teacher, administrator, student) doing in the project? Explain your role, task, involvement.

What are you going to accomplish? (by teaching in Kenya, by taking the courses from the Canadians, by linking up with Kenya, by linking up with Canadians)

What do you understand the goals to be? Who determined these goals?

What brought you into involvement in the project?

How do you think this project was put into motion?

Recount for me the events surrounding the planning for the first project. For the second project.

What were the steps you thought were important in the planning?

Who else should have been involved in the planning?

Where were the hurdles, roadblocks, difficulties in the process?
Who is in charge of the C.Min? Who controls each phase?

C. [With reflection back to any original goals, aims and desired changes were these goals realized? To what extent were they met and if not what were the reasons or contributing factors to failure? Is the project worth replicating?]
Think back to the original goals, aims and desired changes. How are/were these goals realized?
What are/were the reasons or contributing factors to the success/failure?
What one item of the project do you think was the most significant?
What specifically would you like to change about the project?
What in the project gave the most difficulties?
If you had the opportunity, finances, logistics what would you add/subtract from the project?

D. [In analyzing the outcomes, were the policies flawed, ill-conceived, or interfered with by other factors such as: language of instruction, finances, false expectations, faulty theory, lack of theory, institutional dynamics...?]
If you were asked by another group about this project, for their purposes, what would you suggest they do differently?
How could you change this to improve it?
What would have been different if the teaching had all been in Swahili or all in English?
What would have been the results if...(things) had been different?

E. [How do we think more carefully about education? How do we think about professional education? How do we think about change, and about change designed for others?]
What does it mean to introduce change into this community (setting) or organization?

What happens in your setting when procedures are done differently?
Who usually brings new ideas?
Whose ideas are developed and expanded in the organization?
What do colleagues inside/outside your organization say about the project? What do you tell them about it?

A.(Subset) [A special attempt will be made to interview several Professors, who are yet to go to Kenya, to hear what they have to say both before, and after their experience.]
What do you anticipate doing in Kenya?
What do you expect to encounter? What problems do you worry about?
Why are you going, what are the motivating factors?
[After return]
What of your expectations were you able/not able to meet?
What was the reason, or why?
What would you tell someone who is yet to go?
Describe your most/least exciting experience with the project.

Appendix B

CMIN PROJECT GOALS

Goals:

1. To prepare future instructors for the Divinity School in order to eventually replace the overseas workers.

2. To prepare leaders capable of administering and teaching in Lay Training Centers throughout the ABC, located in centalized places in each pastorate.

3. To provide further training for pastors and leaders in the ABC who have completed their training at the Divinity School.

4. To provide the opportunity for some of the participants to gain a credential that could be internationally as well as nationally respected (such as the Certificate of Ministry at Carey Theological College). Students gaining this credential and meeting entrance requirements of more advanced programmes may be able to gain an advanced degree with two or three more years of continuous study.

The goals listed here are taken from a five page document under the letterhead of African Brotherhood Church, Headquarters Office, dated 3rd August 1987. The letter, signed by the Bishop of the ABC, was sent to CBIM in Mississauga as a request for assistance entitled "A Proposal for Continuing Education".

Appendix C

CMIN Courses

ABC CMIN (in program order)

Psychology of Pastoral Care and Counselling

The Biblical psychology of pastoral care. Introductory psychology and counselling skills.

Equipping the Laity

Preparing all the people of God to do the work of the church. Releasing the congregation to do the ministry.

History of Christian Mission

An historical look at the growth of the church through mission. Key cultural cross-over points will be observed.

Christian Leadership

Leadership styles and conflict management will be introduced from the Biblical perspective of servant leadership.

Exegesis and Preaching

Introduction of both exegetical and hermeneutical skills. Viewing and interpreting scripture in its variance of literary styles.

New Testament Theology

An overview of Biblical theology from a particularly New Testament perspective.

Urban Mission

Using an observation/reflection model, an introduction to the city, its networks, challenges and the potential for meeting the needs of the city through ministry.

Ministry and Spirituality

Personal growth in Bible reading, prayer, meditation and journal writing. Preparing yourself for ministry to others.

Old Testament Theology

The roots of Biblical theology come from an understanding of the Old Testament.

Individual Project

Each student, through the practical application of course material, develop a project in ministry which will be carried over the life of the program. The report will be a continuous reflection on the project.

Teacher Education

Introduction to classroom management, administration, teaching models and curriculum development.

ACC & S CMIN

Equipping the Laity

Preparing all the people of God to do the work of the church. Releasing the congregation to do the ministry.

Urban Mission I

Using an observation/reflection model, an introduction to the city, its networks, challenges and the potential for meeting the needs of the city through ministry.

Old and New Testament Introduction and Exegesis

Introduction of both exegetical and hermeneutical skills. Viewing and interpreting scripture in its variance of literary styles.

Urban Mission II

The observation/reflection will build on urban mission themes for community involvement, evangelism and ministry.

Christian Theology Overview

Biblical theology will look at key systematic theological themes, giving an overview of christian doctrine.

Christian Leadership

Leadership styles and conflict management will be introduced from the Biblical perspective of servant leadership.

Marriage and the Family

An introduction to pastoral care and counselling with a prime focus on marriage and the family and current issues.

History of Christian Mission

An historical look at the growth of the church through mission. Key points in African mission will be observed.

Individual Project

Each student, through the practical application of course material, develop a project in ministry which will be carried over the life of the program. The written report will be an ongoing reflection on the project.